

**2ND PARLIAMENT OF BHUTAN
8TH SESSION**



Resolution No. 8

**PROCEEDINGS AND RESOLUTION OF
THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF
BHUTAN**

(November 10- December 9, 2016)

Speaker: Jigme Zangpo

Table of Content

1. Programme for the Oath or Affirmation of Office	1
2. Opening Ceremony.....	1
2.1. Opening Address by the Speaker	1
3. Resolution on the First and Second Reading of the Income Tax Act 2001 (Repeal of Certain Provisions) Amendment Bill 2016 (Money bill).....	5
4. Motion on the First and Second Reading of Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill 2016-17(Money Bill).....	6
5. Question Hour:	9
6. Report on the implementation status of resolutions	10
6.1 Resolution on the report presented by the Ministry of Labor & Human Resources on the possibility of increasing maternity leave for female employees in corporations, agencies and non-governmental organizations.....	10
6.2 Resolution on the report by the Ministry of Finance to establish a separate division to manage seized goods	13
6.3 Resolution on the report by the Ministry of Economic Affairs on ‘Fronting’ ..	17

7. Resolution on the First and Second Readings of the Marriage (Amendment) Bill 2016	20
8. Continuation of report on the implementation status of resolutions.....	23
8.1. Resolution on the report by the Human Rights Committee.....	23
8.2. Women, Children & Youth Committee’s report on the implementation status of resolutions.....	26
9. Question Hour: Group B- Questions asked to the Minister for Education, Minister for Agriculture & Forests and Minister for Foreign Affairs	31
10. Continuation of report on the implementation status of resolution	33
10.1. Resolution on the report by the Economic Development & Private Sector Committee.....	33
10.2. Resolution on the report of the Legislative Committee.....	37
11. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Marriage (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2016.....	39
12. Question Hour: Group C- Questions asked to the Minister for Economic Affairs, Minister for Finance and Minister for Labour & Human Resources.....	42
13. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2015 (Private Member’s Bill).....	43

14. Resolution on the First and Second readings of the Information, Communication and Media Bill 2016.....	45
15. Adoption of Convention	47
15.1 Resolution on the ratification of Paris Agreement.....	47
16. Question Hour: Group D- Questions asked to the Minister for Work and Human Settlement and Minister for Health.....	50
17. Resolution on the re-deliberation of the Customs Bill 2015	52
18. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Income Tax (Repeal of Certain Provisions) Bill of Bhutan 2016 (Money Bill)	54
19. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the Financial Year 2016-2017.....	58
20. Resolution on the Re-deliberation of the Civil Aviation Bill 2015	64
21. Question Hour: Group A- Questions asked to the Prime Minister, Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs, and Minister for Information and Communications	65
22. Convention.....	68

22.1 Resolution on the motion to adopt the Agreement on Trade, Commerce and Transit between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of Republic of India.	68
22.2 Resolution on the re-deliberation of the Motor Vehicle Agreement between Bhutan, Bangladesh, India and Nepal for the transportation of Cargo and people.....	71
23. Joint Sitting's resolution on the Financial Audit Report of the Public Accounts Committee.....	75
24. Concluding Ceremony of the Eight Session.....	85
24.1 Motion of Thanks.....	85
24.1.1 Motion by the Prime Minister	85
24.1.2 Motion by the Chairperson of the National Council Dr. Sonam Kinga.....	89
24.1.3. Motion by the Member from Lamgong -Wangchang Constituency Khandu Wangchuk from the Opposition Party.....	91
24.2 Concluding Speech of the Hon'ble Speaker.....	92

Annexure

Annexure 1: Programme for the Oath of Allegiance for Hon’ble Tshering, Member from the North-Thimphu Constituency on 10th November, 2016 corresponding to 11th Day of 10th Month of the Male Fire Monkey Year.....	96
Annexure 2: Address of the Speaker at the Opening Ceremony of the 8th Session of the Second Parliament.....	97
Annexure 3: Third Reading on Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2016.....	107
Annexure 4: Voting results on adoption of Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2016.....	111
Annexure 5: Voting Results on Adoption of Paris Agreement on Environmental Protection and Conservation Including Issues Related to Climate Change, and the International Recognition of Bhutan’s Progressive Policies on Environment.....	113
Annexure 6: Re-deliberation and endorsement of Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015.....	115
Annexure 7: Voting Results on adoption of the Income Tax (Amendment) Bill of the Kingdom Bhutan 2016 (Money Bill).....	118

Annexure 8: Voting Results on adoption of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the Financial Year 2016-2017 (Money Bill).....	120
Annexure 9: Re-deliberation and Adoption of Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015.....	122
Annexure 10: Voting Results on adoption of the Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015.....	128
Annexure 11: Voting Results on adoption of the Trade, Commerce and Transit Agreement between Bhutan and India.....	130
Annexure 12: Royal Kasho granting the Joint Sitting of the Second Parliament.....	132
Annexure 13: Voting Results on adoption of Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee Report.....	133
Annexure 14: Address of the Speaker at the Closing Ceremony of the Eighth Session of the Second Parliament of Bhutan.....	136
Annexure 15: List of Members present during the Eighth Session of the Second Parliament.....	147

Resolution and Proceedings of the Eight Session of the Second Parliament

1. Programme for the Oath or Affirmation of Office

The oath taking ceremony for member-elect Tshering, from North Thimphu constituency, who was elected in the bye-election, was administered by the Chief Justice of Bhutan. The ceremony was held inside the National Assembly hall prior to the commencement of the Eighth Session of the Second Parliament. The newly elected Member took the oath as per the provisions of the Constitution of Bhutan in presence of all Members of the National Assembly. The Member also received the holy water of allegiance poured in from the vase by the *Yonten Lopon of Zhung Dratsang* during the ceremony. *The programme is provided in the Annexure 1*

2. Opening Ceremony

The Eighth Session of the Second Parliament commenced on the auspicious 11th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 10th November 2016. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo was received by the Members of Parliament in an elaborate Serdrang and Chipdrel ceremony which was followed by Zhugdrel Phuensum Tshogpai tendrel ceremony.

2.1. Opening Address by the Speaker

On behalf of the Members of Parliament and on his own behalf, the Speaker expressed his gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck for gracing the opening ceremony. He expressed that opening ceremony graced by His Majesty coincided with the tenth anniversary of His Majesty's reign on the golden throne.

The Speaker also extended his welcome to the Members of the Royal Family, representatives of the Central Monastic Body, members of the international community, senior government officials and all other guests who came to witness the inaugural session.

On behalf of the parliament, the Speaker further expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for granting land and citizenship *kidu* to Bhutanese people in various Dzongkhags in a bid to achieve self reliance. He also expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for granting Kidu to the victims of flood in Sarpang Dzongkhag and fire disaster in Mongar town.

The Speaker also mentioned that despite the cold winter weather, His Majesty visited Lunana crossing over 5,250-meter Ganglakarchung for the sake of our people and the Royal Government. During the visit, His Majesty not only met the local people in the highlands but also inspected the vulnerable glacial lakes to take stock of the situation. His Majesty then crossed over 5,350-meter Rinchenzoe and met the people of Sephu commemorating the 10th anniversary of His Majesty's benevolent reign. The Speaker expressed his gratitude on behalf of the parliament for such royal initiatives.

On 13th of October 2016, His Majesty Bhumibol Adulyadej, the King of Thailand passed away and the following day of 14th October was declared as a national day of mourning by His Majesty the King. Led by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, the Members of the Royal Family, senior government officials and Thai community in Bhutan offered a 1000 butter lamps and prayers in the Kuenrey of Tashichhodzong. Besides, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo along with Her Majesty the Gyaltseen and His Royal Highness the Gyalsey visited Bangkok, Thailand to pay tribute to the

late King. The Speaker expressed that the royal visit would further strengthen the friendly relations between Bhutan and Thailand and expressed parliament's deepest gratitude to His Majesty.

The Speaker informed that various religious establishments under the leadership of His Holiness the Je Khenpo have unfailingly performed numerous spiritual activities for the benefit of the country and the people. In addition, His Holiness has instituted world peace prayers in 18 Dzongkhags and performed *Moenlam Chhenmo* in Kuneselphodrang before the statue of Buddha *Dordenma* for the benefit for the people of Thimphu. Towards this, the Speaker expressed the parliament's gratitude to His Holiness, *Dratshangs*, other religious establishments and *Menjong ChothuenTshogpa*.

He further informed that His Royal Highness Gyaltshab Dasho Jigme Dorji Wangchuck granted Kidu and support to the victims of fire disaster in Mongar town. Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen graced the opening of Civil Society Fair 2016 and Her Majesty the Royal Grand Mother Ashi Kesang Choeden Wangchuck rebuilt *Tashi Gomangs*. He expressed parliament's gratitude for these noble initiatives. Similarly, the Speaker also expressed gratitude to Her Majesty the Queen Mother Ashi Dorji Wangmo Wangchuck for being honoured with Pope Francis Charity and Leadership Award at a ceremony in New York, USA.

Prime Minister Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay provided government's support to the victims of disasters in Dzongkhags. He had also participated in regional meetings in Bangkok, Thailand, Australia and the Indian state of Goa with positive outcomes. Thus, the Speaker expressed parliament's appreciation to the Prime Minister.

The Speaker expressed his appreciation to all the people involved in conduct of successful second local government elections and the bye-election for North Thimphu constituency. He also congratulated the elected leaders and expressed hopes that they would serve the government and the people with dedication.

The Royal Civil Service Commission was commended for appointing seven new Secretaries to the Government and the new Director of the National Assembly. He expressed his hopes that these appointed officials would serve the Royal Government and the people with utmost loyalty.

On 21st of September 2016, the Royal Monetary Authority launched the foreign currency account facility for non-resident Bhutanese. In addition, the bank interest rates have been reduced and Indian currency reserve has been increased. The Royal Monetary Authority had also handed over a sum of Nu. 874 million as net surplus fund to the government which would greatly benefit the people and the country. The Speaker, therefore, expressed his appreciation to all the financial institutions and the Ministry of Finance.

The Speaker reported that he had led delegations to Pakistan, Vietnam, Cambodia and Geneva in Switzerland for parliamentary exchange programmes and held fruitful meetings with speakers of various countries.

It was reported that the joint sitting of parliament will deliberate on the annual audit report while the National Assembly will deliberate on the Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill, two international conventions and reports by some of the committees. In addition, the Speaker expressed

that to ensure check and balance to the government, question hour sessions and motions will be on agenda as before.

The Speaker informed that Legislative Drafting Manual 2016 has been introduced to harmonize drafting of laws and trainings conducted on public hearing which would reinforce the confidence and experience in carrying out committee works. He also informed that the National Assembly Secretariat had published an Annual Report for the year 2015-2016.

In conclusion, the Speaker expressed hopes that the Eight session would be successful with the blessings of Dratshang and other religious bodies, noble guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, collective merit of the Bhutanese people and the support of the Members of Parliament.

The address of the Speaker is provided in Annexure 2.

3. Resolution on the First and Second Reading of the Income Tax Act 2001 (Repeal of Certain Provisions) Amendment Bill 2016 (Money bill)

The Minister for Finance, who was the Member In-charge of the Bill moved the motion to introduce the Money Bill 2016 titled “Income Tax Act 2001 (Repeal of Certain Provisions)”. Following the motion, the Member from Chumey-Ura constituency submitted that the government’s proposal to revise the income tax would benefit the country’s currency reserve and in providing financial services. He also expressed that it would benefit the civil servants and the people at large with social and financial security. The House subsequently endorsed the motion with a show of hands.

Therefore, the Member In-charge of the Bill presented the background details of the Money Bill 2016 titled “Income Tax Act 2001 (Repeal of Certain Provisions)” during the Second reading. He submitted that the main objective of the Income Tax Amendment Bill was to discontinue levy of taxes on interests accrued on fixed deposits which would in turn promote savings and enhance financial services. The amendment would also encourage the Bhutanese living overseas to save their money in the country thereby strengthening the financial services in the country. Thus, the House was urged to support the Bill.

Subsequently, the House endorsed that the Third reading of the Money Bill 2016 titled “Income Tax Act 2001 (Repeal of Certain Provisions)” to be deliberated on 28th November 2016. The House to this effect referred the Bill to the Finance committee to review the Bill and present a report thereof. **15th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 14th November 2016**

4. Motion on the First and Second Reading of Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill 2016-17 (Money Bill)

The Minister for Finance who was also the Member In-Charge of the Bill moved the motion to introduce the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill 2016-17 for deliberations. The House subsequently endorsed the motion with a show of hands.

Following this, the Member In-Charge of the Bill presented the background details of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill 2016-17 during the Second reading. He said that during the summer session budget discussion, the House had endorsed a total budget of Nu.54.828 billion for the financial year 2016-17. Of this, a total budget of Nu.617.743 million including current budget of Nu. 253.094

million and capital budget of Nu.364.251 million was allocated to the Ministry of Labor & Human Resources to address youth unemployment problems. However, the earlier approved budget was found inadequate to implement various programmes designed to address unemployment problem. Thus, the supplementary budget amounting to Nu.262.808 million, which was generated from interest received from the financial institutions on account of the subordinated debt instruments under the Economic Stimulus Plan, is proposed. Submission was accordingly made to the House to endorse the proposed supplementary budget.

To this, the opposition party submitted that relevant ministries should present justifications for what the supplementary budget was going to be used for. Related documents regarding the supplementary budget were also found not explicit which would stand out as a challenge while conducting parliamentary review. Submission was thus made that the budget, which is drawn from public fund must be well acquainted to the elected members before being spent.

Views were expressed that although the Bill in general was supported, detailed documents were not presented as required while tabling a new Bill or for amendment. Thus, it was expressed that support could not be rendered even when the Bill was being introduced. Concerns were expressed that sending youth for employment abroad was in one way like human trafficking of our own people. The government should generate permanent employment opportunities within the country instead of sending out youth for temporary employment abroad. It was submitted that the House could discuss more on the principles of the Bill during the second reading and therefore it was imperative to provide time for further deliberations.

The three reasons to solicit for supplementary budget were to fund the programmes which existed since the formation of the government and thus it was not a new initiative. It was submitted that the budget should have been considered and incorporated when the annual budget for the financial year 2016-17 was being passed by Parliament. If it was proposed during that time, there would have been no requirement for supplementary budget. It was submitted that it would be most appropriate to follow the due process of annual budgeting system.

On the issue, the members of the Lhengye Zhungtshog submitted that the government formulated various programmes to address unemployment problem and moreover it had formulated employment plan to create additional opportunities. According to the employment plan, job opportunities would be provided to an estimated 25,535 youth. In addition, various programmes were also formulated in the agriculture and livestock sectors which would address youth unemployment problem to a great extent.

Supplementary budget was mainly sought as the budget approved earlier was not found to be adequate to implement new activities. It was submitted that supplementary budget was not sought post facto after completion of works. Instead, it is submitted to fund the implementation of the planned works. The case of submitting supplementary budget Bill is nonetheless first of its kind. However, it is not in contravention with any other laws.

The youth were sent overseas for employment mainly because of the opportunities which enable them to gain exposure and also benefit their relatives. Within the country, establishment of the Bhutan Lottery Limited has generated many employment opportunities for the youth

while the youth are also engaged in building bridges and carrying out drilling works in hydro power projects and construction sector. The Bhutanese people working abroad are doing commendable works and thus it should not be thought as human trafficking of our people. It was submitted that due consideration be made to endorse the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill.

Following this, the Bill was referred to the Finance Committee for review as per the Rules of Procedure of the House. While reviewing, the committee was directed to consider the views expressed in the House and work as per Article 13(2) of the Constitution, section 234 of the National Assembly Act and section 46 (A) of the Public Finance (Amendment) Act. The committee was directed to conduct a comprehensive review of the Bill and present a report thereof on 28th of November 2016. The first and second readings on the Bill thus concluded. **15th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 14th November 2016.**

5. Question Hour:

The Question Hour was allotted to ministries under category A. However, the questions were not received on time as per the Rules of Procedure for the Question Hour and therefore it was cancelled. **16th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 15th November 2016.**

6. Report on the implementation status of resolutions

6.1 Resolution on the report presented by the Ministry of Labor & Human Resources on the possibility of increasing maternity leave for female employees in corporations, agencies and non-governmental organizations

As per the resolution of the seventh session of the Second Parliament, the Minister for Labor & Human Resources presented a report on the implementation status of resolution regarding the enhancement of maternity leave in corporations and private sector. The Minister reported that out of 9,228 female civil servants, 606 had availed maternity leave since it was increased to six months. The National Health Survey 2012 showed the figure that out of 1000 births, 17.9% or 616 births were given by women working in the private sector.

The number of unemployed women was on the rise in the country and under such circumstances if the maternity leave was to be increased, it would further pose risk for women getting unemployed. The increase in the duration of maternity leave was also hindering the functioning of local businesses and small industries and human resource implications cannot be absorbed for a longer time. It was submitted that it would be difficult even to finance replacement for employees going away for longer duration maternity leave.

The bottom line for the private sector is making profits. Thus, if it is faced with human resource challenge for a longer duration of time, it would undermine the productivity of the private sector. However, it was reported that 110 business entities in the country have increased the maternity leave from two months to three months while the Bhutan Postal Corporation Limited had increased the maternity leave to six months.

In addition, as per section 46 of the Labour & Employment Act of 2007, maternity leave of up to eight weeks with pay is entitled in the private sector while paternity leave of five days with pay is entitled for working fathers. It was submitted that these were the minimum maternity leave entitled and it was upon the discretion of the employers to increase the maternity leave for the benefit of the mother and the child.

The Ministry of Labour & Human Resources reviewed to increase the maternity leave for women working in the private sector and corporations. Submission was made that comprehensive consultations should be held with corporations and private organizations to increase the paternity leave also on voluntary basis. Furthermore, it was notified that childcare centers should be established and flexi-time should be provided to working mothers. It was also submitted that eight associations were notified on the matter.

Deliberating on the report, the Members expressed that although they supported the policy for the maternity leave in principle, it was however not fair to other Bhutanese women if the increased maternity leave of six months is only granted to the civil servants. The maternity leave should be uniform for all women and if it can't be applied to the private sector, the policy should be reviewed. Views were expressed that mere issuance of notification to increase the maternity leave in the private and agriculture sectors would not suffice and thus the government needs to grant fees or tax exemptions and increase the maternity leave to six months uniformly.

In addition, some Members opined that six months of maternity leave should be granted uniformly. In case, women are not entitled to adequate maternity leave, they would avoid bearing children which

would affect the population dynamics of the country which is already considered low.

Similarly, some Members submitted that since the policy is a national policy, it should be same across the social stratum and not only applicable to the civil servants. It would help if the government hereafter grants certain tax exemptions to private sector in order to enable them to increase the maternity leave to six months. The government has granted tax exemptions up to five percent to the private sector making donations for religious, skill enhancement and research activities. Similarly, it was submitted that around five percent of tax exemptions should also be provided if the private sector based on the numbers of women granted an increased maternity leave of six months. Such initiative would encourage the private sector to increase the maternity leave as envisioned by the policy. Although, six months of maternity leave could not be availed by females working in corporations and private sector at present, it was imperative to explore avenues and provide equal opportunity for entitlement of maternity leave.

To this, some Members expressed that increasing the maternity leave has been one of the pledges of the government. However, more important than fulfilling the pledge, it was important to prioritize in upholding the confidence of the people at the moment. In case, uniform maternity leave was not assured, there exist a risk and concern of people losing trust and faith in the political parties in future. The figure presented by the Ministry of Labour & Human Resources indicating the number of potential women to give birth at 34,000 was unreliable. It was submitted that the number should be instead estimated at two hundred and eighteen thousand considering the number of women falling between the age bracket of 20-40 years. The government had initiated the implementation

before formulation of policy and thus such problem ensued. It was reminded that the government should undertake comprehensive research before formulation of national policies.

The cabinet Ministers led by the Prime Minister submitted that the pledge to increase the maternity leave was only meant for the civil servants. However, the government was also working to increase the maternity leave for farmers and women working in private sectors. The policy of maternity leave could not be applied to all across the board in one go but the first step has been taken and it was hoped that it would be extended as per the policy.

The House resolved that the government should continue to work on formulating rules and system to increase the maternity leave for women working in private sector and corporations. The government should also review relevant laws to encourage the private sector and corporations to increase the maternity leave and present a report thereof in the next session. The House further directed the Members of Parliament to disseminate this information to the people during their constituency visits. The deliberation thus concluded on the implementation status of the resolution on maternity leave. **16th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 15th November 2016**

6.2 Resolution on the report by the Ministry of Finance to establish a separate division to manage seized goods

During the seventh session, the Good Governance Committee had recommended to establish a separate division under the Department of National Properties to manage goods seized by the law enforcing agencies. The Ministry of Finance was thus directed to hold comprehensive consultations with the relevant agencies and present

a report thereof to the 8th session. Accordingly, the Minister for Finance presented the report herein.

In order to discuss on the possibilities of establishing a separate agency to manage seized goods under the Department of National Properties, the Ministry of Finance held consultations with various agencies. The agencies consulted included the Anti-Corruption Commission, the Office of the Attorney General, the Royal Bhutan Police, the Royal Monetary Authority, the Road Safety & Transport Authority, the Bhutan Agriculture & Food Regulatory Authority, the Department of Revenue & Customs, and the Department of Agriculture & Forest. Subsequently, four problems were observed if the seized goods were to be managed under the Department of National Properties:

1. Problem from legal perspective would ensue as the accountability was not upon the Department of National Properties to manage seized goods as per the provisions of existing laws.
2. Problem from institutional perspective would ensue if the seized goods were handed over to the Department of National Properties following the completion of litigation process by the Office of the Attorney General. It would create institutional and administration issues.
3. If the seized goods included edible items, plants, animals, explosives and others, store and expertise would be required to be instituted.
4. Skilled human resource would be required to manage seized goods.

Thus, it was informed that based on these four factors, establishment of a separate agency under the Department of National Properties was not feasible. Subsequently three recommendations were submitted.

- A. The Department of National Properties would be only responsible to dispose the goods and properties that have been seized after the completion of litigation and legal procedures.
- B. As proposed by the Anti-Corruption Commission, a separate unit or a section under the OAG or the ACC could be established with specific responsibilities to manage the seized goods by the enforcement agencies. Accordingly, appropriate support is to be provided by RCSC.
- C. All law enforcement agencies shall continue to discharge their duties as per the existing laws.

The House deliberated that one of the major problems related to the seized goods was the risk of losing the goods. It was submitted that a department should be established as soon as possible under the Office of the Attorney General to manage seized goods. Similarly, the Department of National Properties should auction the seized goods under government's right and any direct sale of such goods should be restricted.

One of the Members submitted that litigation was handled by the Office of the Attorney General and thus if such a department was to be instituted under it, it would result in conflict of interest. Moreover, only seized goods involving corruption were handed over to the Anti Corruption Commission and the Office of the Attorney General while majority of the seized goods were taken over by the Department of

Forest, the Department of Revenue & Customs and the Royal Bhutan Police. Submission was made that the directives should be issued that as before, the Royal Bhutan Police, relevant agencies and ministries should continue to shoulder the responsibility. Timely inspection of the seized goods should also be carried out ensuring that the goods are not damaged and are useful in generating revenue for the government.

As submitted by most of the Members, resolution was passed as stated here under based on recommendation “C” of the Ministry of Finance:

1. It was resolved that law enforcing agencies including ministries, commissions, departments and agencies should continue to execute their role in managing the seized goods as per the provisions of relevant laws in a fair and transparent manner. It was also resolved that timely inspection of seized goods should be carried out and report to the government to this effect.
2. Orders from the Supreme Court stated that seized goods involving litigations should be the responsibility of the Office of the Attorney General until the passing of court verdicts. Accordingly, the seized goods should be managed by the Office of the Attorney General. However, it should be handed over to the Department of National Properties as per procedure once the verdict is passed and if the government is given the right of possession. In the event of court verdict being passed in favor of the defendants, the responsibility to handover the seized goods should still fall on the Office of the Attorney General. The House further resolved that the government should consult the Royal Civil Service Commission to address the human resource shortage in the Office of the Attorney General. The

deliberations on the implementation of resolution pertaining to seized goods concluded. **16th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 15th November 2016.**

6.3 Resolution on the report by the Ministry of Economic Affairs on ‘Fronting’

During the Seventh Session of the Second Parliament, the Good Governance Committee had recommended to amend relevant laws and include fronting as a criminal offence in the Penal Code of Bhutan. The Ministry of Economic Affairs was thus directed to hold consultations and conduct research with relevant agencies and present a report thereof in the 8th Session. The report was presented by the Minister for Economic Affairs as stated herein:

As per the resolution of the seventh session, the Ministry had instituted a committee and reviewed relevant laws and consulted with relevant agencies. In the process, it was observed that so far penalty for fronting has been the cancelation of license and shutting down of business as it was not reflected as a criminal offence in the Penal Code and relevant laws. In addition, it was explicitly reported that the word ‘Fronting’ was also not mentioned clearly in the English Oxford dictionary. The Minister presented three recommendations as stated hereunder:

1. Amend section 3 of 1995 Rule. This would mean that a license holder shall not engage in leasing, hiring or permitting license including contract license registered in some one’s name to another person to operate the business or carry out contractual work.

Violation of this rule shall result in cancellation of license, closure of business, seizure of goods as per the Civil &

Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan and no issuance of any business license to the defaulters for the next three years.

2. Fronting is to be included as a criminal offence in the Penal Code as fronting means leasing, hiring, or permitting a business license including contract license registered in someone's name to another person to operate to operate the business or carry out contractual work.

In case a defendant gives the license on lease or hire, it shall be considered as fronting and amount to misdemeanor in the Penal Code. The Ministry will accordingly amend the 1995 Rule and state fronting as a criminal offence.

3. Revise procedure for liberalization of Trade and Services Licenses in Phuentsholing, Gelephu, Samdrupjongkhar town, 2004 and make it applicable to all Dzongkhags. These were the three recommendations proposed to be resolved by the House.

Deliberating on the report, the House expressed that it would suffice if the first and third recommendations are left to the ministry as per feasibility while deliberations need to be held on the second recommendation. The Members submitted that fronting was not only compromising the quality of works but was also greatly affecting the economy of the country as it occurs between Bhutanese and foreigners. Moreover, it has implications on the security and sovereignty of the country and thus it was imperative to robustly deal with the issue before hand. Such problem was apparent mainly because there was no good policy and system pertaining to import license in the country.

In addition, fronting was visible in all construction and service sectors and it was being variedly interpreted resulting in difficulty to implement relevant policies and laws. It was submitted that months of hard work carried out by the Anti Corruption Commission had gone futile and thus it was imperative to ascertain the definition of fronting. However, one of the Members expressed that although fronting was not directly mentioned in the Penal Code, it basically meant deception and fraud which are mentioned clearly in the Penal Code. Thus, a need was not found to amend the Penal Code and incorporate the word 'Fronting'.

Similarly, some Members submitted that the recommendation of the Ministry to grade the offence of fronting as misdemeanor was a lighter penalty and thus it must be graded as a felony to prevent such activities. Others members submitted that the matter involves varied circumstances and therefore it would be better to have a separate Act for fronting in place.

One of the Members informed the House about the emergence of fronting for the first time in Bhutan. He submitted that when the trade agreement was signed between Bhutan and India, it was agreed that the nationals of both the countries can involve in business activities in each other's territory. Subsequently some people from India had started doing business in Bhutan. However, in order to create opportunities for the Bhutanese business people, talks were held to revise the Agreement in 1980. Thus, the Agreement was revised in 1983 and people from India could not run businesses in Bhutan. Thereafter, the issues related to fronting first ensued in border towns and accordingly rules and legal framework were formulated to address the issues. Most Members submitted that the House should not immediately decide on the issue

of fronting given the significance of the matter. Submission was made that because of fronting, the confusion between the Anti-Corruption Commission and the Office of the Attorney General ensued mainly due to its interpretation of civil and criminal procedures. The House was recommended that the issue should be referred to a committee and report to this effect during the 9th session. Accordingly, the House resolved on the following:

1. The House reached a consensus on the above mentioned recommendations one and three of the Ministry of Economic Affairs and resolved that it would suffice if the ministry works accordingly.
2. On the second recommendation, it was resolved that the Legislative Committee of the National Assembly shall study the feasibility to incorporate the word 'Fronting' in the Penal Code and present a report thereof during the 9th session. The deliberation on the report on the implementation status of 'Fronting' thus concluded. **17th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 16th November 2016**

7. Resolution on the First and Second Readings of the Marriage (Amendment) Bill 2016

The Member In-Charge of the Bill, the Member from Chumi - Ura constituency moved the motion to present the private member's Bill titled Marriage (Amendment) Bill 2016 to the House for deliberation and endorsement. Subsequently, the Members endorsed the Bill to be deliberated with a show of hands.

Following this, the Member In-Charge of the Bill presented the

background details of the Bill during the second reading. He informed that the Act was proposed to be amended mainly as per the resolution of the seventh session which mandated the committee to review the sections pertaining to rape in the Penal Code. Accordingly, the committee had reviewed the Penal Code and in the process it was observed that some of the sections of the Penal Code needed to be harmonized with the Marriage Act and the Child Care & Protection Act 2011. In addition, the Marriage Act which was enacted before the adoption of the Constitution should be further harmonized with the Constitution and also with other relevant laws of the nation. Furthermore, the series of amendments made to the Marriage Act in previous sessions were not consolidated and thus it was inevitable for the Act to be amended.

To this, some Members submitted that in order to maintain happiness and peace in the society, it was imperative to have stable families. It was thus expressed that it was necessary to consider the country's scenario and changing needs of time while amending the Act. Further, it was important to review whether or not the Marriage Act needs to be amended in whole and harmonize it with other relevant Acts. With this, the second reading on the Bill concluded.

Following this, the Member In-Charge of the Bill submitted that as per section 158 and 159-164 of the Rules of Procedure of the National Assembly, the Third Reading on the Bill could be commenced. Therefore, he requested the House to endorse the third reading on the Bill in the present session to enable for its early implementation. As per the prevailing practice, after the completion of the second reading, the third reading of the Bill was to be held in the next session mainly to enable the committees to comprehensively review the Bill. However,

all review works pertaining to the Marriage Amendment Bill has been conducted and thus the Member In-Charge requested the support of the House to commence the third reading.

Some Members submitted that the third reading on the Marriage Bill should not be rushed but rather the views of the people should be explicitly collected. It was important that the prevailing system be upheld in order to strengthen it for times to come.

The Member In-Charge of the Bill informed that the Bill has been consulted with relevant agencies and people's views have already been sought. He further submitted that the sections proposed to be amended were only those sections which were directed by the House earlier and thus requested the House to commence the third reading on the Bill in the present session. Subsequently, the House endorsed to commence the third reading on the Marriage (Amendment) Bill 2016 in the present session with a show of hands.

Following this, the Speaker informed that the committee while working should consider the views expressed by the Members. The House was further informed that the amendment Bill would be included in the Business Order as per the Rules of Procedure and the Members would be accordingly informed. The second reading on the Bill thus concluded. **17th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 16th November 2016.**

8. Continuation of report on the implementation status of resolutions

8.1. Resolution on the report by the Human Rights Committee

As per the resolution of the sixth session, the Dy. Chairperson of the Human Rights Committee, the Member from Bji-Katsho-Uesu constituency submitted that the committee had reviewed establishing a separate detention centre for ACC detainees with rooms for female and male detainees, prohibition of the handcuffs on ACC detainees while travelling and re-announcement of the alleged as not guilty after it has been confirmed in the media by the Commission. The committee also reviewed the provisions on Security Clearance Certificate after youths have served their prison terms, provision of nutritious food to the youths in rehabilitation centres and improvement of the overall conditions of detention centres. The committee submitted seven recommendations:

1. The proposal of RBP and ACC to construct detention centre in Thimphu to the House for endorsement.
2. The House to endorse the proposal for formulation of a national policy or legislation on detention that would categorically deal with detention and detainees.
3. The House to endorse the proposal to use handcuff based on necessity by the Royal Bhutan Police.
4. The House to endorse the proposal for the Anti Corruption Commission to communicate in writing to respective agency and the person concerned declaring his or her innocence in the case after investigation.
5. The House to endorse the proposal for the government to

review the Guidelines for Issuance of Security Clearance Certificate, 2011.

6. The House to endorse the proposal for continuation of the present dietary entitlement for the Youth Development & Rehabilitation Centre inmates.
7. The House to acknowledge for renovation and expansion of the existing detention centres.

Deliberating on the recommendations, some Members submitted that separate detention centres needed to be constructed for detainees of the Anti-Corruption Commission and for other women and children detained. Supports were expressed to renovate and expand the existing detention centres. It was submitted that separate detention centres would address the issues related to detention and would enable detention of women, children, elder people and foreigners in a better manner. Toward this, the Minister of Finance expressed his support to draw an estimate for the construction of detention centres after consulting the Royal Bhutan Police.

Furthermore, some Members submitted on the need to have a national policy or a legal framework pertaining to detention while some other Members submitted that it was not required as it was already sufficed by the Anti-Corruption Act, Prison Act and the Civil & Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan. However, some of the Members submitted that keeping people with regular prisoners before proven guilty by the courts was against the fundamental rights and hence a separate policy or legal framework was required for them. With regard to the implementation part, it was submitted that in case of issues involving personal safety

and extreme corruption, the policy or the legal framework could be implemented as per the need of the case.

Similarly, deliberations were held that if a person is found innocent by the Anti-Corruption Commission after investigation, announcement to this effect should be made. Some Members submitted that if there were no strong reasons for a person to be detained, the Anti-Corruption Commission should as much as possible restrain from detaining that person. The Royal Bhutan Police should also be given authority to discharge an arrested person on bail based on severity of the case and provided a person guarantees on behalf of the detainee. The responsibility also falls on the Anti-Corruption Commission and the media to declare the innocence of the accused once he or she is found innocent.

On the issuing of security clearance certificate to youth completing rehabilitation period, it was submitted that the issue should be dealt with the present system as several years has not yet passed implementing the Guidelines for Issuance of Security Clearance Certificate, 2011. However, some other Members still emphasized and proposed for reviewing the guidelines considering the need and importance to mainstream youth into the society after completing their rehabilitation period.

Subsequently, the House endorsed recommendations 1,3,4,6 and 7 while recommendations 2 and 5 were dropped. In addition, the following supplementary recommendation was resolved by the House:

In order to address the problem of overcrowding in the detention centres, the House resolved that under the lead coordination of the

Ministry of Home & Cultural Affairs, the Royal Bhutan Police and the Judiciary was to formulate a system to release detainees on bail provided that they come up with guarantor. **18th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 17th November 2016.**

8.2. Women, Children & Youth Committee's report on the implementation status of resolutions

The Chairperson of the Women, Children & Youth Committee, the Member from Chumey-Ura constituency presented the report to the House. The Committee submitted that as resolved by the seventh session of the National Assembly, a high level taskforce led by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs was formed to consider a way forward on the International Convention for the disabled people, report on the amendment of the Penal Code of Bhutan, pressing social issues such as rape and suicide cases. The committee also reported on liver diseases related to alcohol, abortion, students in conflict with law, policy on entertainment and women's participation in local government elections. Furthermore, the report included status of married civil servants serving in same places. The status of abortion, rape, suicide, and liver diseases resulting from alcohol in the country were presented as provided in the table below:

SL No	Year	Issue	Age	Male	Female
1	2011-2015	Abortion			7012
2	2011-2015	Alcohol related deaths	Above 65	301	142
3	2016	Alcohol related deaths	15-49	1077	648

4	2016	Alcohol related deaths	50-64	575	391
5	2012-2016	Suicide	Below 24	71	52
6	2012-2016	Suicide	Above 25	200	89
7	2012-2016	Rape			208

Along with the presentation of the figures, the committee presented the following five recommendations:

1. The High-level Task force should continue working to expedite the ratification of the United Nations Convention on Rights of Persons with Disabilities.
2. Regarding the issues of rape, suicide and abortion, the committee recommended that the Government should carry out in-depth studies to come up with measures to overcome such challenges.
3. The committee recommended that the government should ensure an effective implementation of the Alcohol Reduction Policy 2013 - 2018 which is already in place.
4. The committee recommended entertainment issues be included in the new Information, Communication and Media Bill 2016.
5. Royal Civil Service Commission should effectively implement section 4.4.10 of Chapter 14, Bhutan Civil Service Rules and Regulations 2012.

Deliberating on the report, the Members expressed their support for extensive deliberations to be held as the report presented by the committee was alarming.

Led by the Minister for Education, the cabinet ministers submitted that one of the biggest challenges faced by the ministry was regarding the transfer of married teachers. It was expressed that the ministry was able to address the transfer issue if both husband and wife were teachers. However, when the transfer involves a teacher married to other public servants, the problem ensued with 100-200 applications received by the ministry for transfers annually.

In addition, at present, various schools were having inadequate classrooms and 407 untrained teachers were currently teaching in schools. However, the spouses of the teachers were based in urban areas and thus if these teachers were transferred, the schools in rural areas would face shortage of teachers. Nonetheless, once central schools are established, most of the teachers would have opportunity to live with their families and similarly after endorsement of 'One teacher, One subject policy', issues pertaining to married teachers could be solved. The government is formulating various policies and programmes to uphold gender equality. However, in order to resolve the maternal problems of women, works have been initiated to build a separate hospital for women and children in Thimphu. It was also submitted that a person committing rape of a girl child below the age of 12 should be directly convicted irrespective of the nature of petitions filed.

On the participation of Bhutanese women in election, it was submitted that the issue should not cause concerns as it had not been long since the introduction of democracy. The women participants would naturally increase if election related education and information were disseminated.

As per the Ministry of Health's report, basic amenities for youth and children have been instituted in four hospitals in the country. In addition, health service centres for youth and children would be established in four hospitals during the current and next financial years. These centres would provide youth with counseling on health, sex education and pregnancy prevention. One of the concerns raised was the inadequate number of nurses in Basic Health Units (BHU) and hence 126 Grade 'II' BHUs were being provided with nurses and 70 % of the work to this effect has been completed while 80% would be achieved by the end of the 11th plan.

On the issue of suicide, the issue was accorded high priority and thus under the chairpersonship of the Minister for Health, a board has been instituted. The board has conducted research and formulated plans and policies and educated Dzongkhags and local government on the negative aspects of suicide. This would reduce the number of suicide cases and within three years, the suicide cases could be reduced. It was submitted that the Dzongkhag Health Officers were taking the lead role to this effect. Further, it was clarified that the committee has included the abortion cases under suicide in its second recommendation and thus the number of suicide cases were indicated higher.

As per the health policy, it is legal to resort to abortion if the life of either the mother or a child was at risk. However, there is no specific law restricting underage girls resorting to abortion in neighboring countries and thus it would benefit if such issues could be mitigated.

The Minister for Economic Affairs reported that 7,134 bar licenses were issued in the country but the ministry had cancelled licenses which were not being used as per the provisions of relevant law and

hence there were currently 434 bar licenses only. The ministry does not issue new bar licenses and the policy was being implemented effectively. The Ministry of Home & Cultural Affairs has also been holding meetings on the alcohol policy with relevant ministries and agencies. Thus, the Members of Parliament and the society were also urged to render its support.

Toward this, the Social & Cultural committee submitted that stabbing cases involving youth was increasing in the country annually. Such cases were reported mainly during the winter vacation of schools and thus it would benefit if the issue could be incorporated under recommendation two of the committee and accordingly carry out research on the issue.

On the recommendation four of the committee, the Minister for Information & Communications submitted that the rules governing entertainment places 2009 had been revised and the revised rules of 2014 was currently being implemented. The Minister submitted for the exclusion of recommendation four and to include the issue in rules governing places of entertainment 2014 which would benefit the relevant authorities in implementation.

The Chairperson of the committee submitted that it would suffice if recommendation four was excluded and include the issue in the rules governing places of entertainment 2014. He also submitted that it would be more effective if the issue was to be included in the Act.

The House expressed its appreciation to the Women, Children & Youth Committee for presenting quality report and to relevant ministries, departments and agencies for rendering their support to the committee. The House endorsed first, second and fifth recommendations of the committee and resolved to include stabbing cases involving youth under

the second recommendation. The fifth recommendation was dropped and the House resolved that it should be included in the rules governing places of entertainment 2014 when it is being revised. Further, it was resolved that the resolutions should be implemented by the government and subsequently the deliberation on the report of the Women, Children & Youth Committee concluded. **18th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 17th November 2016.**

9. Question Hour: Group B- Questions asked to the Minister for Education, Minister for Agriculture & Forests and Minister for Foreign Affairs

The Speaker informed that there were total of 11 questions including five questions for oral answers while the other six questions were for written answers. The Speaker instructed that supplementary questions would be entertained in the end subject to availability of time and thus the Question Hour commenced.

1. The Member from Wamrong constituency questioned the Minister for Education on the dining hall of Jigme Sherubling Central School in Trashigang Dzongkhag which was without a ceiling compromising the hygiene of the hall for students. He added that possibly such cases were also with other schools. He questioned on what were the plans of the School Planning and Building Division under the Ministry of Education to prevent such problems in the future.
2. The Member from Khamed-Lunana constituency questioned the Minister for Agriculture & Forests on when the Lunana Gewog would be provided with power tillers and a farm shop. The Member also added that the ministry had been rendering support to the four Gewogs of Gasa in the past.

3. The Member from Kengkhar-Weringla constituency expressed that education was important for development and thus teachers were inalienable for quality education. He therefore questioned the Minister for Education on how many teachers have so far availed the extended maternity leave and how many have replaced them.

4. The Member from Nubi-Tangsibji constituency questioned the Minister for Agriculture & Forests on Tsamdro and Sokshing. He said that farmers were dependent on livestock for their livelihood and the government has taken over Tsamdro and Sokshing in some of the Dzongkhags. The people are yet to receive compensation for the Tsamdro and Sokshing acquired by the government. He thus questioned on how many people were given compensation so far and how many would be provided compensation.

The recent signing of MoUs between the Minister for Education and local manufactures of shoes and socks was questioned by the Member from Panbang constituency to the Minister for Education. The Member said that the signing of MoUs has not only breached Article 9 and 10 of the Constitution but had also violated the procurement rules of the Ministry of Finance. He added that it was also against the code of conduct of the government and thus clarifications were sought on the issue. **19th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 18th November 2016.**

Note: Answers and deliberations for the abovementioned questions are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.

10. Continuation of report on the implementation status of resolution

10.1. Resolution on the report by the Economic Development & Private Sector Committee

The Dy. Chairperson of the Economic Development & Private Sector Committee, the Member from Shompangkha constituency presented the report on three issues namely, access to finance to cottage, small and medium industries (CSMIs), unemployment and non-tariff tourism. He reported that the report was being presented in keeping with Section 310 of the Rules of Economic Development & Private Sector Committee Procedure of the National Assembly 2014 and also in keeping with the Terms of Reference of Committee which specifically mandated and empowered the Committee to conduct review of labour and employment policies, legislations and related issues.

Subsequent to the detail presentation of the report on the three issues, the committee presented the following recommendations:

Issue I: Access to Finance to Cottage, Small and Medium Industries (CSMIs)

1. A policy on access to finance to CSMIs should be framed.
2. Financial Inclusion Policy should be endorsed immediately by the Government
3. An apex institution for CSMIs should be identified.
4. Financial Institutions should designate separate specialized banking service Units for CSMIs.
5. Credit Information Bureau (CIB) should maintain a com-

prehensive segregated data on CSMI loans and the informal sectors.

Deliberating on this, Members submitted that cottage, small and medium industries greatly benefit the economy in developing countries. The promotion of access to finance would benefit exports and the economic situation and further create ample of employment opportunities.

Besides, in a bid to promote access to finance, the Royal Monetary Authority and the Ministry of Finance had announced on the establishment of an agent bank in line with financial policy for rural areas. It was also informed that the Economic Development Policy 2016 would be soon endorsed. The Department of Cottage and Small Industries under the Ministry of Economic Affairs should be identified to assume the responsibility for cottage, small and medium industries. It was submitted that although there exist a policy for cottage, small and medium industries, there was no separate provision for opportunities pertaining to access to finance.

Issue II: Committee's recommendations on Unemployment

1. Economic Development Policy (EDP) should be endorsed at the earliest.
2. Human Resource Development Policy should be revised.
3. Labour and Employment Act should be revised.
4. Entrepreneurship Development Policy should be revised.
5. TVET Blue Print 2016-2026 should be implemented with priority.

6. The Government should implement strategies to encourage industries such as Tourism, Hospitality, Health care and vocational skills training to keep the female youths employed.
7. The government must frame proper policies or legal instrument to regulate the construction sector in order to encourage the youths to take up jobs in the construction sectors.
8. The Government must strive to achieve balance between skill and academic oriented education.

The House deliberated on each and every recommendation whereby some Members expressed that unemployment was one of the major challenges faced by the country. It was submitted that the Ministry of Labour & Human Resources were not only formulating programmes to address the issue but were also working on the recommendations made by the committee.

Issue III: Committee's recommendations on Non-Tariff Tourism

a. General

1. The Economic Development Policy should be endorsed at the earliest.
2. A clear policy and regulation on non-tariff tourism should be framed.

b. Specific

1. The non-tariff tourists must be accompanied by licensed tourist guides.
2. Lease of private buildings and flats for non-tariff tourists should not be allowed.

3. The Department of Trade should strictly regulate and monitor the issues of hotel occupancy and declaration of documents.
4. The mechanisms for collection of toll fee or imposition of green fee on foreign registered vehicles should be introduced.
5. Road Safety and Transport Authority (RSTA) and Royal Bhutan Police (RBP) should monitor roadworthiness of foreign registered vehicles including passenger capacity.

Deliberating on the recommendations, some Members submitted that it was a cause of concern for the rising number of non-tariff tourists in the country annually. On the submission made to immediately endorse the Economic Development Policy to control the rising number of non-tariff tourists, the Ministry of Economic Affairs had already consulted with relevant agencies on the issues pertaining to non-tariff tourists. Thus, the issue could be controlled as the permits were being issued to non-tariff tourists through online as a pilot activity.

The committee had made both general and specific recommendations after holding consultations with various relevant agencies during which it was expressed that a policy and rules was needed for non-tariff tourists. The committee had accordingly made the recommendations as a support to the government and proposed for endorsement.

Following this, the House through a show of hands endorsed all the recommendations made by the committee on the three issues of access to finance to cottage, small and medium industries (CSMIs), unemployment and non-tariff tourism after expressing varied opinions. It was resolved that all recommendations should be implemented

by the government. The deliberation on the report by the Economic Development & Private Sector Committee thus concluded. **19th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 18th November 2016.**

10.2. Resolution on the report of the Legislative Committee

The Chairperson of the Legislative committee, the Member from Tashicholing constituency presented the committee's report as per the resolution of the sixth session. The committee was directed to review the Penal Code of Bhutan, Civil & Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan, Royal Bhutan Police Act, Prison Act of Bhutan, Marriage Act of Bhutan, Anti-Corruption Commission Act, Child Care & Protection Act in consultation with other relevant agencies. Following were the review report and recommendations presented by the committee:

1. Determination of Compensatory damages under Section 39 of the Penal Code of Bhutan
2. Issues related to Human Trafficking
3. Issues related to the provision concerning the Rape of a child above 12 years of age - Section 183 of PCB
4. Issues related to Detention vis-à-vis Constitution, ACC Act, CCPC, Prison Act of Bhutan and RBP Act
5. Issues related to the crimes committed beyond territorial jurisdiction
6. Issues pertaining to the Detention period for ACC detainees
7. Issues relating the Authority to issue bail by the RBP

8. Issues pertaining to Defamation
9. Issues related to Sections 213 and 214 dealing with the offence of unnatural sex
10. Narcotic Drugs, Psychotropic Substances and Substance Abuse Act of Bhutan, 2015(NDPSSA)
11. Issuance of Security Clearance Certificate by RBP
12. Cooling period under the Election Act

Deliberating on the recommendations, Members submitted that law was important for the country's peace and thus it was imperative to harmonize laws comprehensively to uphold happiness, peace and justice for the people. Accordingly, most of the Members expressed their support on the recommendations, findings and issues reflected in the report. It was submitted that the National Law Review Task Force was not a permanent office and although its chairperson and members were professionals, they had to carry out their regular duties. Therefore, the taskforce members were shouldering additional responsibility and it was a challenge for the taskforce to review numerous laws to be harmonized on time. Submission was made that because of this fact, the committee's proposal to refer its recommendations to the National Law Review Task Force cannot be endorsed.

Toward this, the Chairperson of the committee submitted that as per the work plan of the National Law Review Task Force, the law review exercise should be completed within May or June 2017. He thus, expressed that referring the recommendations to the National Law Review Task Force would suffice.

In order to conduct comprehensive review of laws, some Members

expressed that the members of the National Law Review Task Force should be on deputation from their respective agencies and at the same time the taskforce should be provided with adequate budget. It was submitted that the National Law Review Task Force and the Legislative Committee should continue reviewing the laws. Further, submission was made that while amending laws after review, time should not be a determining factor and it was imperative to be mindful of the people's welfare and take measures for unnecessary amendment in future.

The House resolved that all recommendations made by the Legislative committee should be reviewed by the National Law Review Task Force and the proposal for amendments should be presented by the Legislative committee in the 9th session. With this, the deliberation on the report of the Legislative committee concluded. **23rd Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 21st November 2016.**

11. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Marriage (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2016

The Chairperson of the Women, Children & Youth committee, the Member from Chumey-Ura constituency presented a report on the third reading of the Marriage (Amendment) Bill 2016. He informed that while undertaking the review works, the committee had reviewed Marriage Act 1980, Marriage (Amendment) Act 1996 along with other amendment Acts of 2006, 2007 and 2009. The committee had therefore proposed a total of 16 sections for amendment and endorsement of the House.

To this, the Member from Panbang constituency submitted that since the Marriage Act of 1980 has been amended four times, it needed to be consolidated. In addition, he submitted that other related Acts

such as the Inheritance Act should be harmonized with the Marriage Act. Further, issues pertaining to marriage between a Bhutanese and a foreigner should also be stated clearly in the Act. Submission was therefore made that the instead of amending only 16 sections, the Act as a whole should be reviewed and a new Bill should be drafted. In addition, it was proposed that the matter could be referred to the National Law Review Task Force for its review.

To this, the Ministers for Finance, Labour & Human Resources and the Foreign Affairs submitted that since the Marriage Act has been amended on many occasions, it would cause problems for the people in the absence of one consolidated Act. It would benefit in the implementation if the Marriage Act was repealed and a new Act is drafted.

The Chairperson of the committee submitted that time was inadequate if a new Act was to be drafted and thus only 16 sections were proposed for amendment as per the resolution of the fifth session. He said that the 16 sections proposed were the contradicting sections in the Marriage Act of Bhutan, Penal Code of Bhutan and the Child Care & Protection Act of Bhutan. The conflicting sections in relevant laws were referred to the National Law Review Task Force but it was the Women, Children & Youth committee which had to undertake the review work and propose for amendment as the former could not review it given the time constraint.

Furthermore, it was expressed that if the third reading on the Bill was not held in the current session, the outcome of the work would not meet the expectations of the people since the present parliament was left only with two sessions before coming to the end of its tenure. The House was requested to consider the submission and the committee was prepared even if the Act was to be amended in its entirety.

The committee Members and some other Members submitted that the committee had done lot of work by consulting over 20 institutions and holding over 30 meetings. Thus, it was opined that it would be better if the third reading on the amendment Bill was held in the current session instead of deferring to the next session.

Some of the other Members expressed that the Marriage Act was important for social peace and happiness in the country and thus it should not be rushed for deliberations. They submitted that as in the past, the third reading on the Bill should be held in the next session after first and second readings in the current session. Amending the Act in its entirety would also provide opportunity to the Members to hold consultations with the people during constituency visit. Moreover, the National Law Review Task Force would get the opportunity to submit their opinions and recommendations and thus third reading was proposed to be postponed.

The Chairperson of the committee proposed that as per the submissions made by the committee Members, the committee would comprehensively review and present the Marriage Act 1980 for the third reading after holding consultations with the public in the ninth session.

The proposal of the committee was unanimously endorsed by the House with a show of hands. It was resolved that the Women, Children & Youth Committee should comprehensively review the Marriage Act 1980 and present a report in the ninth session for the third reading. The third reading on the Bill was thus postponed and the deliberation concluded. **23rd Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 21st November 2016.**

12. Question Hour: Group C- Questions asked to the Minister for Economic Affairs, Minister for Finance and Minister for Labour & Human Resources

The sitting for the day was presided over by the Dy. Speaker who informed that the day's sitting had only the Question Hour as the agenda. It was further informed that there were a total of seven questions including four questions for oral answers while remaining three were for written answers. The Question Hour commenced after the Dy. Speaker expressed that one supplementary question would be entertained after every answer and further questions would be entertained at the end subject to availability of time.

1. The Member from Drujegang-Tseza constituency questioned the Minister for Labour & Human Resources on why the teachers graduating from colleges of education were offered employment on contract basis and not as regular teachers. He also enquired if the government has a plan to regularize those on contract or extend their contract periods.
2. The Member from Bartsham-Shongphu constituency questioned the Minister for Finance on what amount of pre-financing were done for donor funded projects. The Member further questioned on how much pre-financing were done by the government thus far.
3. The Member from Kengkhar-Weringla constituency questioned the Minister for Labour & Human Resources on the rising unemployment in the country annually. He thus questioned on the plans of the government to fulfill the pledge of creating 100% employment as the government was left with only two and half years of its tenure.

4. The Member from Panbang constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on the Chamkharchhu hydropower project. He submitted that the Prime Minister and the then Minister for Economic Affairs had expressed that the works for the Chamkharchhu hydro power project was ready to be commenced. Further, he submitted that even the present Minister for Economic Affairs had expressed that the works for the project would be started in the last session and thus he questioned when the actual work would be started. **24th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 22nd November 2016.**

Note: Answers and deliberations for the abovementioned questions are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.

13. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2015 (Private Member's Bill)

The Member In-Charge of the Bill, the Member from Tashicholing Constituency presented the Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2015 (Private Bill) for the third reading on the 23rd November, 2016 corresponding with the 25th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year. He submitted that the International Red Cross Society will aid in preventing and providing benefits in times of natural calamity and the Geneva Convention was signed in 1991. He further submitted that the International Red Cross Society will provide profound benefits through global medical aids services to the emergency casualties if war ever breaks out and solicited support for the Bill.

Subsequently, the House adopted most of the Sections as recommended by the Committee as mentioned in the ANNEXURE 3, while deliberating

on each Section of the bill. However, On the Section 1 of the Chapter 7 of the bill, one Member opined that there was an opportunity to fund the Society as per the Act by the government in the Section 3 of the Chapter 6 of the Bill, on the matter to state fund for sustainable management of the Secretariat of the Society. Majority of the Members did not support the opinion to keep the words of the Agreement open; where the government can state fund and not as government should state fund the Society regarding the funding of the Secretariat of the Society since it would be considered more like a government office than a civil society organization.

It was submitted that the Society is crucial and would benefit during various forms of disasters and calamities since the Society is different from other non-governmental organizations and has to work with other international Societies. The House supported and passed the recommendations submitted on the importance to keep the section as it is, since it mandates the government to establish an office to look after issues during the disaster and the Society would benefit in getting aids and support from other countries. **25th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 23rd November, 2016.**

The Member In-charge of the bill, the Chairperson of the Legislative Committee, the Member from Tashicholing Constituency presented the Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2015 (Private Bill) for adoption on the 24th November, 2016 corresponding to the 25th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year. The Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill was unanimously adopted with all Members supporting the bill from amongst the 44 Members present during the voting. **The voting result is provided in the Annexure 4.**

14. Resolution on the First and Second readings of the Information, Communication and Media Bill 2016

The Minister for Information & Communications, who is the Member In-Charge of the Bill moved the motion to introduce the Information, Communications and Media Bill 2016 for adoption. Following this, the Member from Panbang constituency questioned whether or not provisions related to the Right to Information Bill was covered in the Information, Communication and Media Bill or not. It was submitted that the Opposition Party would support the Bill if it contained the provisions related to the Right to Information Bill. The House however endorsed the Bill to be deliberated after majority of the Members expressed in favour of the Bill to be deliberated through a show of hands

Subsequently, the Member In-Charge of the Bill moved the motion for the second reading of the Bill. It was informed that the previous Bhutan Info Com & Media Act 2006 endorsed during the 85th session of the erstwhile National Assembly is not able to cover the changes which have taken place in information, communications and technology, and media sectors. Thus, it had become important to repeal the Act of 2006 and draft a new Act in place.

Moreover, problems were faced by the implementation agencies while implementing the Act. Thus the new Bill titled Information, Communications and Media Bill 2016 was drafted after thorough consultations with relevant agencies and international consultants. The opinions of the people submitted through the Ministry's website were also considered and was deliberated in the cabinet while drafting the Bill.

The cabinet and relevant ministries had also acknowledged in revising

the Act given the profound changes taking place in information and communications technology. It was hoped that the new Bill would further promote information and communications technology.

The query from the Opposition Party raised during the first reading on the Bill pertaining to inclusion of provisions related to right to information was also clarified. The Member In-Charge of the Bill informed that although all the provisions related to Right to Information Bill were not included, important provisions in general have been incorporated. The Right to Information Bill was considered an important Bill by the government and accordingly it was tabled during the third session and was referred to the National Council after endorsement. Thus, it was submitted that House was well aware of the status of the Bill.

Deliberating on the issue, the Leader of Opposition expressed that the Right to Information Bill was one of the 100 days pledges of the government. In case, the Bill is not passed, it was submitted that either the government or the Speaker must inform on the status of the Bill.

The Government Ministers submitted that given the importance of the Right to Information Bill, the work towards drafting the Bill commenced in 2007 and was subsequently endorsed by the National Assembly during the third session of the second parliament. However, the National Council had communicated that the Bill could not be deliberated in the National Council and it had been withdrawn as presentation on the Bill was not made by the relevant Ministry.

Submission was made that if two Bills had to contain same provisions, there was no need of drafting two separate Bills. The Information, Communications and Media Bill 2016 and the Right to Information

Bill differed greatly in principle and contents.

Toward this, the Minister for Education proposed that assessment should be carried out whether or not provisions in the Right to Information Bill was included in the Information, Communications and Media Bill. The House subsequently resolved that the Bill should be reviewed by the Legislative committee and the proposal made by the Minister for Education should also be taken into consideration. Thus, the first and second readings on the Bill concluded. **25th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 24th November 2016.**

15. Adoption of Convention

15.1 Resolution on the ratification of Paris Agreement

On the 25th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to the 24th of November 2016, the Member In-Charge in his motion for leave to introduce the Paris Agreement, the Minister for Agriculture and Forest submitted that the Government of Bhutan was recommended to sign and ratify the Paris Agreement which was adopted in December 2015 at the 21st Conference of Parties of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change in Paris, France. He submitted that subsequently after the review and decision of the *Lhengye Zhungtshog*, the Paris Agreement was signed on behalf of Bhutan by the Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Bhutan to the United Nations in New York, at the High Level Signature Ceremony on 22 April 2016.

Moreover, submission was made that the Agreement aims to strengthen response to the Global threat of climate change through:

- 1- A “temperature goal” of limiting the increase in global average temperature to “well below 2° C” in relation to pre-

industrial levels with efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5° C.

- 2- Increasing the ability to adapt to adverse impacts of climate change and foster climate resilience and low greenhouse gas emissions development.
- 3- Making financial flows consistent with efforts for low greenhouse gas development and climate resilient development.

On this, the Member In-Charge clearly submitted that out of 197 Parties of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, 113 Parties have already signed and ratified the Paris Agreement, where, Bhutan and Afghanistan are the only two countries in the south Asian region that has not yet ratified. With this, he also submitted the comparison between the Kyoto Protocol and the Paris Agreement including the rationale for Bhutan to ratify the Paris Agreement.

During the deliberation, while most of the Members supported the Agreement, few Members submitted diverse remarks on the principle of the Agreement. The Member from Chumey- Ura Constituency reminded the House that the Rules of Procedure of the Treaty Making, 2016 mandates the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to be the Member In-Charge of any Convention, Covenants, Treaties, Protocols and Agreements that is to be ratified by the Parliament.

Moreover, he submitted that it is very important to support the Agreement since Bhutan is already recognized internationally for the conservation of the environment and now as the world leaders have reached consensus to lower the greenhouse gas emission and prevent climate change, the

Paris Agreement to this effect has become well known. Furthermore, it will be recorded in the history as it also supports the ideology of the Gross National Happiness. He also submitted that Bhutan should continue to lead the International Conferences on Environment and climate change and it is imperative to convey the similar concepts.

On this, some Members reminded that, while they recognize the importance of the Agreement, the government should prepare measures to prevent the degradation of acres of forest through raising of domestic animals which also emits green house gas and in the same manner, the government should also come up with policies in line with the conservation of environment while implementing the governmental works of the country. They also questioned the Member In-Charge of the Agreement, if the clauses of the Agreement can be amended. Even after intensive deliberation in the House, if they cannot amend the provisions, they submitted that it would be convenient to deliberate and adopt article by article instead of going by the clauses.

On this, the Member In-Charge informed the House that the clauses of the Agreement cannot be amended. He also submitted that domestic animals are very essential for livelihood in Bhutan's context and to reduce the green house gas emission, the waste is being used to produce bio-gas. Further, he submitted that the House need not strain over the Forest preservation as it has improved compared to the past. According to a preliminary report, Bhutan has 94 percent of green coverage out of which 71 percent is under forest cover.

Subsequently, after reaching a consensus, one of the Members informed the House that agriculture, domestic animal and forest products are the main source for self-sufficiency. Submission was made that the since

the government is endeavoring to lower the emission of green house gas through use of better and eco-friendly technologies, he reminded the government to make rules and regulations without hindering the sources of the self-sufficiency while implementing section 4(2) of the Agreement in the future. Section 4 (2) mandates the Parties to prepare, communicate and maintain successive nationally determined contributions that it intends to achieve.

The session was then adjourned by the speaker with the reminder to the House that the Agreement shall be ratified according to the due legislative procedure.

On the 26th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to the 25th of November 2016, the Member In-Charge of the Agreement, the Minister for Agriculture and Forests moved the motion that the Agreement be ratified. Putting it to vote, the Paris Agreement was ratified by unanimous support of all 44 Members present and voting. The sitting thus concluded. **The voting result is provided in Annexure 5.**

16. Question Hour: Group D- Questions asked to the Minister for Work and Human Settlement and Minister for Health.

The Speaker commenced the Question Hour by informing the House that there were five questions for oral reply. He informed that a question and a supplementary question would be allowed in the beginning and if time permits, more supplementary questions could be asked.

- 1) The Member from Dophuchen-Tading constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement, if the government has considered any plans to achieve good

progress in the short winter season including the availability of adequate manpower and machinery. He said that rain hinders construction works in summer and major progress has to be achieved only during short dry winter season.

- 2) The Member from Phuentsholing constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement, if the ministry has any plans to amend the Procurement Rules and Regulations 2009, since the buildings and offices constructed by the bidders who quoted rates below 40 to 50 percent of the estimated cost are of poor quality on account using sub-standard quality construction materials.
- 3) The Member from South Thimphu constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement, if the Government has considered any way forward with regard to the writ issued by the Supreme Court on the establishment of Dzongkhag *Thromde*. Whether those who have resigned to contest in the thromde elections would be reinstated since the general public is concerned over the writ which stated the unconstitutionality of establishment of all other *Thromdes* except for Samdrup Jongkhar.
- 4) The Member from North Thimphu constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement regarding the Government's plans on resolving the drinking water issue in Taba, Jungshina, Hejo, Zilukha and Kawangjangsa, and maintenance and blacktopping of urban roads in Pamtsho, Jungshina, Hejo, Bebena and Samtenling.

- 5) The Member from Khamaed-Lunana constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement as to why the government decided to start blacktopping of the road from Gasa to Punakha, while it should have been done from Punakha to Gasa like in other Dzongkhags. **26th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to the 25th November 2016.**

Note: Answers and deliberations for the abovementioned questions are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.

17. Resolution on the re-deliberation of the Customs Bill 2015

The Minister for Finance who is the Member In-Charge of the Bill moved the motion to consider the re-deliberation of the Bill. He submitted that since the Customs Bill 2015 is indispensable for the progress of the country's economy, the National Assembly adopted the Bill during the seventh session of the second Parliament and forwarded to the National Council. The National Council during its eighteenth session had deliberated on the Bill and forwarded to the National Assembly for re-deliberation with proposed changes to 33 sections.

Subsequently, during the deliberation on the 33 sections proposed by the National Council, the House approved 28 sections as in Annexure 6 as forwarded by the National Council. The House, however, could not reach consensus on the following five sections:

1. Section 30 contravenes the provisions of the Constitution and the Public Finance (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2012, for alteration of taxes should be kept confidential and the consultation is not in line with the international best practices as it would jeopardize the efficient implementation.

2. On the provision proposed by the National Council as ‘Customs duty shall not be levied on goods imported into Bhutan in accordance with bilateral or multilateral agreements signed by Royal Government of Bhutan’, some Members submitted that it should be done according to the Agreement, while others submitted that, although the Council’s proposal can be approved, some revision on the text needs to be done, along with the text of section 48 (3) which is related to the same provision.
3. If an appellant need not pay penal interest of 24 percent per annum along with the disputed amount in Section 154 as proposed by the National Council, this would encourage the public to exempt from paying taxes by making appeals and cause loss to the Government.
4. Moreover, although the House backed the new section ‘Allowances, benefits and other emoluments’ as proposed by the National Council, the House found the need for revision on the text.

Subsequently after adopting 28 sections out of 33 sections forwarded by the National Council and since the two Houses could not reach consensus to the above mentioned 5 clauses, the House resolved to submit the disputed clauses to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for deliberation in the Joint Sitting. **26th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to the 25th November 2016.**

18. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Income Tax (Repeal of Certain Provisions) Bill of Bhutan 2016 (Money Bill)

In adherence to Article 13 (2) of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan and section 46 (a) under Chapter 4 of the Public Finance (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2012, the Minister for Finance introduced the Income Tax (Repeal of Certain Provisions) Bill of Bhutan 2016, as a Money Bill on 14th of November 2016. Since the bill was referred to the Finance Committee for its review as per section 240 of the National Assembly (Amendment) Act 2014, after having intensive consultations with relevant ministries, agencies and banks, the chairperson of the Committee, the Member from Wamrong constituency submitted the Committee's recommendation to completely exempt the tax on interest income from fixed deposits as proposed by the Ministry of Finance.

Subsequently, during the deliberation, most of the Members submitted that along with the exemption of tax on interests income from fixed deposits, the House submitted for exemption of tax on agricultural machinery, spare parts of tractors, cash crops, import of seeds apart from India and on plastics used for greenhouses in order to promote agriculture and dairy products. The House also recommended for the repeal of subsection 4.2 (e) of chapter 2 under part III of the Income Tax Act of Bhutan 2011 since it is also related to tax on cash crops.

On contrary, some Members reminded that, it would be difficult to re-introduce taxes once it is exempted. It was submitted that tax is an important source of revenue for the state and also essential for the economy. If the taxes were exempted, it would be difficult to sustain continued pursuit of economic development in the country.

Moreover, it was also submitted that the exemption of taxes by the government on small rural enterprises hampered the equity in the society and now if the government exempts tax on the interest income from fixed deposits, it would broaden the gap between the rich and poor. This may encourage misappropriation in the use of money like in other countries.

On this, one of the Members sought justification from the Minister for Finance regarding the decrease in the national reserve fund from 35 billion to 29 billion in the year 2014-2015. The government did not approve the recommendation to increase the tax slab to 30 percent for the top income earners during the revision of personal income tax in the previous year. Submission was made that the Income Tax Act altogether may become redundant given the Government exempting tax on interests income from fixed deposits and if the Income Tax Act of Bhutan 2011 is altered with in every session.

Likewise, the Member also submitted that, the provision under subsection 9.3 of chapter 3 under part III of the Income Tax Act of Bhutan 2001, which states that, “no tax shall be imposed up to Nu. 10,000” should be kept unaltered and if the government desires not to impose taxes, the government should exempt taxes on agricultural machinery and seeds or otherwise it would be wiser if the taxes are not fully exempted but the threshold of Nu.10,000 raised to higher appropriate level.

On this, the Ministers and the Chairperson of the Committee clarified that the exemption of tax on interest income from fixed deposits will not only facilitate the economy of the county but also benefit the civil servants and people in the lower income bracket. They further

submitted that since there are more imports than exports in the country, this would help to increase the export base.

Similarly, they submitted that, if the Bhutanese residing and working abroad could deposit foreign currencies in the banks within the country, there is a scope to boost the economy of the country through more loans and credits.

Since the review and consultation works are in process with the Ministry of Agriculture and Forests regarding the exemption of taxes on agricultural machineries, submission was made that, the review report will be presented to the House for approval very soon.

Moreover, submission was also made that, the House need not worry about the Income Tax Act becoming redundant on account of exempting tax on interests income from fixed deposits. It was reported that not every clauses of the Act are being repealed here. Further, they submitted that the taxes on small rural enterprises are exempted in order to reduce rural-urban migration and also to improve the living standard of the public and to provide employment opportunities in the rural areas.

On this, few Members submitted that, the import of goods is promoted with trade fairs held almost every year. During the trade fairs, most of the dealers are from other countries, for which the Government should prioritize in having Bhutanese dealers from within the country. If the Government is going to present the review report on the taxes related to agricultural machineries very soon, a submission was made to defer the matter on the exemption of taxes on interests income from fixed deposits to be discussed at a later date along with the review report.

Subsequently, the Minister for Finance submitted that although the organization of trade fair is not a new event instituted by the present government, however, the ministry would brief the government after consulting with the Ministry of Economic Affairs. Regarding the suggestion to defer the exemption of taxes on interest income from fixed deposits, since it is principally different from the agricultural taxes, the Minister made the submission to the House to support the proposal presented by the Ministry of Finance during the present session.

Eventually, when the proposal of Ministry of Finance and the recommendations from the Finance Committee were put before the House to support by show of hands, having the simple majority of the House in favour, the bill was kept to be adopted on 29th of November 2016 in accordance with the due legislative procedure of the House.

The House was adjourned after reminding the Government to consider and act on the suggestions made by the House regarding the exemption of taxes on agricultural machinery and seeds, and to present a report which would benefit the farmers and the dealers. **29th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to the 28th November 2016.**

On 30th Day of the 9th month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to the 29th of November 2016, the Member In-Charge of the Bill in his motion to adopt the Income Tax (Repeal of Certain Provisions) Bill of Bhutan 2016 as a Money Bill, the Minister for Finance submitted that, besides the promotion of the country's economy and facilitation of exports, the House must give proper consideration on the saving and income of the Bhutanese people in lower income bracket. He also proposed for the adoption of the recommendation to

exempt the tax on income exceeding Nu. 10,000 of interest income from fixed deposits.

Therefore, when the Bill was put to vote, out of 42 Members present and voting, 39 Members voted “Yes” while 2 Members voted “No” and one Member abstained. The House adopted the Income Tax (Repeal of Certain Provisions) Bill of Bhutan 2016 as a Money Bill with the majority support. **The voting result is provided in Annexure 7.**

Before adjournment, the Opposition Leader submitted that, although the current intent of the government toward promoting the economy and helping the banks through exemption of taxes will be useful, in the long run, the government should be mindful of the country’s objectives to realize self sufficiency and social equity in the society including the norms of paying the taxes. He further submitted that, the intent of the government could have been met through raise of threshold level for exemption of taxes on interest income from fixed deposits from Nu. 10,000 under subsection 9.3 of chapter 3 under part III of the Income Tax Act of Bhutan 2001, and leaving the rest of the provisions unaltered.

19. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the Financial Year 2016-2017

As per Article 13.2 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan and section 57 (b) and 57 (e) of Chapter 4 of the Public Finance (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2012, the Minister for Finance introduced the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the Financial Year 2016-2017 as a Money Bill on 14th of November 2016. Since the bill was referred to Finance Committee for review as per section 240 of the

National Assembly (Amendment) Act 2014, the Deputy Chairperson of the Finance Committee, the Member from Kengkhar-Weringla constituency presented the report based on the committee's consultation held with the relevant ministries and agencies.

The report stated that the main objective behind proposing supplementary budget of Nu. 262.808 Million was in pursuit of maintaining the unemployment rate below 2.5 percent by the end of the 11th Five Year Plan. The objective was intended to be met by creating jobs for 4,139 youths through direct employment schemes, overseas employment programme and development of handicraft sector. The Committee presented the following recommendations:

1. The Ministry to prioritize appropriate programmes for creation of jobs.
2. The Ministry to enhance employability skills of job seekers and to raise budget allocations for programmes such as the development of handicraft sector to create more jobs.

Subsequently during the deliberation, few Members led by the Opposition leader submitted that the proposed supplementary appropriation Bill is 30 percent of the proposed annual budget approved for the Ministry of Labour & Human Resources and therefore questioned as to why the project was not included in the annual plan since the amount is considerably high. In addition, they expressed their concerns as to how a project which was not included in the annual plan could be completed within 6 months time.

Furthermore, submission was made that although the budget is to be utilized for creating jobs in newly established corporations, however,

it was noted that some of the corporations are yet to be established only. They expressed that allocation of budget would be inappropriate in this case and therefore sought clarification on the status of those corporations yet to be established.

They submitted that the employment schemes of the government contravene some provisions of the Constitution. Since the employment scheme of the government is provisional, the employees will not be entitled to various benefits such as the allowance, pension, insurances and other benefits. The media has been covering that those on overseas employment are faced with difficulties in availing insurances and getting their pay in time, for which the submission was made that the government or the Ministry of Labour should consult the overseas employers and conduct thorough investigation. They further submitted that the government should consider permanent employment for those who are recruited on contract.

Further, they submitted that although giving opportunities to work in the Corporations are useful, however, they are concerned if the continuity could be maintained in the future, as the corporations are not established as a permanent office. Submission was made that if the budget is prioritized to be implemented in private sectors and industries, it would not only generate employment but also facilitate the economy of the country. They further submitted that, financing supplementary budget from the interests' income accrued from banks may not be appropriate. If the Government is obvious that the income will be generated, it is important for the government to project as domestic revenue in the budget report.

Thereby, the Cabinet Ministers submitted that since the unemployment

is a very challenging issue, in the beginning of 11th Five Year Plan, the Ministry of Labour prioritized to give employment in the agriculture related works, tourism, small, medium and micro enterprises, construction, power, industries and civil service. Moreover, they also submitted that the House need not worry about the continuity of the employment, since the employment scheme provides almost 95 percent of permanent jobs in the public corporations established after thorough investigation, with only one or two provisional corporations.

They further submitted that the overseas employment is a good programme, where the youths work in renowned enterprises and hotels under safe working conditions and they can be a regular employee if they aspire to continue their work there. Likewise, they submitted that, before sending the youths abroad for employment, the Ministry of Labour study and prepare a memorandum to be signed and issued proper guidelines and counseling. Further, they submitted that the Ministry had assigned the office of the Representative of Bhutan to the respective countries to settle any matters related to the youths employed there and the Ministry presents the assessment report of the overseas employees to the Government every three months.

Regarding the unconstitutionality of the Employment Schemes, they submitted that, it does not contravene any provision of the Constitution as the supplementary budget was proposed in line with the Article 13.2 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan and section 46 (a) of the Chapter 4 of the Public Finance (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2012. And submission was made that, although the supplementary appropriation budget of Nu. 262.808 Million has to be accounted in income in the Budget report, however, it does not amount to be income, since, during the Government's proposal of the Economic Stimulus Plan to inject

liquidity into the financial markets and revive growth in the economy, by injecting the money into banks on the interest rate of 6%, the Royal Monetary Authority agreed to conserve the interest earned to be used during the times of liquidity crunch in the economy in future. They also submitted that, it was kept to be allocated to institutions like Business Opportunity and Information Centre.

Eventually, when the recommendation made by the Finance Committee after reviewing Finance Ministry's proposal to navigate the unemployment issue by proposing a supplementary appropriation budget for financial year 2016-2017 of Nu. 262.808 Million was put before the House to secure support through show of hands, having the simple majority of the House in favor, the House was adjourned with the reminder that the bill will be adopted on 29th of November 2016 in accordance with the due legislative procedure of the House. **29th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to the 28th November 2016.**

The Minister In-charge for the Bill, the Minister for Finance presented the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the Financial Year 2016-2017 for adoption on the 29th November, 2016 corresponding with the 30th Day of the 9th Month of the Male Monkey Year. The Minister submitted that the total budget for the Financial Year 2016-2017 was Nu.55,091.036 Million after adding up of the Supplementary Budget amount of Nu.262.808 million to the earlier approved total budget of Nu. 54,828.228 Million for the Financial Year 2016-2017 by the House. He further submitted that Hon'ble Members should wisely analyze and vote for the adoption of the Bill, since the Supplementary Appropriation Budget was sought to address the unemployment issue in the country.

Accordingly, while voting on the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the Financial Year 2016-17, it was adopted by the majority of the Members; whereby 39 voted “Yes”, 2 voted “No”, one remained “Abstain” from 42 Members present during the voting. **The voting result is provided in the Annexure 8.**

Subsequently, the Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that the government’s plan to address the unemployment issue through the means of Supplementary Budget Appropriation was not appropriate. He submitted that the youths would not be provided with a regular job opportunity as the jobs planned in the programmes were to be temporary in nature. Further, he submitted that the government should spend the money judiciously. He submitted that he could not support the bill since he was skeptical about the effective utilization of the budget within a period of six months. Jobs were to be provided in corporations but new corporations had not been instituted yet. He also submitted that the job opportunities were mostly provided in India under the overseas employment scheme which does not befit its name. He submitted that the huge amount invested for the scheme does not benefit our youths since the youths who were paid less, and working in poor environments in hotels and enterprises. He submitted that a total of eleven thousand youths will be provided employment opportunities abroad including an addition of seven thousand youths against the plan of injecting Nu. 400 million in the 2017-18 financial year as reported in the news paper. It was submitted that the youths should be sent to work in more conducive environment, and given a more qualitative jobs while planning on such overseas employment programmes. The Member expressed that he could not render his

support to the bill on the abovementioned grounds. The deliberation thus concluded on the bill.

20. Resolution on the Re-deliberation of the Civil Aviation Bill 2015

The Member In-Charge of the bill, the Minister for Information and Communications presented the Civil Aviation Bill 2015 for adoption. The bill was presented for re-deliberation in the National Assembly with inputs and alterations made to 30 clauses during the 18th Session of the National Council. The bill was referred to the National Council by the National Assembly after deliberating in its 7th Session.

He submitted that the clauses proposed for amendment by the National Council were deemed acceptable while consulting with the relevant agencies. He also submitted that the four new recommendations submitted by the audit team from the International Civil Society Organization in the Annual Financial Audit were also legitimate. He further submitted that it would be beneficial if the bill could be adopted in this Session, whereby the International Civil Society Organization is planning to do a thorough internal auditing in June, 2016 as they have done internal auditing on Acts, Rules and Procedures in 2006.

While deliberating on each clause as provided in the **Annexure 9**, some Members opined that the “Director General” should be kept as “Director General” as per the international norms rather than putting it as “Head of the Authority” as put forward by the National Council for re-deliberation in the second clause of the General category. To this, the Member In-Charge submitted that it should not be confused since the clarification was provided in the definition separately.

However, a Member submitted that section 2 under definition has been revised well by the National Council. Thus, Section 33 under definition should be removed as section 2 under definition would suffice. The Speaker expressed regrets on inconsistent views submitted and reminded the House to think wisely and support the bill. He said that the bill may have to be deferred by another six month due to disagreement on just one clause as per the Legislative Rules of Procedure. The deliberation concluded with the house supporting the comprehensive Clauses submitted by the National Council for re-deliberation. **29th Day of the 9th Month of Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 29th November, 2016.**

Accordingly, the Member In-Charge, the Minister for Information and Communications as per the Legislative Rules of Procedure submitted the Bhutan Civil Aviation Bill 2015 for Adoption on the 30th November, 2016 corresponding with the 1st Day of the 10th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year. Subsequently, all 37 Members present during the voting voted “Yes” and adopted the Bhutan Civil Aviation Bill 2015. **The voting result is provided in the Annexure 10. 1st Day of the 10th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 30th November, 2016.**

21. Question Hour: Group A- Questions asked to the Prime Minister, Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs, and Minister for Information and Communications

The Speaker informed that the question hour will be the first agenda of the business order for the day. He also informed that for the day’s question, there were eight questions in total of which six questions were for oral reply and two questions were for written response. He further informed the House that an opportunity will be given to ask a

supplementary question after answering every question. The session commenced with the Speaker informing that an opportunity will be given to ask supplementary questions at the end subject to availability of time.

1. The Member from Nyisho-Sepchu Constituency questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the plans and programmes to train the newly elect local leaders on etiquette, since it is of paramount importance to train the local leaders on our culture decorum as the country was known for.
2. The Opposition Leader questioned the Prime Minister on the reasons for closing down the Business Opportunity and Information Centre (BOIC) and coming up with the new Rural Enterprise Development Corporation limited (REDCL), since the two have the same mandates despite a change in the nomenclature. He also asked about the differences between the BOIC and REDCL. He further questioned the Prime Minister on the justification and reason for taking a stand that establishment of BOIC was not illegal.
3. The Member from Bumdeling-Jamkhar Constituency questioned the Minister for Information and Communications to provide on the reasons as to why many journalists are resigning from the Bhutan Broadcasting Service Corporation Limited lately, since such resignation of many experienced journalists has become a matter of concern for the nation. He further asked the Minister on the government's support and interventions to retain such experienced journalists in the future.

4. The Member from Drameedtse-Ngatshang Constituency questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the measures to address the problem faced by the Indian tourists at the Phuentsholing border gate, where they have to wait for long hours to get a road permit. He further asked the Minister on what the government is doing to control the influx of regional tourists coming into the country annually.
5. The Member from Panbang Constituency questioned the Prime Minister confirm whether debt stock is rising or falling down, trade balance improving or worsening and unemployment situation in the country. He mentioned that the unemployment problem had worsened; debt stock has increased and the economic base is depleting in reality, although the nation was informed that the economy has improved by the Prime Minister. He further asked what measures and strategy the government is putting in place henceforth, if the aforementioned issues were true.
6. The Member from Khamed-Lunana Constituency questioned the Minister for Information and Communications on the possibility to provide subsidy to the people in Lunana for transporting necessary goods like corrugated sheet, as the people in Lunana were immensely benefited by the free transportation of the patients and 50% subsidy for hiring of helicopters.

Note: Answers and deliberations for the abovementioned questions are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.

22. Convention

22.1 Resolution on the motion to adopt the Agreement on Trade, Commerce and Transit between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of Republic of India.

The Member In-Charge of the Agreement, the Minister for Economic Affairs presented the Agreement on Trade, Commerce and Transit signed between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of Republic of India for adoption. He submitted that the existing Agreement had expired on the 29th July, 2016 and it had now been revised for the fourth time. The Agreement was revised in 1983, 1990, 1995 and 2016 and was first signed by His Royal Highness Prince Namgyel Wangchuck and the Ambassador of India to Bhutan Shri B.S. Das on the 17th January, 1972.

The Agreement signed by Bhutan's Economic Affairs Minister, Lyonpo Lekey Dorji and India's Minister of State for Commerce and Industry, Shri Nirmala Sitharaman for next ten years on 12th November, 2016 was the fifth revision of the trade Agreement. He submitted that the Agreement entailed the rights and provisions of Bhutan to transport goods to other countries through India and the free trade and commerce between the two countries. He also submitted that Bhutan's trade and commerce had improved drastically and had benefited Bhutan in understanding fundamental strategies in fostering business partnership with other countries due to free trade and commerce with India heretofore.

It was also submitted that the bilateral Agreement would help Bhutan in improving business procedurals with other countries and also in transporting goods. Similarly, he moved the motion to support and

adopt the Agreement for it would help Bhutan in transporting goods within Bhutan through Indian states.

On this, the Member from Nyisho-Sepchu constituency recommended the House to adopt the Agreement as the previous Agreement which has been revised would aid a land-locked country like Bhutan in transporting goods to other countries through India. The House with a show of hands agreed to deliberate on the Agreement.

Subsequently, the Member In-Charge of the Agreement, the Minister for Economic Affairs submitted that there were a total of 12 clauses in the Agreement including one new clause added to the earlier 11 clauses in the previous Agreement. He submitted that out of 12 clauses in the Agreement, only 2 clauses were altered and 9 clauses were kept as it is. He further submitted that few alterations and incorporations were made in some protocols of the Agreement.

On this, the Member from Lamgong-Wangchang constituency submitted that the Opposition Party supports the Agreement given its benefits. Some Members submitted that the people of Panbang and Nganglam have difficulty due to lengthy distance since the entry and exit and entrance gate nearpoints through Panbang and Nganglam were not reflected in the five new entry and exit points in the protocol. Moreover, some Members asked when the Royal Bhutanese Consulate office would be opened in Guwahati, Assam as announced by the government.

Furthermore, the government opined that it is imperative to prioritize on agriculture productivity to avert food shortage in the near future. The government was also asked to clarify whether or not the list of necessary

goods was in line with Section 7 of Article 14 of the Constitution. It was imperative for the government to prioritize agriculture related products to be exported and asked what measures were being taken for the transportation of perishable and non-perishable goods.

On this, the Minister for Foreign Affairs clarified that a special measure should be explored when it comes to perishable goods. He also informed that the government was waiting for response from the Indian government and the government of the state concerned pertaining to establishment of the Royal Bhutanese Consulate in Guwahati. The Minister for Economic Affairs submitted that the government has been providing loans with low interest rates and power-tillers and many more to augment the agriculture produces in the country. He further submitted that the government has been providing necessary goods like cereal, milk, flour, dry fish and many more at a subsidized rate.

Accordingly, while deliberating on each page in the Agreement, the Member from Panbang constituency submitted that the government and the Ministry of Economic Affairs should work hard to reduce import and enhance export in the country. He also submitted that the government should prepare a good policy on economic management for the country and informed that the trade fairs organized in the country had caused huge loss to the Bhutanese business community. He further submitted that the trade fairs should be organized outside Bhutan by the government to enhance export of local goods rather than organizing it in the country.

On this, the Minister for Economic Affairs submitted that the plans were in place to send local goods to be sold in trade fairs in other countries which would boost export. This initiative and the rules pertaining to

it were in progress. He also submitted that there is a policy in place which demands people to use locally produced construction materials to drastically reduce imports of construction materials into the country.

Subsequently, the House adopted the Agreement on 5th December, 2016 as per the Legislative Rules of Procedure and there was no dissenting opinion on the Agreement. The deliberation thus concluded. **1st Day of the 10th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 30th November, 2016.**

The Minister for Foreign Affairs, representing the Member In-Charge of the Bill who was the Minister for Information and Communications presented the Agreement for adoption following thorough deliberation on the 5th December, 2016 corresponding with the 6th Day of the 10th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year. The deliberation concluded with the adoption of the Agreement on the Trade, Commerce and Transit between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of Republic of India with all Members voting ‘Yes’ out of the 43 Members present during the voting. **The voting result is provided in Annexure 11. 6th Day of the 10th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 5th December, 2016.**

22.2 Resolution on the re-deliberation of the Motor Vehicle Agreement between Bhutan, Bangladesh, India and Nepal for the transportation of Cargo and people.

The Member In-Charge, the Minister for Information and Communications presented the 15 reservations made by the National Council during its 18th Session on the Motor Vehicle Agreement between Bhutan, Bangladesh, India and Nepal for transportation of

cargo and people. The Agreement was transmitted to the National Council after the National Assembly adopted it during its 7th Session.

While deliberating on each reservation made, the Minister for Foreign Affairs and some Members submitted that the government had consulted the Legislative Committee of the National Council, officials of the relevant agencies and corporations and business community. Other stakeholders like tourism council, truck drivers' association and taxi association within Bhutan were also consulted on the Agreement.

Moreover, some Members expressed their concerns on the risks it would pose to the drivers whose livelihood is dependent on transport industry in the country. Concerns were also expressed on the harm it would cause to the environment, culture, security and sovereignty of the country with the influx of vehicles and people once the Agreement is adopted. The government on this responded that there will be an opportunity to review and improve to address the problems and inconveniences once the Agreement is submitted to the House for adoption. This could be done by reflecting the issues in the protocol to be drawn after thorough consultation among four member countries on how to implement the Agreement.

Similarly, the government clarified on the reservation made by the National Council about the government's failure in seeking legal opinion from the legal advisor prior to the signing of the Agreement. It was informed that the government had sought legal opinion of the Attorney General in July, 2013 through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Regarding the concern about the Agreement being pushed by foreign agencies, the government responded that the welfare of the people and security and sovereignty of the country were taken into consideration while formulating and preparing any policy in the country.

However, it was submitted that the inclusion of the SASEC agency of the Asia Development Bank will not have any threat to the security and sovereignty of the country since it was included as a donor agency for the implementation and monitoring of the Agreement.

It was also submitted that the Agreement would present a pleasant opportunity for Bhutan in trade, commerce and economic development both for the present and future generations. Bhutan being a developing country needs to engage with the neighboring countries in terms of trade, commerce, economic and related issues. It was further submitted that the Agreement should be accorded support for it will provide a platform to monitor and control foreign vehicles movement in the country.

Furthermore, it was submitted that there will be rooms to address the concerns and challenges associated with the Agreement as the protocols would be required to be prepared once the Agreement between the four countries was ratified. It was highlighted that the endorsement and adoption of the Agreement by the House will not create any inconvenience.

However, some Members opined that the signing and implementing the Agreement amongst the four countries would defeat the principle of the South Asian Regional Corporation Association, since the core principle of instituting South Asian Regional Corporation Association was to foster corporation amongst the South Asian nations through peace and harmony. Some Members also opined that it would be better if the government could take some time to do comprehensive research and rigorous consultation with the agencies, corporations, private sector and the general public.

Moreover, it was submitted that the government had not held consultation with the general public as pointed out by the National Council. The National Council had also mentioned that they do not agree with the government's assurance to address the concerns and challenges as raised by some of the Members through formulation of the Protocol. They submitted that the protocol would not cover all the issues and some aspects of the Agreement need not have to be implemented as per the protocol. It was also reminded that there was no mention for the requirement of the protocol in the Agreement. Some Members submitted that they were of the opinion that there would be a situation demanding to adopt the protocol in the future once the Agreement is adopted.

Similarly, some Members opined that it would be wiser and beneficial if emphasis could be put more on the agreements related to hydropower and technology. Some Members submitted that the government was of the view that there would be implications in trade if the Agreement was not signed. It was also reminded that there were separate trade agreements between the South Asian nations and thus it was hoped that the government would work considering the future benefits.

Toward this, the government submitted that the signing of the Agreement does not impede on the peace prevailing in the South Asian region as there exist trends of such practices concerning sub regional agreements. The government also submitted that the Agreement would only result in benefits. It was urged that the Members should consider that it was not possible for the government to hold consultations with each and every people on the Agreement. The government further solicited the supports of the members on the Agreement bearing in mind the welfare

of the people and nation since the Members were the representatives of the people in the House.

Likewise, the Prime Minister submitted that a protocol will be prepared including two separate provisions for cargo and commuters for implementation of the Agreement once it is adopted. He also informed that the government has decided to defer the talk with Nepal and Bangladesh on the Agreement. He further submitted that on the transit between Bhutan and India, it was discussed that the existing procedure should be followed. He also informed the House that the Agreement will provide an opportunity to address the problems in controlling and managing foreign vehicles coming into the country. Furthermore, the Prime Minister solicited the support of the House to adopt the Agreement in good faith as the Agreement would benefit and provide opportunities for whoever comes to form the government.

It was resolved that the Agreement would be submitted to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for the Royal Assent to be deliberated in the Joint-Sitting of the Parliament. **6th Day of the 10th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 5th December, 2016.**

23. Joint Sitting's resolution on the Financial Audit Report of the Public Accounts Committee

As per the directives of the Speaker, the Secretary General read out the Royal Kasho granted by His Majesty for convention of the Joint Sitting. Following this, the Speaker informed that the two performance audit reports namely the Audit on Information and Technology in Public Expenditure Management Systems 2016 and Joint Performance Audit 2016 for Punatshangchhu I would be considered as public documents

thereof. He further informed that the two audit reports would be referred to the Public Accounts Committee as per the Rules of Procedure of the PAC to be deliberated in the ninth Session. **The Royal Assent is provided in Annexure 12.**

The Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee, the Member from Kabji-Talog constituency presented the report to the House on the Synthesis of the Annual Audit Report 2015, Follow Up on the Resolutions of the 6th Session of the Second Parliament, Review Report from 2009-2014, and the Status of cases forwarded to the Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC). Furthermore, the Chairperson also reported on the PAC hearings and PAC recommendations, where the House deliberated extensively on each chapter.

1) Synthesis of the Annual Audit Report 2015

Deliberating on the report, the Members submitted that as per the Annual Financial Statement, there was an underutilization of Nu. 4,193.365 million against the revised capital budget of Nu. 19,637.170 million approved by the House for the Financial Year 2014-15. The Members sought clarifications from the government on the underutilization of such budget as it was a matter of serious concern.

Clarifying on the underutilization of the budget, the government informed that the plans needed to be formulated after adjustments were made to budget. Moreover, capital budget were mainly focused on construction works which required architectural drawings and tendering processes to be followed. In addition, the activities were time consuming and there were seasonal working schedules due to unfavorable weather conditions. Similarly, the bids quoted by the contractors were usually below 20-30 percent from the estimated costs,

whereby the government saves the surplus budget. Since the capital budgets were mainly supported by the donor projects, it was reported that the issue should not be of concern.

Some Members submitted that while awarding tender works to the contractors, the award should not be given to the lowest bidder in order to ensure quality works. Furthermore, it would be better not to allow those bidders who had quoted 10 percent higher or lower from the estimated cost while tendering. Submission was also made that the Government should explore means to reduce the underutilization of budget.

On the resolved and unresolved Irregularities, few Members submitted that numerous irregularities arise not from the ministries and corporations but from the individuals who emigrated from the country. Therefore, it was imperative for the government to ensure that no objection certificates are furnished while processing for travel documents, or come up with measures to seize the properties of those individuals in order to restrict them from emigrating out of the country. Some Members also submitted that there were no other alternatives that could be considered as those cases were forwarded to the Anti-Corruption Commission, the Office of the Attorney General and the courts since majority of the irregularity cases were related to corruption.

Furthermore, one of the Members reported that if the irregularities forwarded to the Anti-Corruption Commission, the Office of the Attorney General and the courts are delayed, it would create problems to the people and the government. Thus, it was proposed that the Parliament should collaborate with agencies in order to solve the cases as soon as possible. With the support from some of the Members on the

proposal, it was submitted that the government should issue directives to the concerned institutions to expedite the cases at the earliest.

Toward this, the government clarified that directing different institutions on the matter could breach the separation of power among the three branches of the government. It was suggested that although the government cannot encroach into the Anti-Corruption Commission and Judiciary as they are independent bodies, the government could however remind the Office of the Attorney General to expedite the cases. In addition, some Members suggested that there are provisions in the Constitution which states that the State shall endeavor to provide justice through fair, transparent and expeditious process. And Parliament may, by law, establish impartial and independent administrative tribunals as well as alternative dispute settlement mechanism as per the provisions of the Constitution. Therefore, the proposal from the Parliament would not create any inconveniences to the three branches of the government, since the Judiciary also reminds the Parliament in similar way such as issuing writs on the tax matter in the past and also with regard to the establishment of Thromdes in the recent past.

However, some Members stated that separation of power does not mean that the three branches of the government cannot collaborate to resolve issues of national importance. It was imperative to have close collaboration among Judiciary, Legislative, Anti-Corruption Commission and the Office of the Attorney General in order to ensure justice in the society. Further, it was submitted that the Judiciary had been taking prompt actions on the irregularities appealed to the courts.

Since most of the cases of irregularities have been found with the Office of the Attorney General, it was opined that the Parliament should

direct that the cases of irregularities with the Office of the Attorney General should be resolved as soon as possible. On this, the committee Members clarified that such issues of concern were mentioned in the recommendations.

While deliberating on reports related to violation against the law, acts and rules, few Members pointed out that report on Rabten Engineering Workshop and related issues were not in detail. In this regard, the Chairperson and Deputy Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee while clarifying added that the reasons for including Rabten Engineering Workshop in the report were due to those irregularities found related to the Ministry of Information and Communications (MoIC). It was reported that there were about 94 such issues and the committee had clearly included in the recommendation for the need to resolve those issues as well.

Regarding the deliberation on the need to carry out audit for the hydropower projects in the previous session, it was reported that the first phase of audit has been carried out with three hydropower projects last year. While presenting the audit report, majority of the Members reported that as per the audit report, there was not even a single resolved irregularity for more than 500 million ngultrum. It was informed that such unresolved irregularities exist due to non-fixation of accountability to specific individuals.

Toward this, some Members suggested that the Public Accounts Committee and Royal Audit Authority should hold joint consultation to fix accountability. Members had also proposed that it was imperative to include clearly in the Parliament's recommendation on whom to fix accountability in the hydropower projects.

Deliberating on the recommendations of the Royal Audit Authority, majority of the Members accepted the recommendations and also recommended on the importance of supporting the audit in order to strengthen the institute for internal audit services. The Member from Panbang Constituency stated that a charter was issued in accordance with the provision of Section 23 (O) of the Public Finance Act by the Prime Minister which requires internal auditors to directly deal with the irregularities related to their agencies. However, he submitted that the Prime Minister cannot issue a charter, which is the sole prerogative of the Head of the State, Kings and Presidents only.

Moreover, it was submitted that Section 23 (O) of the Public Finance Act allows only preparation of guideline pertaining to internal auditing and there was no section allowing the issuance of a charter. The legal experts had also expressed that charter could be understood as law and a Prime Minister cannot issue a charter. Thus, submission was made that a clear system has to be ascertained hereafter whether or not such charters could be issued.

The Minister for Foreign Affairs submitted that high regard is accorded for the charter issued by the King, the Head of the State but the charter issued by the Prime Minister was a general “charter” without the word “Royal”. Citing an example, he expressed that it was like a charter of any organization and it should be interpreted liberally in order to prevent confusions. Besides, although the present charter had been drafted by financial experts from the Ministry of Finance, the government would revisit the charter.

The Speaker reminded the House that if the Prime Minister cannot issue a charter, the changes affected to the charter issued have to be

reported in the joint sitting in the near future. Similarly, if the Prime Minister could issue a charter, report should also be submitted on how such charters should be considered.

Similarly, some of the Members submitted that it would be advantageous if the present Procurement Rules and Regulations could be revised as an Act. The Finance Minister reported that the National Council had also recommended that the present procurement rules to be revised into an Act. As per the recommendation, the government would hold consultation with the financial experts and revisit on it. The Minister submitted that it would be better if the House could decide on submitting a report to the National Council on the feasibility of revising the present procurement rules into an Act. Following this, the Opposition Leader made a submission that as recommended by National Council, the government should study the recommendation and present a report thereof in the Ninth Session.

In this regard, the Speaker stated that if there was a need for a report to that effect, the government should forward that to the Public Accounts Committee. While ascertaining the support of the House on the proposal through a show of hands, the House could not secure the majority support. Thus, the House resolved on the submission made by the Minister for Finance.

A penalty of 24 percent was imposed on those who could not reimburse the advance taken before. The Members submitted that such practice caused problems to most government officials and private sectors alike, thus it should be revoked. To that, the committee members clarified that the penalty was imposed only when the advance taken is not reimbursed

within the time limit and therefore there was no issue on that. Other Members also supported in favour of the clarification provided.

2). Report on the Follow up of the Resolutions of the Sixth Session of the Second Parliament

While deliberating on the report, submission was made that while some ministries and agencies have implemented the resolutions of the Sixth Session of the Second Parliament, some have not implemented the resolution. Although the government could not respond in writing to the Public Accounts Committee, the government has been doing its best to resolve irregularities with respect to civil servants in the 20 Dzongkhags. Following that, the Speaker reminded that the Public Accounts Committee is a constitutional committee and it was imperative for the government and people to have high regard and trust for the PAC. Moreover, the ministries and agencies that have not implemented the resolutions of the Parliament should be reviewed by the cabinet, and a report to that effect should be submitted to the Public Accounts Committee. Therefore, it was resolved that the committee should accordingly submit an implementation report in the joint sitting of the ninth session.

3). Synthesis of Review Report for the Annual Audit Report 2009-2014

While deliberating on the Audit Report 2009-2014, it was reported that most of the unresolved irregularities were found with the Anti-Corruption Commission, the Office of the Attorney General and the courts. It was submitted that these issues had to be singled out and the long standing irregularities were either because the people involved were dead or because they had emigrated from the country. Further,

it was submitted that the Public Accounts Committee along with the Ministry of Finance, the Royal Monetary Authority and the Financial Audit Committee should come up with measures to write-off such long standing cases.

Following this, the House deliberated extensively on the seven recommendations submitted by the Public Accounts Committee. Submissions were made that the 3rd Recommendation stated that there are instances whereby officials accountable were transferred before clearing the audit observations, especially when they are implicated in direct or supervisory accountability. Thus, the recommendation stating that guidelines on audit clearance needs to be revisited was withdrawn. In addition, the House adopted six recommendations submitted by the Public Accounts Committee and one additional recommendation of the House as provided below:

1. The PAC endorsed the general recommendations made by the RAA and encourages all agencies (budgetary as well as non budgetary) to implement these recommendations.
2. Considering the observations made by the RAA and the unresolved amount, it is necessary for the Internal Auditors to play a more proactive role whereby they must follow up with their agencies to resolve the issues and work on developing preventive mechanisms.
3. Although the land leased by Government agencies are in line with the Rules and Regulations governing the lease of GRF, there is a need to clearly define the purpose of lease especially related to industrial and commercial.

4. The PAC in order to provide accurate information to the Parliament needs to know the exact status of cases related to audit irregularities referred to the ACC by the RAA and by the ACC or Agencies to the OAG. Therefore, both the ACC and the OAG need to update the PAC a month prior to the commencement of the session.
5. The 6th Session of the 2nd Parliament required all agencies to resolve audit irregularities pertaining to AAR 2009-2014 latest by 30th September 2016. While the PAC acknowledged that the irregularities referred to the ACC/OAG will be taken up by these agencies, the other unresolved irregularities be taken up seriously by heads of respective agencies by 30th March 2017. In case of failure to resolve within the stipulated time, the heads of the agencies would be held accountable.
6. With regard to irregularities in the hydropower project authorities, there is a lack of accountability fixation. Therefore, the RAA should reflect direct and supervisory accountability in the audit reports to expedite the resolving of irregularities.
7. The Ministry of Finance and the Gross National Happiness Commission should come up with measures to reduce underutilization of budgets and also to minimize underutilized funds.

As per the Rules of Procedure of the Joint Sitting, the House voted to ascertain the support on the recommendations. On that, out of 62 members present and voting, all 62 members voted in favour of the above recommendations and thus adopted the recommendations.

The Speaker extended words of appreciation to the Auditor General, officers and concerned staff of the Royal Audit Authority who helped the committee and also followed up for resolving irregularities in the country. **The voting result is provided in Annexure 13.**

Furthermore, the Speaker thanked the Chairperson and the Members of the Public Accounts Committee for conducting public hearings and submitting quality reports year after year. He also thanked the House for deliberating thoroughly on the issue and thus ensuring check and balance. He further thanked the chairperson and the members of the committee for achieving fruitful resolutions and thus concluded the deliberation on the Financial Audit Report. **8th Day of the 10th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year corresponding to 7th December 2016.**

24. Concluding Ceremony of the Eighth Session

24.1 Motion of Thanks

24.1.1 Motion by the Prime Minister

The Prime Minister expressed that there would be infinite submissions to be made if His Majesty's noble initiatives as a whole were to be expressed in the House. However, moving a motion of thanks for ten years of His Majesty's glorious reign, the Prime Minister made following submissions:

1. Country's independence and sovereignty

In the last ten years of glorious reign, His Majesty has not only strengthened the external and internal relations, but also the sovereignty and the security of the country. His Majesty has appointed heads of three Armed Forces and granted pay raise to the armed force personnel three times. Therefore, on behalf of the government, he offered gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

2. Natural Disaster Management

During the time of natural disasters in the country, His Majesty has personally visited all affected places and granted gracious *kidu* to the victims. His Majesty has also introduced *Dessung* programme for the welfare of the country and the people, which has been helpful during the time of disasters and also in managing crowds during various public events. He expressed gratitude of the government that the *Dessung* programme has been true representational of His Majesty.

3. Kidu

In the ten years of glorious reign, His Majesty has granted a total of 134,897 acres of land *kidu* to 111,899 people. His Majesty has also granted census *kidu* to total of 8,993 people and citizenship *kidu* to 6,079 people. A total of 2,660 students from disadvantaged families have been enrolled as Gyalpoi Tozey and 818 old aged people have been granted monthly living allowances. The Prime Minister also expressed his words of gratitude to His Majesty for construction of meditation centres at Wang Sisina and also for granting medical *kidu* for the welfare of the old aged citizens.

4. Good Governance

His Majesty has built strong foundation for democratic system of governance and thus Bhutan's democratic system has become an epitome of good governance to the world. The Prime Minister expressed his words of gratitude to His Majesty for introducing the Royal Institute for Governance and Strategic Studies (RIGSS) which has benefitted Bhutanese leaders in many great ways.

5. Spiritual Activities

In order to uphold and spread dharma in our country, His Majesty has increased the number of monks and also enhance their monthly entitlements by three folds. Within the last ten years, His Majesty has most graciously supported renovation and building of numerous Dzongs, Lhakhangs, Goendeys and choetens. Furthermore, His Majesty has also supported the construction of new Hindu temple and issued *kasho* to renovate the mandhir in the southern Dzongkhags for the welfare of Hindu religion as well.

6. Culture

His Majesty has always accorded high priority for the preservation and promotion of the Bhutanese culture and hence provided His leadership, guidance and wisdom. His Majesty has always been the true epitome for the Bhutanese in terms of promoting our national language, dress code, architecture, sports, etiquette and conduct. Therefore, the Prime Minister offered his words of gratitude to His Majesty for exemplifying and promoting the Bhutanese culture.

7. Natural Environment

Under the noble leadership of His Majesty, Bhutan has 72 percent of the land under forest cover, with 52 percent as reserved parks and protected areas. It has not only benefitted Bhutan but also the world at large. Hence, the foreigners have has always kept high regard and appreciations to our country in terms of environmental conservation. In order to preserve sustainable natural environment, His Majesty has started “Bhutan for Life”, a trust fund which will be beneficial and therefore offered gratitude to His Majesty for this noble initiative.

8. Economy

Under the dynamic leadership of His Majesty, Bhutan's economy has grown consistently beyond the expectation. In the last ten years, Bhutan's Gross Domestic Product has increased to Ngultrum 154 billion at present, from Ngultrum 40 billion in 2006. Hydropower plants have been increased to four with total revenue of Ngultrum 7,052 million at present, from three hydropower plants and total revenue of Ngultrum 3,089 million in 2006. Moreover, it was reported that the ongoing construction of five hydropower plants would generate huge revenue after its completion. Thus, the Prime Minister expressed his words of gratitude to His Majesty.

9. Reducing Corruption

Bhutan has been ranked 27th least corrupt country among 157 countries in 2015. This was possible because of His Majesty's deep concerns and His constant and noble reminder to the people not to tolerate corruption and corrupt practices.

10. Glorious Reign of the Wangchuck Dynasty

The Institution of monarchy is a symbol of unity and founding pillar for Bhutan. Wangchuck dynasty is the most precious and inviolable gem of Bhutan. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo's royal wedding with Her Majesty the Gyaltseen Jetsun Pema Wangchuck had bestowed the people of Bhutan with the royal birth of His Royal Highness the Gyalsey. This gift has been wish fulfilling for the people of Bhutan. The year was historic and extraordinary for the world to have witnessed three generations of successive monarchs in a single period.

Lastly, His Majesty has strived tirelessly day and night for the security and sovereignty of the country. Therefore, on behalf of the people

of Bhutan, the Prime Minister expressed his words of gratitude to His Majesty. He submitted that the people would continue to serve under the wise reign of His Majesty for all times. The Prime Minister prayed for long lives of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo and His Royal Highness the Gyalsey and to remain eternal as the protectors of Bhutan and the Bhutanese people. Prayers were also offered that the rays of Gross National Happiness to flourish forever on the people of Bhutan.

24.1.2 Motion by the Chairperson of the National Council Dr. Sonam Kinga

The 10th of October marked the completion of ten years of the glorious reign of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo on the golden throne. The royal reign has reached its tenth anniversary complimenting the noble attributes of His Majesty which is getting nobler unaffected by impediments. Ever since the handing over of royal reign by His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, royal initiatives and achievements had surpassed one's expectations. Therefore, on this auspicious occasion, on behalf of the National Council and all the people of Bhutan, he expressed his gratitude based on five aspects.

In the last hundred and eight years, many conflicts and turmoil occurred in the region. During such time, due to the good fortune of the people, the Institution of monarchy with Wangchuck dynasty was established. Thus, even when the world was facing turmoil, Bhutan had managed to maintain and strengthen sovereignty despite its small size. Such was the country which was handed over to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo. Moreover, in the last ten years of His Majesty's reign, the seed of perpetual sovereignty has been sown not only for the present generation but also for the future generation.

Similarly, submission was made that His Majesty has built and renovated many Dzongs, Lhakhangs, Goendeys, contributed Ku-Sung-Thug-Ten. His Majesty has also personally meditated at Paro Taktshang, Chari Monastery and Dorji Dhen and therefore offered gratitude to His Majesty for making the people fortunate to witness in true self and being epitome for the people of Bhutan.

The Chairperson expressed that His Majesty has always inspired the people during the national day celebrations, official gatherings and even in the Parliament through farsighted vision for the country. His Majesty has also guided with the long term objectives for our country from the Golden Throne. Hence, there is a flow of uniformity and oneness when planning the five year plan.

It was submitted that the emergence of democracy in Bhutan is solely from the successive monarchs of the Wangchuck dynasty and thus the people of Bhutan regard that as the precious gift from the golden throne. The Chairperson expressed his words of gratitude to His Majesty for supporting and strengthening the vital institutions of the democratic system.

Furthermore, the Chairperson offered gratitude to His Majesty submitting that the bills and conventions which have been passed by the Parliament in the last nine years have been approved through Royal Assent. It was informed that not even single bill and agreement has been left unapproved. His Majesty has also imparted words of wisdom and guidance on the need to reinforce collaborations among various institutions and agencies for achieving our common national goals and objectives.

In conclusion, on the most joyous occasion of the tenth year of His Majesty's reign, the Chairperson offered prayers for long lives to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, Her Majesty the Gyaltshen, His Royal Highness the Gyalsey, His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, Members of the Royal Family and to remain them eternal as the protectors of Bhutan.

24.1.3. Motion by the Member from Lamgong -Wangchang Constituency Khandu Wangchuk from the Opposition Party

The Member expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the Opening and Closing Ceremony of the Parliament and addressing profound words of wisdom on the present and future aspirations and priorities to the Members of the Parliament.

Moreover, he submitted that year 2016 was indeed extraordinary as it was the year for commemorating three joyous occasions. The people of Bhutan were still enjoying blissful period with the Royal Birth of His Royal Highness the Gyalsey. It was also a symbol of prosperity and happiness in the country.

He offered gratitude to His Majesty for always ensuring peace and security and also granting continued kidu to the needy ones. His Majesty has granted support and security during the times of deaths all times and for all affected people. Hence, the people of Bhutan always continue to respect and revere His Majesty as the true pillar of the country, people's king and a true guardian.

The Member submitted that from the day that His Majesty has ascended on the Golden Throne, His Majesty has taken oath to serve as the true parent and true son to the Bhutanese. His Majesty has personally visited

all corners of the country and granted land, citizen and numerous kidu to the people of Bhutan. In the last ten years, His Majesty has strengthened security, sovereignty and stability of the country. On behalf of the People and the Opposition Party, he expressed his deep gratitude to His Majesty for the blissful and most inspiring leadership.

Finally, with the protecting deities of the Pelden Drukpa and under the wise guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, he offered prayers for the Bhutanese economy to boom and flourish benefiting the people of Bhutan. He also offered prayers for the long lives of His Majesty, Members of the Royal Family, and prayers to remain as the protectors for all times to come. The Member also expressed unwavering faith and loyalty to serve His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the country.

24.2 Concluding Speech of the Hon'ble Speaker

On behalf of the Members of Parliament and on his own behalf, Hon'ble Speaker welcomed and expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the Closing Ceremony of the Eighth Session.

The Speaker also welcomed Her Majesty the Gyaltuen, Members of the Royal Family, representatives of the Central Monastic Body, senior government officials, representatives of the international community and all the people who have come to witness the occasion.

The Speaker expressed that the Closing Ceremony of the Eighth Session was indeed an extraordinary one as it exactly coincided with the tenth Anniversary of His Majesty's glorious reign. Therefore, it was a very opportune and a historic moment to have the Closing Ceremony on this special day.

The Speaker said that His Majesty had visited all the remote communities

and met with the people of 205 Gewogs in Twenty Dzongkhags and granted land, plots and resolved census issues. His Majesty had also personally visited the areas affected by natural disasters and met with the affected people and granted *kidu* to the victims. Furthermore, His Majesty has also visited numerous schools and shared words of wisdom to the teachers and students. Similarly, religious bodies have carried out renovation and construction of Dratshangs, Lhakhangs, Chortens, Goendeys and Dzongs. It was submitted that under the noble leadership of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, two Parliamentary elections and two Local Government Elections have been successfully conducted.

The Speaker expressed that the auspicious birth of His Royal Highness the Gyalsey Jigme Namgyel Wangchuck is a precious gift from Their Majesties to the people as the people observed three extremely significant occasions in the country. The Royal birth has espoused the perpetuity of the Wangchuck dynasty, fulfilled the aspiration of the people and would secure the nation and ensure continued peace and happiness of the Bhutanese people. The year has further provided an opportunity for the people to pay tribute to the successive monarchs.

The Speaker informed that the Prime Minister of Bhutan Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay was conferred “*Lungmar Kabney*” on 17th of December, 2014 by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for fervently serving the government and people of Bhutan with dedication and humility. He also said that the Prime Minister has been ranked among the top 50 leaders in the world following his remarkable TED Talk held in Vancouver, Canada. The Speaker informed that Prime Minister Tshering Tobgay has also received “German Sustainability Award 2016”. Such awards received by the Prime Minister were mainly attributable to

the farsighted leadership of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo and His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the royal guidance received in formulating noble policies and strategies such as good governance. Hence, on behalf of the Parliament, the Speaker expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo and His Majesty the Druk Gylpo.

The Parliament also thanked His Holiness the Je Khenpo and venerable Lopens of the Central Monastic Body for initiating and conducting prayers and rituals for the well-being of the people, and averting and preventing misfortunes and natural disasters in the country.

The Speaker reported that under the patronage of Her Royal Highness, Princess Sonam Dechan Wangchuck, Bhutan National Legal Institute has initiated numerous activities. One such activity included the conduct of training on “Internal dispute settlement”. The Speaker further informed that the Members of the National Assembly had made a three day official visit to Mangdechhu and Tangsibji Hydro Power Projects from 1st December to 3rd December, 2016. The progress report on the road widening works for the Northern East-West Highway was also presented to the Members of Parliament.

The Speaker said that during the Eighth Session, the National Assembly has adopted Paris Agreement, Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill and Trade, Commerce and Transit Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the Republic of India. Similarly, the Speaker reported that consensus could not be reached between the National Assembly and the National Council on the Customs Bill of Bhutan and Motor Vehicle Agreement between Bhutan, Bangladesh, India and Nepal. Therefore, as per the legislative procedure, the agreement and the Bill has been submitted to His Majesty the Druk

Gyalpo for the Royal Assent to be deliberated in the joint sitting.

It was also stated that the House has deliberated on the audit reports and other committee reports. He said that the Income Tax Bill and a supplementary budget amounting to Nu. 262.808 million has been approved for Financial Year 2016-17 by the House.

The Speaker informed that the Eighth Session concluded successfully with the blessings of the Triple Gem, noble guidance under the leadership of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, and with the support and cooperation of the Members of Parliament. The Members of the Parliament offered prayers for the good health and long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family. Prayers were also offered for the good health and long life of His Holiness the Je Khenpo and all other noble beings.

Annexure 1

Annexure 1: Programme for the Oath of Allegiance for Hon'ble Tshering, Member from the North-Thimphu Constituency on 10th November, 2016 corresponding to 11th Day of 10th Month of the Male Fire Monkey Year

Time	Programme
08:00	Hon'ble Members of the National Assembly to be seated in their respective Chair in the House
—	The Secretary General will seek permission to usher Hon'ble Chief Justice and Venerable Yonten Lopen of the Zhung Dratshang to the House
08:05	Hon'ble Chief Justice of Bhutan and Venerable Yonten Lopen will enter the House
—	The Secretary General will seek permission to usher the Member elect Tshering from the North-Thimphu Constituency to the House
—	Hon'ble Tshering will submit before the House
—	Hon'ble Speaker will grant the approval for the Member to change his Kabney
—	Hon'ble Speaker will give the statement for the need of Oath of Allegiance
—	Hon'ble Member will take Oath of Allegiance as per the 1st Schedule of the Constitution. (Hon'ble Chief Justice will read out the Oath of Allegiance)
—	Hon'ble Speaker will grant approval to Member Tshering to approach the Golden Throne to receive water of allegiance
—	Venerable Yonten Lopen of Zhung Dratshang will pour the water of allegiance to Tshering
—	Hon'ble Member Tshering will sign the Oath of Allegiance form
—	Hon'ble Speaker will conclude the programme by reminding the House about the conclusion of the Oath of Allegiance programme
08:30	Hon'ble Member will gather in the court yard to show respect to Hon'ble Tshering

Annexure 2

Annexure 2: Address of the Speaker at the Opening Ceremony of the 8th Session of the Second Parliament

1. Today, the Opening Ceremony of the 8th Session of the Second Parliament is being commenced as we celebrate ten years of our beloved His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck's reign on the golden throne.

His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has always graced the opening ceremonies of the parliament despite being engaged with numerous activities of national importance. On behalf of the parliament and on my own behalf, I would like to express my deepest gratitude and welcome His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

2. I would also like to extend my welcome to the Members of Royal Family, representatives of the Central Monastic Body, members of the international community, senior government officials, Hon'ble Members of Parliament and all other guests who have come to witness the occasion.
3. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo through His Royal Highness Jigme Dorji Wangchuck has granted land *Kidu* to 93 people in Gyalpozhing in a bid for the Bhutanese people to enjoy self reliance and equity. His Majesty has also granted citizenship to 43 people.

Similarly, His Majesty has granted plots for construction of houses to 27 households from Trong residing in Zhemgang

Annexure 2

Throm and also granted land *Kidu* to 316 landless people in Merag Gewog of Trashigang Dzongkhag. The parliament therefore would like to express our deepest gratitude to His Majesty.

4. During the disasters caused by flood in Sarpang Dzongkhag last summer, His Majesty visited the affected areas to personally oversee the works to mitigate flooding. His Majesty had undertaken such selfless act risking his own life out of great concern for the people. Furthermore, His Majesty had granted valuable guidance of consolation and support to the victims of fire disaster in Mongar town. The parliament therefore would like to express our gratitude to His Majesty.
5. Although it is a cold winter, His Majesty has participated in the Royal Highlanders Festival at Laya for the benefit of the people. Thereafter, His Majesty had met with the people of Lunana after visiting several valleys and mountains crossing through Gangla Karchung at 5,250mtrs. In addition, His Majesty visited the glaciers and glacier lakes of Thorthomi, Rapstreng and Lugge and met with the personnel operating flood warning mechanisms. His Majesty then visited Sephu and granted audience to the local people after crossing Rinchen Zoe La at 5,290mtrs. Toward this, we, the Parliament would like to express our gratitude to His Majesty.
6. During the fire disaster in Mongar town, His Royal Highness Jigme Dorji Wangchuck, the representative of His Majesty

Annexure 2

immediately visited the site out of great concern. His Royal Highness undertook the lead role in mitigating the fire compromising his own personal safety because of which greater disaster was prevented. Furthermore, His Royal Highness granted consolation and support to the fire victims for which the parliament would like to express our deepest gratitude to His Royal Highness.

7. We would also like to express our appreciation to Prime Minister Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay for visiting disaster affected Dzongkhags and extending government's support to the victims.
8. Further, we would like to express our appreciation to the government for identifying Shechamthang as the new Throm for Sarpang Dzongkhag and allotting plots to the affected business community following the flood disaster.

In addition, the parliament would like to express our appreciation to the armed forces, Dessups, volunteers and local business people for rendering physical and financial support in times of disasters.

9. On 13th of October 2016, His Majesty Bhumibol Adulyadej, the King of Thailand passed away and the following day of 14th October was declared as a national day of mourning. Led by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, the members of the Royal Family,

Annexure 2

senior government officials and Thai community in Bhutan offered a 1000 butter lamps and prayers in the Kunrey of Tashichhodzong.

Besides, the national flag was flown half-mast and special prayers were recited in monasteries across the country. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo along with Her Majesty the Gyaltshen and His Royal Highness the Gyalsey visited Bangkok, Thailand to pay tribute to the late King. The royal visit has been the first by a head of the state which has drawn considerable admiration and appreciation from the people of Thailand.

This kind of noble gesture of His Majesty will further strengthen the friendly relations between Bhutan and Thailand and we would like to therefore express our gratitude to His Majesty.

10. Various religious establishments under the leadership of His Holiness the Je Khenpo have unfailingly performed numerous spiritual activities for the benefit of the country and the people. In addition, His Holiness has instituted world peace prayers in 18 Dzongkhags and in the course of performing *Moenlam Chhenmo* in Chukha, a thousand butter lamps and prayers was offered for the late King of Thailand. His Holiness has further performed *Moenlam Chhenmo* in Kuneselphodrang before the statue of Buddha *Dordenma* for the benefit for the people of Thimphu. Toward

Annexure 2

this, the Parliament would like to express our gratitude to His Holiness, *Dratsangs* and *Menjong Choethuen Tshogpa*.

11. Her Majesty the Gyeltsuen graced the opening of Civil Society Fair 2016. The fair will help the civil society organizations in better understanding their roles and responsibilities in achieving the country's developmental goals. Thus, we would like to express our gratitude to Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen for gracing the event.
12. Her Majesty the Royal Grand Mother Ashi Kesang Choeden Wangchuck dedicated her entire life to religious activities for the people of Bhutan. Her Majesty initiated the renovation of Kichu Lhakhang in Paro and Kurje Lhakhang in Bumthang including numerous other monasteries. Her Majesty has also initiated annual *Drubchen* at Kichu Lhakhang in Paro and Kurje Lhakhang in Bumthang for continued peace of the country. Furthermore, Her Majesty has reintroduced *Tashi Gomang*-the portable altar and also organized an exhibition for preservation and promotion of country's culture and tradition. This has come as a blessing to the people of Bhutan and thus the parliament would like to express our gratitude and offer prayers for the long life of Her Majesty the Royal Grandmother Ashi Kesang Choeden Wangchuck.
13. Similarly, Her Majesty the Queen Mother Ashi Dorji Wangmo Wangchuck has undertaken various initiatives through Tarayana Foundation since 2003 for the benefit

Annexure 2

of the rural people and alleviating poverty. In recognition of Her Majesty's patronage of Tarayana Foundation and helping the destitute people find happiness, Her Majesty was honoured with Pope Francis Charity and Leadership Award at a ceremony in New York, USA.

14. Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay had participated in Asian Cooperation Dialogue held in Bangkok, Thailand and also visited Australia and the Indian state of Goa for regional conferences. The Prime Minister had met with heads of government and held fruitful discussions during these international meetings. The Parliament to this effect would like to express our appreciation to the Prime Minister.

15. The Royal Monetary Authority had launched 1000 denomination commemorative Banknote to celebrate the birth of the Gyalsey on 21st of September 2016 and also launched the foreign currency account facility for nonresident Bhutanese.

In addition, the bank interest rates have been reduced and the Royal Monetary Authority had handed over a sum of Nu. 874 million as net surplus fund to the government. This would greatly benefit the people and the country and thus the parliament would like to express our appreciation to the management and people working in the Royal Monetary Authority and other financial institutions.

Annexure 2

16. Similarly, under the coordination of the Election Commission of Bhutan, the Dzongkhag election coordinators, Dzongdags, civil servants, Returning Officers, armed forces and all other people involved in the election process have successfully conducted the second local government elections and the by-election for North Thimphu constituency. Toward this, the Parliament would like to express our appreciation to the Chief Election Commissioner, Election Commission of Bhutan and all the people involved in the election.
17. I would like to submit that the second local government elections have seen more participation of candidates including women compared to the first local government elections. Such trend is very much in line with the system of democracy in our country and it has provided the people with better opportunity to elect their leaders. The Parliament would also like to express its appreciation to all the candidates who contested in the elections.

It is hoped that the elected leaders would serve the people and the national policies with utmost dedication. It is also hoped that the candidates who were not elected would render their support and cooperation to those elected.

18. The Parliament would like to further express its appreciation to the media houses for shouldering their responsible role in democracy and disseminating information related to the Parliament.

Annexure 2

19. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo had granted financial support to celebrate the World Food Day for the benefit of the highlanders. Furthermore, to commemorate the birth of the Gyalsey, 60th birth anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo and 400 years since the arrival of Zhabdrung Rinpoche, His Majesty introduced the Royal Highland Festival in Laya. Such royal initiative will greatly benefit school agricultural activities, boost various livestock products, strengthen linkages between people of different Dzongkhags and promote tourism and physical sports. I would like to therefore express my appreciation to the Ministry of Agriculture & Forest and the Gasa Dzongkhag Administration.

20. I would like to thank the Royal Civil Service Commission for appointing new Secretaries to the government and the Director for the National Assembly Secretariat. It is hoped that the newly appointed officials will serve the government and the people with utmost dedication.

21. Now, I would like to report that I had led a parliamentary delegation to Pakistan and attended the Asian Parliamentary Assembly's meeting of standing committee on economic and sustainable development affairs. I also led a delegation to Vietnam for the Help Age Asia/Pacific regional conference on the economic implications of ageing.

Similarly, delegations from our parliament participated in

Annexure 2

Asian Parliamentary Assembly's 1st executive council and standing committee meeting on staff and financial regulations and the 135th IPU General Assembly in Geneva Switzerland. I am happy to inform that our parliamentary delegations have been able to further promote parliamentary exchanges and relations with international parliaments.

22. With this, I would like to take this opportunity to inform our distinguished guests on the agenda of the current session. Firstly, the joint sitting of parliament will deliberate on the Annual Audit Report.

The National Assembly will meanwhile deliberate on the:

1. Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill
2. Two international conventions
3. Reports by some of the committees

In addition, to ensure check and balance to the government, question hour sessions and motions will be on agenda as before.

23. Before I conclude my address, I would like to inform that the Legislative Drafting Manual 2016 has been introduced by the parliament. The manual has been introduced keeping in mind the need for a strong system to draft, amend and repeal necessary laws for the benefit of the people.

I would like to remind that hereafter all agencies and ministries should draft laws as per this manual.

Annexure 2

24. Besides this, the training conducted on public hearing has further reinforced the confidence and experience of the committees resulting in commendable outcome. Similarly, the National Assembly has published an annual report reflecting the achievements and works carried out by the Hon'ble Members of parliament and the secretariat. The report has already been distributed and the people can refer the report for the achievements of the National Assembly in last one year.
25. In conclusion, it is hoped that the eight session would be successful with the blessings of Dratsang and other religious bodies, noble guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, collective merit of the Bhutanese people and the support of the Members of Parliament.

THANK YOU

Annexure 3

Annexure 3: Third Reading on Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2016
The National Assembly of Bhutan has made the following amendments and adopted the Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2016 on 24th November, 2016 as follows:

Preamble (2nd and 3rd Paragraphs)

WHEREAS, recognizing the **need for** ~~fact that~~ Bhutan ~~to should~~ be prepared for any type of disasters and emergency situation, and that any additional support from ~~any part of~~ society to the ~~current~~ disaster management system will complement the Government's earnest efforts;

3rd Paragraph

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 2(4) & (7)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 3(1) (a) & (b)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 3(2) (d) & (f)

As amended in Dzongkha

Article 4(title)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 4(1) & (2)

Amended in Dzongkha

Annexure 3

Article 5(3) & (4)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 6(title)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 6(1)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 6(2)

The Society may collaborate with non-governmental organizations and any other organizations with similar **objects** ~~objectives~~ in the Kingdom with that of the Society.

Article 6(3)

The public authorities shall make provisions for covering the cost of ~~any service or activity~~ **services or activities** which they may entrust to the Society within the scope of the Society's ~~object~~ **objectives** and functions. The conditions for the implementation of such services or activities shall be laid down in written agreements between the Society and the relevant public authority, always consistent with the Fundamental Principles of the Movement.

Article 6(5)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 7(2)

Amended in Dzongkha

Annexure 3

Article 7(3)

The Society, within the limits laid down by its ~~objects~~**objectives** and functions, may acquire, own, alienate and administer property as it may deem fit.

Article 7(4)

The Society shall not accept any contributions in any form, from any individuals or organizations, the purpose of which are inconsistent with the overall ~~objects~~**objectives** of the Society as laid down under this Act.

Article 8

1. The assets of the Society, including its financial resources and real estate as well as the revenue from its income generating activities, ~~shall~~ **may** be exempted from taxes and duties in accordance with laws. ~~regulations promulgated by the Ministry of Finance~~ Department of Revenue and Customs.
2. Donations and membership fees made to the Society by an individual or a legal body ~~shall~~ **may** receive a benefit of tax exemption in accordance with ~~the applicable~~ laws.

Article 9(2)

The Society shall use as its logo, a red cross inscribed in a white circle with the outer layer of the circle designed in the color of the national flag which has the name of the Society written both in Dzongkha (~~the National Language~~) and English in black letters.

Annexure 3

Article 10(2)

A person who misrepresents ~~himself/herself~~ **himself or herself** as a member of the Society to any public or private authorities for whatever reason shall be guilty of an offence of impersonation of an official under the Penal Code of Bhutan.

Article 11(2)

Amended in Dzongkha

Article 11(3) (e)

Amended in Dzongkha

Annexure 4**Annexure 4:** Voting results on adoption of Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill 2016

Date: 24/11/2016

Time: 10:25:05 a.m.

Voting: Passed Yes: 44 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 44

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Donyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mingbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 4

Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Dupthop	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Novin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 5

Annexure 5: Voting Results on Adoption of Paris Agreement on Environmental Protection and Conservation Including Issues Related to Climate Change, and the International Recognition of Bhutan's Progressive Policies on Environment.

Date: 25/11/2016

Time: 10:25:05 a.m.

Voting: Passed Yes: 44 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 44

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Donyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mingbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 5

Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Dupthop	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Novin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 6

Annexure 6: Re-deliberation and endorsement of Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015

The House re-deliberated on the Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015 on 25th November, 2016 and endorsed 33 clauses as follows:

New Section after Section 2

Objectives

~~The objectives of this Act are:~~

- ~~(1) Trade facilitation;~~
- ~~(2) Revenue collection;~~
- ~~(3) Enforcement and preventive;~~
- ~~(4) Predictability and transparency;~~
- ~~(5) Better service delivery; and~~
- (6) Compliance management.

The objectives of this Act are, among others, to:

1. Ensure effective and efficient collection of revenues from trade;
2. Facilitate trade by promoting and providing high quality services; and
3. Ensure predictability and transparency of custom procedures.

Section 7

Amended in Dzongkha

Section 11

The Department shall provide information to a person;

- 1) If the Department receives a court order;
- 2) on approval from competent authority if the information requested is not sensitive and restricted, or does not violate person's privacy.

Annexure 6

Section 12

Any complaint against an officer of the Department shall be made to or inquired into and determined by the Head of the Department.

Section 17

Retain as in the Bill

Section 25

The transaction value shall be the price paid or payable for the goods and adjustments to the price paid or payable shall be prescribed in the rules and regulations.

Section 30

Customs duty rates and revisions thereof on goods shall be **proposed in consultation with relevant agencies and** approved by the Parliament.

Section 38

Retain as in the Bill

Section 44

The Department shall levy a penal interest of 24 percent per annum ~~or fraction thereof~~ on the outstanding duty, fees and charges, if a person fails to pay within **30 working days** ~~the specified time~~.

Section 46

Customs duty shall not be levied on goods ~~of Indian origin~~ imported into Bhutan in accordance **with bilateral or multilateral trade agreements signed by Royal Government of Bhutan** ~~the free or preferential trade agreement between Royal Government of Bhutan and other countries~~. Government of the Republic of India

Annexure 6

Section 48 (3)

The bilateral ~~and~~ or multilateral agreements signed by Royal Government of Bhutan; or

Section 90

Retain as in the Bill

Section 110

The Department ~~may shall~~ carry out re-assessment and demand customs duty ~~with interest~~ from a person within the period of five years from the date of import, if:

Section 113 (5)

Retain as in the Bill with amendment in Dzongkha

Section 118

A person shall ~~claim~~ or file an application for refund of customs duty or fees and charges within one year from the date of import or export of goods.

New Section after Section 118

The Department shall refund customs duty or fees and charges within 30 working days from the date on which the decision to refund has been made.

Section 131

The procedures for conducting **search and detention** ~~with or without warrant~~ shall be as per the provisions of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan. **(To be inserted after Section 133)**

Annexure 7**Annexure 7: Voting Results on adoption of the Income Tax (Amendment)
Bill of the Kingdom Bhutan 2016 (Money Bill)**

Date: 29/11/2016

Time: 12:26:31 p.m.

Voting: Passed Yes: 39 Abstain: 1 No: 2 Total present: 42

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Donyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	No
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	No
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mingbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 7

Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Dupthop	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Abstain
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Novin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 8**Annexure 8:** Voting Results on adoption of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the Financial Year 2016-2017 (Money Bill)

Date: 29/11/2016

Time: 12:33:56 p.m.

Voting: Passed Yes: 39 Abstain: 1 No: 2 Total present: 42

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Donyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	No
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Abstain
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	No
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mingbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 8

Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Dupthop	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Novin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 9

Annexure 9: Re-deliberation and Adoption of Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015

The National Assembly re-deliberated on the Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015 on 29th November 2016 and adopted the Bill as follows:

General I

Establishment of the Board and Functions of the Board shall be put under two new chapters (Accepted NC amendment)

General II

“Director General” shall be amended as “Head of Authority” throughout the Bill.(Accepted NC amendment)

Section 2

The provisions of this Act, and **the rules and** regulations made under this Act, and the provisions of the Convention **on international civil aviation including annexes and its subsequent amendments and other related conventions** shall apply to every: (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 6(5)

Establish an Accident Investigation Unit in the Ministry that is independent of Bhutan Civil Aviation Authority to undertake aircraft accident Investigations in line with Annex 13 and other relevant Annexes of Chicago Convention. (Accepted NC amendment)

New Sub-section 6 (6)

The Minister shall issue policy directives on aviation related matters for compliance by the Authority, including the policy on State Safety, National Aviation Security, and Air Craft Accident Investigation. (Accepted NC amendment)

Annexure 9

Section 19

The Authority shall have a Board of Directors consisting of five Members including the Chairperson from relevant ~~government~~ agencies, as recommended and appointed by the Minister upon approval of the Cabinet. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 20

A Member shall be appointed for a ~~minimum~~ term of three years, which may be renewed for a maximum of one additional term. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 21 (2)

~~Has not been rehabilitated or discharged;~~ (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 23 (3)

Is convicted of **any** offence ~~involving dishonesty or fraud/moral turpitude~~ (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 29 (11)

Exercise such other powers and perform functions as may be ~~conferred on it by the Cabinet from time to time~~ **necessary** for the purpose of implementing this Act. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 36

The Board in consultation ~~with and approval of~~ the Royal Civil Service Commission may appoint officials of the Authority to discharge responsibilities as may be necessary for effective implementation of the provisions of this Act. (Accepted NC amendment)

Annexure 9

New Section after Section 37

The inspectors of Bhutan Civil Aviation Authority shall be entitled for the allowance and other benefits as decided by the Board in accordance with relevant laws. (Accepted NC amendment)

New Sub-section after Sub-section 43(4)

The Head of the Authority may delegate in writing any of his powers to any officers, inspectors or any unit of the Authority it may deem necessary as there in. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 45

The Director General shall be appointed for a minimum ~~maximum~~ term of five ~~three~~ years, subject to re-appointment for a maximum of one ~~additional term~~. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 46

The Director General shall serve as the **ex-officio** Member Secretary of the Board, with no voting rights. (**Put after section 19**) (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 70

The Board ~~Director General~~ shall make rules **and regulations** requiring: (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 71

The rules and **regulations** under section 70 of this Act shall be **made herein after called as Bhutan Civil Aviation Security Regulations which shall be in line with** Annex 17 of Chicago Convention of the International Civil Aviation Organization. (Accepted NC amendment)

Annexure 9

Section 77

The Head of the Authority shall seek policy directives from the Minister in order to enter into any International agreements including Air Service Agreements. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 84

The Authority's inspectors shall have unhindered access to all areas including the aircraft wherever it may be and the related facilities and installations and any records **and documents**, information and explanation that may be required in the course of their inspections. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 120 (1)

To establish an independent Accident Investigation Team **or delegate investigation to another State or to a regional investigation organization or to an agency**, to undertake investigation of accidents or incidents involving civil aircraft registered by the Authority and occurring: (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 120 (2)

For the purpose of determining the facts, conditions and circumstances relating to each accident or incident and the probable cause thereof, the investigation team shall be granted unhindered access, **control and protection over** all areas including the aircraft and accident scene **and other evidences, flight recorders and air traffic service (ATS) records, taking witness statement and protection of CVR recordings.** (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 125

Accident or incident investigation team shall **be independent from state aviation authorities and other entities that could interfere with the conduct of the investigation. The investigation team shall maintain the information related to the accident/incident in strict confidence including nondisclosure of CVR recordings.** While an investigation is underway, there shall be no interference with the investigation process nor require appearance of the members of the team or production of evidence for any purpose. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 157

~~The amendment of this Act by way of addition, variation or repeal shall be affected by a simple majority of the respective Houses or vote of not less than two-thirds of the total members of Parliament present and voting on a motion submitted by one-third of the members of either House.~~ **The Amendment of this Act by way of addition, variation or repeal shall be effected by Parliament.** (Accepted NC amendment)

New Section after Section 158**Bilateral Exchanges of Safety Oversight Responsibilities—**

Notwithstanding the provisions of this Section, the Head of the Authority, pursuant to Article 83 bis of the Convention on International Civil Aviation and by a bilateral agreement with the aeronautical authorities of another country, may exchange with that country all or part of their respective functions and duties with respect to registered aircraft under the following articles of the Chicago Convention: Article 12 (Rules of the Air), Article 30 (Aircraft Radio Equipment), Article 31 (Certificates of Airworthiness) and Article 32(a) (Licences of Personnel). (Accepted NC amendment)

Annexure 9

Section 159 (1)

“Accident” means an accident associated with the operation of any aircraft involving circumstances prescribed by the rules and regulations made for the purpose of this Act. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 159 (4)

‘Aircraft’ means any machine that can derive support in the atmosphere from the reactions of the air against earth’s surface, **including Unmanned Aircraft System(UAS), balloons, paragliding and any other flying object** and refers to civil Aircraft only. (Accepted NC amendment)

Section 159 (38)

~~**“Director General”** means the Director General of Bhutan Civil Aviation Authority appointed under this Act;~~ (Accepted NC amendment)

New Definition

“Unmanned Aircraft System” means an aircraft and its associated elements which are operated with no pilot on board. (Accepted NC amendment)

New Definition

‘Serious incident’ means An incident involving circumstances prescribed by the regulations made for the purpose of this Act. (Accepted NC amendment)

New Definition

Head of the Authority- means the Head of the Authority who shall hold the equivalent post of the Director General of the Civil Aviation Authority all over the world as prescribed by the ICAO. (Accepted NC amendment)

Annexure 10**Annexure 10:** Voting Results on adoption of the Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015

Date: 30/11/2016

Time: 10:25:54 a.m.

Voting: Passed Yes: 37 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 37

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Donyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mingbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 10

Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Dupthop	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Novin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 11**Annexure 11:** Voting Results on adoption of the Trade, Commerce and Transit Agreement between Bhutan and India

Date: 05/12/2016

Time: 10:26:24 a.m.

Voting: Passed Yes: 43 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 43

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mingbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 11

Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Dupthop	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Novin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 12

Annexure 12: Royal Kasho granting the Joint Sitting of the Second Parliament

The Royal Assent is hereby granted on the submission made for the deliberation of Annual Audit Report 2015 of the Royal Audit Authority reviewed by the Public Accounts Committee in the Joint Sitting of the Eighth Session of the Second Parliament on 6-7 December, 2016.

Granted on the 24th Day of the 9th Month of the Fire Male Monkey Year.

Druk Gyalpo

Annexure 13**Annexure 13:** Voting Results on adoption of Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee Report

Date: 07/12/2016

Time: 5:42:18 p.m.

Voting: Passed Yes: 62 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 62

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Nima	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (Punakha)	Delegate	Yes
Kesang C Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Rinzin	Delegate	Yes
Pema Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 13

Dhan Bdr Monger	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Mingbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Phuntsho Rabten	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Dupthop	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Gasa)	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Tharchen	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Phuntsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Dorji (Haa)	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 13

Pema Dakpa	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kaka Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kamal Bdr Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Novin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 14

Annexure 14: Address of the Speaker at the Closing Ceremony of the Eighth Session of the Second Parliament of Bhutan

1. Today, on behalf of the Members of Parliament and on my own behalf, I would like to welcome and express our gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the Closing Ceremony of the Eighth Session despite having numerous Royal engagements for the welfare of the people and the country.
2. I would also like to welcome Her Majesty the Gyaltshen, Members of the Royal Family, representatives of the Central Monastic Body, senior government officials, representatives of the international community and all the people who have come to witness the occasion.
3. The Closing Ceremony of the Eighth Session is indeed an extraordinary day as it exactly coincides with the tenth year of His Majesty's reign on the Golden Throne. Therefore, it is a very opportune and a historic moment to have the Closing Ceremony on this day.
4. His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo has undertaken numerous initiatives in the interest of the nation like conservation of environment, promoting peace and happiness and making the people self sufficient through economic growth. His Majesty had also formulated noble policies ensuring preservation of culture, granting citizenships, addressing land issues through Kidu and granting scholarships. Ever since the enthronement of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, His Majesty has continued these noble initiatives of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo with great enthusiasm. Time is indeed inadequate, if I am to make a comprehensive submission on the royal initiatives.

Annexure 14

During the 86th session of the erstwhile National Assembly, His Majesty had commanded that there shall be no individual in between the King and the people. This was one of the important commands of His Majesty. Moreover, during the coronation in 2008, His Majesty said that throughout his reign, he will never rule as a king but protect the people as a parent, care as a brother and serve as a son. All that the King asks is the support from the Government and the people. Accordingly, His Majesty had visited all the remote areas and met with the people of 205 Gewogs in Twenty Dzongkhags thereby granting land, plots and addressing census issues. His Majesty had also personally visited the areas affected by natural disasters and met with the people granting kidu to the victims.

In an effort to ensure the security of the nation and continued peace for the people, His Majesty had visited numerous establishments of the armed forces and strengthened the institutions of armed forces. As a form of rendering support to the armed forces, the Desuung programme has been initiated by His Majesty. His Majesty has also sent service men and women from the Royal Bhutan Armed Forces to the United Nations Peacekeeping Missions. Furthermore, His Majesty had initiated scout programmes so that the youth could receive wholesome education and skills. His Majesty had also visited numerous schools and granted words of wisdom to the teachers and students.

His Majesty had granted audience to the civil servants and imparted valuable advice in serving the Tsa-Wa-Sum. In order to maintain our peaceful society and justice system in the country, His Majesty had established Supreme and High Courts. Besides His Majesty's continued

Annexure 14

initiatives for the sustainable socio-economic development, medals of appreciation have been awarded to those in civil service and other sections of the society reinforcing their commitment and dedication to serve.

Similarly, religious bodies have carried out renovation and new construction works for Dratshangs, Lhakhangs, Chortens, Goendeys and Dzongs complimenting the magnanimity of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo. His Majesty had visited numerous foreign countries and met with the leaders further strengthening Bhutan's relations. Under the noble leadership of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, two Parliamentary elections and two Local Government elections have been successfully conducted.

Therefore, on behalf of the Parliament, we would like to offer our immense gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo as these are the fruitful results of His Majesty's noble leadership, invaluable advice and continued guidance.

5. Under the glorious reign of our monarchs, Bhutan has been recognized as a country rich in environment, culture and Gross National Happiness. In order to further promote our country's reputation as a clean country, His Majesty had granted the 9th of December as a Nation Wide Cleaning Campaign Day. Therefore, we would like to express our gratitude to His Majesty.

6. The auspicious birth of His Royal Highness Gyalsey Jigme Namgyel Wangchuck is a precious gift from Their Majesties to the people as

Annexure 14

we observe three extremely significant occasions in the country. The Royal birth will espouse the perpetuity of the Wangchuck dynasty, has fulfilled the aspiration of the people and will benefit the security of the nation, people's happiness and peace. It has further provided an opportunity for the people to pay our tribute to the successive monarchs.

Thus, we would like to offer our heartfelt gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen.

7. Our great monarchs have always taken noble initiative to conserve the natural environment which has been exemplary to the rest of the world. In the same context, with the objective to conserve environment and reduce global temperature, the Paris Agreement was signed on behalf of the government of Bhutan by the Permanent Representative of Bhutan to the United Nations in New York. Subsequently, the National Assembly had extensively deliberated and ratified the Paris Agreement. We are hopeful that the agreement will benefit efforts in dealing with climate change and environmental conservation.

8. Likewise, Bhutan Red Cross Society Bill has been adopted. The Bill was adopted mainly because it would facilitate efforts in times of natural disasters by generating funds and drawing in voluntary contributions from civil society organizations. On behalf of the Parliament, we would like to offer our gratitude to Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen for being the patron of Bhutan Red Cross Society and carrying out such noble initiative.

9. Furthermore, the Trade, Commerce and Transit Agreement between

Annexure 14

the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the Republic of India has been adopted. The tradition of friendly relations shared by a small country like Bhutan and a big country like Indian has been exemplary to the rest of the world. The unrestricted trade agreement between the two countries was first signed in 1972 by Paro Poenlop, His Royal Highness the Prince Namgyel Wangchuck and Ambassador of India to Bhutan Shri. B.S. Das. The agreement since then has been revised four times.

Moreover, the signing of trade agreement by the Economic Affairs Minister of Bhutan, Leki Dorji, and Commerce and Industry Minister of India, Nirmala Sitharaman on the 12th November, 2016, will greatly benefit in further enhancing the unrestricted trade between the two countries. Thus, the Parliament of Bhutan would like to thank the government and the people of India.

10. The Prime Minister of Bhutan Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay was conferred “Lungmar Kabney” on 17th of December, 2014 by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for fervently serving the government and people of Bhutan with dedication and in a humble manner. The Prime Minister has visited 20 Dzongkhags and 121 Gewogs thus far addressing the problems of rural people. He has also visited various foreign countries strengthening Bhutan’s diplomatic relations.

11. Similarly, our Prime Minister was ranked among the top 50 leaders in the world following his remarkable speech at the Ted Talk which is renowned for intellectual speeches, in Vancouver, Canada.

Annexure 14

12. This year, the Prime Minister Tshering Tobgay had also received “German Sustainability Award 2016” albeit Bhutan being a small nation.

Receiving such coveted award by the Prime Minister will further add to the popularity and reputation of the country and thus people of Bhutan are truly proud and happy. In addition, this would also enhance the sovereignty, security, diplomatic relations and the economy of the country. We would like to therefore express our appreciation and congratulate the Prime Minister.

Such awards received by the Prime Minister are mainly attributable to the farsighted leadership of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo and His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the royal guidance in formulating noble policies and strategies such as good governance.

The Parliament would like to therefore extend our heartfelt gratitude to the father of the Nation, His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, and His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

13. We, the Parliament would like to thank His Holiness the Je Khenpo and venerable Lopens of the Central Monastic Body for initiating and conducting rituals for the well-being of the people, and to avert and curtail misfortunes in the country.

14. Under the patronage of Her Royal Highness, Princess Sonam Dechan Wangchuck, Bhutan National Legal Institute has initiated numerous activities. One such activity included the conduct of training on ‘Internal dispute mediation’ to the officials working in the Judiciary,

Annexure 14

local leaders of 20 Dzongkhags and men and women totaling 1,053 people till June 2016. This is in view of fulfilling the aspirations of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo and His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo in providing timely justice to the people. Subsequent to such training and guidance, between June 2012 and June 2015, a total of 15,316 cases were resolved through internal dispute mediation of the total 36,250 registered cases.

The Parliament would like to express our gratitude to Her Royal Highness Princess Sonam Dechan Wangchuck for coming up with such initiative which is greatly benefiting the society and reducing the number of cases referred to the courts.

His Royal Highness Prince Jigme Dorji Wangchuck, the representative of His Majesty in the east had initiated and graced the ground breaking ceremony for the construction of Integrated Agro Processing Plant at Limithang in Mongar on 16th November 2016. The plant once completed will not only benefit the people depending on agriculture but would also create employment opportunities.

On behalf of the parliament, I would like to express our gratitude to His Royal Highness Prince Jigme Dorji Wangchuck.

15. I am pleased to inform the general public that the Members of the National Assembly had made a three day official visit to Mangdechhu and Tangsibji Hydro Power Projects from 1st December to 3rd December, 2016.

Annexure 14

En route to Mangdechhu Hydro Power Project, the Managing Director of Punatsangchhu Hydro Power Project informed us that the 1,200 megawatt Punatsangchhu Hydro Power Project I with the estimated budget outlay of Nu. 35.150 billion in 2006 has been revised to an estimated cost of Nu. 93.756 billion. The project would be completed in July 2019. While the 1,020 megawatt Punatsangchhu Hydro Power Project II would be completed by 2020, the cost of the project has been revised to Nu. 72.906 billion from Nu. 37.780 billion in 2009. Similarly, the survey and Detailed Project Report for the Tangsibji Hydro Power Project was done by the Druk Green Power Corporation. There has also been commendable achievement in the making of roads, underground tunnel and drilling works carried out by the Bhutanese people. Considering the impressive progress, the 118 megawatt Hydro Power Project, with the budget outlay of Nu. 11,964.59 million would be completed on time.

16. Likewise, the estimated cost for the Mangdechhu Hydro Power Project which was estimated at Nu.28.963 billion as reflected in the Detail Project Report has been revised to Nu.40.206 billion. A total of Nu. 3,225.55 million from the amount of Nu.3646.78 million received by the government has been spent so far bearing good results. It is hoped that the 720 megawatt project would be completed by March 2017 despite slight delay in the works.

There are 90 percent Bhutanese and 10 percent Indians working in the project. This would greatly benefit us in creating more employment opportunities and help the Bhutanese people gain experience and skills in executing similar projects in the future.

Annexure 14

We, the Parliament would like to thank the Managing Directors, Director Generals, officers and staff of the Punatsangchhu Hydro Power Project, Tangsibji Hydro Power Project and Mangdechhu Hydro Power Project for clearly guiding us through project sites and progress made by the projects.

17. Meanwhile, the parliamentarians also visited Trongsa Dzong and the Royal Heritage Museum which gave us an opportunity to lay our sights on personal effects of the successive monarchs and sculptures of our forefathers.

Since 2008, entrance fees amounting to Nu. 91 lakhs has been collected from visitors visiting the Royal Heritage Museum and has been deposited in the government treasury.

18. Similarly, all the works for the renovation of Trongsa Dzong were carried out by Bhutanese people. Such expression of interest and enthusiasm by the Bhutanese people will go a long way in preserving our heritage and securing job opportunities for skilled people.

19. I would like to inform that with the emphasis of the government, the road widening works for the East-West Highway is progressing well. To cite an example, over 80% of the highway between Thimphu and Wangduephodrang has been blacktopped. The plan for road widening works between Wangduephodrang and Trongsa has been formulated well but small problems resulting from weather conditions were faced. However, the Ministry of Works & Human Settlement, engineers and contractors are working hard day in and day out as per the plans of the government. I would like to thus express our appreciation to them.

Annexure 14

20. In this Eighth Session, the National Assembly has adopted two Bills and two international conventions. Consensus could not be reached between the National Assembly and the National Council on the Customs Bill of Bhutan and Motor Vehicle Agreement between Bhutan, Bangladesh, India and Nepal. Therefore, as per the legislative procedure, the agreement and the Bill has been submitted to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for the Royal Assent to be deliberated in the joint sitting.

The House deliberated on the audit reports, report and recommendations submitted by the Public Accounts Committee and reached fruitful resolutions. Besides, in order to exempt taxes on fixed deposits and enhance the banking service, the Income Tax Act of 2001 has been amended. The budget of Nu. 617.743 million allocated to the Ministry of Labor & Human Resources for the financial year 2016-17 has been inadequate to address unemployment issues. Therefore, supplementary budget amounting to Nu. 262.808 million was approved by the House. The amount for the supplementary budget was generated from interest received on account of the subordinated debt instruments under the Economic Stimulus Plan. It is hoped that the supplementary budget approved would help address the unemployment issues.

21. The Eighth Session concludes today successfully with the blessings of the Triple Gem, and noble guidance under the leadership of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo. During the deliberations, the Members of Parliament have refrained from their personal interest and have been mindful of laws and policies. Deliberations also focused on ensuring check and balance with the support and cooperation of the Members of Parliament.

Annexure 14

Therefore, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to His Majesty and the Members of Parliament for making this session fruitful.

22. On behalf of the Members, we would like to thank the chairpersons and the members of the committees for having carried out productive review tasks, presenting quality reports and providing clarifications and opinions to the House. We would also like to thank the Secretary General and the staffs of the National Assembly Secretariat for their tireless efforts in bringing out the resolutions of the House on time.

23. Lastly, before the Golden Throne, we would like to offer our prayers for the good health and long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family. We would also like to offer our prayers for the good health and long life of His Holiness the Je Khenpo and all other noble beings. Furthermore, we would like to offer our prayers for the peace and happiness of the people of Bhutan and the world at large.

THANK YOU

Annexure 15

Annexure 15: List of Members present during the Eighth Session of the Second Parliament

1. Hon'ble Tshogpon Jigme Zangpo, Speaker, Mongar constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
2. Hon'ble Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay, Prime Minister, Sombaykha constituency, Haa Dzongkhag
3. Hon'ble Lyonpo Damcho Dorji, Minister for Foreign Affairs, Goenkhatoe- Laya constituency, Gasa Dzongkhag
4. Hon'ble Lyonpo Dorji Choden, Minister for Works and Human Settlement, Thrimshing constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
5. Hon'ble Lyonpo Norbu Wangchuk, Minister for Education, Kanglung-Udzorong constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
6. Hon'ble Lyonpo Ngeema Sangay Tshempo, Minister for Labour and Human Resources, Lhamoizingkha-Tashiding constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
7. Hon'ble Lyonpo Tandin Wangchuk, Minister for Health, Athang-Theedtsho constituency, Wangdiphodrang Dzongkhag
8. Hon'ble Lyonpo Dina Nath Dungyel, Minister for Communication, Phuentshospelri-Samtse constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
9. Hon'ble Lyonpo Namgay Dorji, Minister for Finance, Draagteng-Langthil constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
10. Hon'ble Lyonpo Lekey Dorji, Minister for Economic Affairs, Bardo-Trong constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag
11. Hon'ble Lyonpo Yeshey Dorji, Minister for Agriculture and Forest, Maenbi- Tsaenkar constituency, Lhuntse Dzongkhag
12. Hon'ble Lyonpo Dawa Gyaltsen, Minister for Home & Cultural Affairs, Bongo-Chapcha constituency, Chukha Dzongkhag

Annexure 15

- 13.Hon'ble Dr. Pema Gyamtsho, Leader of Opposition, Chhoekhor-Tang constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
- 14.Hon'ble Chimmi Dorji, Deputy Speaker, Lingmu-Toedwang Constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag
- 15.Hon'ble Member Tshewang Jurmi, Chhumig-Ura constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
- 16.Hon'ble Member Rinzin Dorji, Phuentshogling constituency, Chhukha Dzongkhag
- 17.Hon'ble Member Karma Dorji, Drukjeygang-Tseza constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
- 18.Hon'ble Member Pema Drukpa, Khamaed-Lunana constituency, Gasas Dzongkhag
- 19.Hon'ble Kinley Om, Bji-Kar-Tshog-Uesu constituency, HaaDzongkhag
20. Hon'ble Member Karma Rangdol, Gangzur-Minjey constituency, Lhuentse Dzongkhag
- 21.Hon'ble Member Ugyen Wangdi, Dramedtse-Ngatshang constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
- 22.Hon'ble Member Rinzin Jamtsho, Kengkhar-Weringla constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
- 23.Hon'ble Member Kezang Wangmo, Dokar-Sharpa constituency, Paro Dzongkhag
- 24.Hon'ble Member Khandu Wangchuk, Lamgong-Wangchangconstituency, Paro Dzongkhag
- 25.Hon'ble Member Zangley Dukpa, Khar-Yurung constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
- 26.Hon'ble Member Choida Jamtsho, Nganglam constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag

Annexure 15

- 27.Hon'ble Member Dechen Zangmo, Nanong-Shumar constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
- 28.Hon'ble Member Dophu Dukpa, Kabisa–Talog constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag
- 29.Hon'ble Member Mingbo Dukpa, Dewathang-Gomdar constituency, Samdrup Jongkhar Dzongkhag
- 30.Hon'ble Member Pelzang Wangchuk, Jomotshangkha-Martshala constituency, Samdrup Jongkhar Dzongkhag
- 31.Hon'ble Member Tek Bahadur Subba, Dophuchen-Tading constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
- 32.Hon'ble Member Ritu Raj Chhetri, Tashichhoeling constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
- 33.Hon'ble Member Madan Kumar Chhetri,Ugyentse-Yoeseltse constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
- 34.Hon'ble Member Rinzin Dorji, Shompangkha constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
- 35.Hon'ble Member Gopal Gurung,Gelegphu constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
- 36.Hon'ble Member Tshering, North Thimphu constituency, Thimphu Dzongkhag
- 37.Hon'ble Member Yeshey Zimba, South Thimphu constituency, Thimphu Dzongkhag
- 38.Hon'ble Member Wangdi Norbu, Bartsham-Shongphu constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
- 39.Hon'ble Member Jigme Wangchuk, Radhi- Sagteng, Trashigang Dzongkhag
- 40.Hon'ble Member Karma Tenzin, Wamrong constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag

Annexure 15

41. Hon'ble Member Dupthob, Boomdeling-Jamkhar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
42. Hon'ble Member Sonam Dondup Dorjee, Khamdang-Ramjar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
43. Hon'ble Member Nidup Zangpo, Nubi-Tangsibji constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
44. Hon'ble Member Yogesh Tamang, Kilkhorthang-Mendrelgang constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag
45. Hon'ble Member Novin Darlami, Sergithang-Tsirang Toed constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag
46. Hon'ble Member Kuenga, Nyishog- Saephu constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
47. Hon'ble Member Dorji Wangdi, Panbang constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag