

**2ND PARLIAMENT OF BHUTAN
6TH SESSION**



Resolution No. 6

**PROCEEDINGS AND RESOLUTION OF
THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF
BHUTAN**

(NOVEMBER 4 - DECEMBER 9, 2015)

Speaker: Jigme Zangpo

Table of Content

1. Opening Ceremony	1
2. Address by the Speaker.....	1
3. Introduction & Adoption of Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015.....	3
4. Implementation status of resolution of the 5 th Session.....	4
5. Question Hour: Group A- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Information and Communication.....	9
6. Resolution on withdrawal of United Nations Convention on Rights of Persons with Disabilities	11
7. Question Hour: Group B- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Education	11
8. Motion for the Amendment of Rules of Procedure of National Assembly	13
9. Implementation status of resolution of the Fifth Session.....	14
10. Question Hour: Group C- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Labour and Human Resources, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Works and Human Settlement	17
11. Motion on ratification of Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal	20
12. Motion on Introduction and adoption of the Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015 for deliberation	22
13. Motion to Review and Amend the Civil & Criminal Procedure Code and the Penal Code of Bhutan	24

14. Question Hour: Group D- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Ministry of Finance.....	27
15. Re-deliberation on the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal.....	29
16. Royal Kasho for the presentation of the Annual Audit Report to the Joint Sitting of Parliament.....	29
17. Royal Kasho for the deliberation of Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag in the Joint Sitting of Parliament	40
18. Question Hour: Group A- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Home and Culture Affairs, Ministry of Information and Communication, and Ministry of Foreign Affairs	47
19. Implementation status of the Resolution of the Fifth Session	49
20. Re-deliberation on Jabmi (Amendment) Bill 2014.....	56
21. Motion for withdrawal of the Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan 2015.....	57
22. Question Hour: Group B- Question relevant to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Forestry and Agriculture, and Ministry of Education	59
23. Re-deliberation on the United Nations Convention Against Corruption.....	61
24. Motion on the re-deliberation of the Framework Agreement between the European Investment Bank and the Kingdom of Bhutan 2015.....	62

25. Motion to re-deliberate on the Companies Bill of Bhutan 2015	67
26. Question Hour: Group C- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, and Labour & Human Resources.....	70
27. Rectification of Draft Resolution	72
28. Concluding Ceremony	73
Annexure 1: List of Documents distributed to the Members	83
Annexure 2: List of Members Present During the Sixth Session of the Second Parliament.....	84
Annexure 3: Speech of the Hon Speaker at the Opening Ceremony of the 6th Session of the Second Parliament.....	87
Annexure 4: Voting results on Motor Vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger, Personal and Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal	93
Annexure 5: Voting results on Bjitsiphu as Paro Yenlag Thromde...	95
Annexure 6: Voting results on Betaykha as Paro Yenlag Thromde.	98
Annexure 7: Voting results on Denchi as Pema Gatshel Dzongkhag	101
Annexure 8: Voting results on Nganglam as Pema Gatshel Yenlag Thromde.....	104
Annexure 9: Voting results on Redeliberation of Paro Dzongkhag Thromde in summer session	107

Annexure 10: Voting results of Adoption on Jabmi (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2014.....	110
Annexure 11: Voting results of Adoption on withdrawal of Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan 2015.	112
Annexure 12: Voting results on ratification of the United Nations Convention against Corruption.	114
Annexure 13: Voting results on the Framework Agreement between the Kingdom of Bhutan and European Investment Bank governing activities 2014.....	116
Annexure 14: Voting results on Adoption of the Companies Bill of Bhutan 2015.....	118
Annexure 15: Report of the Special Parliamentary Joint Committee on Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag:.....	120
Annexure 16: Speech of the Hon Speaker at the Closing Ceremony of the 6 th Session.....	123

1. Opening Ceremony

The 6th Session of the Second Parliament of Bhutan commenced on the auspicious 23rd Day of the 9th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to 4th of November 2015. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo was received by the Members of Parliament in an elaborate *Serdrang* and *Chibdrel* ceremony followed by *Zhugdrel Phuentsum Tshogpai* ceremony. The list of documents distributed and the attendance of the Members during the 6th Session is provided in **Annexure 1** and **Annexure 2** respectively.

2. Address by the Speaker

On behalf of the Members of Parliament and on his own behalf, the Speaker extended his welcome to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to the Opening Ceremony. The Speaker also welcomed all other guests who have come to witness the occasion.

The Speaker informed that during the 6th Session, five Bills, Rules of Procedure of the National Assembly 2014, Annual Audit Report 2014, international conventions and committee reports will be deliberated. Further, it was informed that Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and Paro Dzongkhag Yenlag Thromde will also be deliberated.

On behalf of Parliament, the Speaker expressed his gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen for visiting numerous places in the country and granting land *Kidu*. He also expressed his gratitude to His Royal Highness Dasho Jigme Dorji Wangchuck, representative of His Majesty for addressing the grievances of the people by visiting rural areas.

The National Assembly participated in the 4th Conference of World Speakers and also in the 11th General Assembly of the Asian Forum of Parliamentarians on Population & Development (AFPPD) whereby the National Assembly joined as its member. The Speaker further thanked the Prime Minister for commendable outcomes from his participation in the 70th General Assembly of the United Nations.

The Speaker mentioned that Shrimati Mamata Banerjee, Chief Minister of the Indian State of West Bengal visited the country and assured to support the development of business activities between Bhutan and India. On behalf of Parliament, he expressed his appreciation to the Chief Minister.

In commemorating the 60th Birth Anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, statue of Buddha Dordenma was built at Kuneselphodrang in Thimphu under the coordination of Lama Tshering Wangdi, Chairperson of the *Chothuen Tshogpa* of Bhutan. Similarly, statue of Guru Nangsid Zilnon was built at Takila in Lhuentse under the coordination of Khenpo Karpo. The Speaker expressed the appreciation of Parliament for these initiatives.

It was referred that in commemorating the 60th Birth Anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, the Center for Bhutan Studies & GNH Research organized the 6th International Gross National Happiness Conference which was of great significance. The Speaker expressed his hopes that the conference being attended by more than a thousand professionals from 48 countries would be successful.

In conclusion, the Speaker offered his prayers for the success of various programmes initiated by the Central Monastic Body, other religious bodies, the Royal Government and the people to commemorate the 60th Birth Anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo. He also offered his prayers and expressed hopes for

the success of the 6th Session. The detail speech is provided in the **Annexure 3. (23rd Day of the 9th Month of the Female Wood Sheep Year corresponding to the 4th of November 2015).**

3. Introduction & Adoption of Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015

The Member in-charge of the Bill, Minister for Finance moved the motion to introduce the Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015 for the first reading and adoption. The House adopted the Bill through a show of hands.

Subsequently, in the second reading, the Member in-Charge of the Bill submitted that the existing Bhutan Sales Tax, Customs and Excise Act of 2000 and its amendment version of 2012 includes all three provisions of customs, sales tax and excise together. Thus, in the face of changing international trade system, the existing Act was found not to be comprehensive.

In addition, as per the International Customs Practice, Bhutan has signed the Kyoto convention and ascended as its member. In this context, the existing Act did not cover the provisions of the Kyoto convention and hence it was not in line with this convention. Therefore, a separate Act had to be formulated for the purpose.

Similarly, the trade practice among the South Asian nations was as per the international trade norms and thus Bhutan's trade practices had to be enhanced to keep uniformity with that of other SAARC nations. Moreover, in order to promote trade relations and economy of the country, Customs Act of Bhutan 2015 had to be formulated.

Accordingly, the House referred the Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015 to the Economic Development & Private Sector committee for review. The committee was directed to hold comprehensive consultations

with the ministries, departments, agencies and the general public and present a report of the review conducted to the 7th Session for the third reading. Thus, the deliberation on the Customs Bill of Bhutan 2015 concluded. (*24th Day of the 9th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 5th November 2015*).

4. Implementation status of resolution of the 5th Session

4.1 Report of the Social and Cultural Committee

In accordance to Section 6.8 of the resolution of the Fifth Session of the Second Parliament, the Chairperson of the Social and Cultural Committee presented a report to the National Assembly of Bhutan. He reported that the shortage of Dzongkha teachers in the schools and lack of regard for Dzongkha marks at par with marks of other subjects in determining the average percentage for class twelve have led to decline of interest in Dzongkha. It was reported that there were concerns regarding the lack of employment opportunities for Dzongkha language graduates in the future. Additionally, it was reported that the main reason for the decline of Dzongkha standard were due to the fact that general teachers were teaching all the subjects from classes PP to classes three in the schools.

Submission was made that numerous resolutions regarding the importance of the national language were also passed in the previous sessions of the National Assembly. Furthermore, it was reported that His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo has always considered national language Dzongkha as the identity of the country and therefore established Dzongkha Development Commission for the sole purpose of sustaining the national language. It was reported that the Royal Decree was granted on 10th Day of the 9th Month of the Water Female Rooster Year commanding the Ministers and Government officials to use Dzongkha when conducting official meetings. The Chairperson reported that the copies of the decree were also

distributed in the House. Therefore, the Committee after thoroughly discussing on the matter submitted a comprehensive report with eight recommendations.

Discussing on the report, the Members submitted that owing to the country's modernization and changing times, international languages like English should be considered important along with the national language Dzongkha. Submission was made that school curriculum needs to be changed and subjects like History should be once again taught in Dzongkha. Besides, it was submitted that Government's policy of recruiting less teachers need to be further reviewed; where maximum of Dzongkha experts and capable *Shedra* graduates need to be recruited and given job opportunities in the schools.

Furthermore, it was deliberated that there was a need to review the teacher- student ratio in the schools and the Dzongkha subject to be compulsorily taught by Dzongkha teachers for the students from classes PP to classes three. Deliberation was also held whether or not Dzongkha should be considered at par with other subjects, while determining average percentage for classes twelve.

Some members submitted that the Government should introduce various plans and programmes to improve competency in Dzongkha language and submit a report on the number of teachers needed in each school and number of periods a teacher could teach in a single day. Members also pointed that there were no concrete grounds for the government to recruit contract and temporary teachers if government was not providing opportunities to B.Ed graduates in the first place.

Submission was made that the Ministry of Education should evaluate the policy of teacher deployment in order to solve the shortage of school teachers in the remote corners of the country. Some

members shared that with the help of various Dzongkha promotion programmes and screening Bhutanese movies in the school, students do not find difficulties communicating in Dzongkha while difficulties are experienced in writing and reading. Comprehensive curriculum should be introduced from classes PP to classes twelve in order to help promote reading and writing skills. In addition, it was also submitted that Dzongkha teachers having basic foundation in Dzongkha should be provided training and then posted to various schools for the benefit of the schools.

Presenting its clarification, the Government reported that the quality of Dzongkha was perceived to be declining in schools. However, it was further reported that if one considers the high average scores in Dzongkha compared to other subjects in the national examination, not only speaking but reading and writing competency in Dzongkha was also seen to have improved.

While it was imperative for the Government to acknowledge the recommendations of the committee, problems ensued during the deployment of teachers by Dzongkhags in schools reasoning to medical issues and family problems of individuals. However, it was anticipated that the problems of teacher shortage would be solved with the help of Education Blueprint guidelines declared by the Ministry of Education.

Regarding the issue of teaching history in Dzongkha, it was submitted that the Ministry of Education should review its suitability and accordingly acknowledge the recommendation. Submission was made that the National Statistics Bureau while carrying out survey on the national housing and population next year should look into the standard of Dzongkha skills as well. Moreover, despite having employees equipped with Dzongkha skills in the work place, the primary causes for the decline of quality of Dzongkha were due to

popular usage of English language for preparing documents, reports and translation.

It was submitted the school curriculum should not be revised immediately without considering the exam results which have been good. Doing so would only create confusion and provide no benefit to the students. However, it was submitted that an opportunity should be granted to review and revise the curriculum should the problems are found genuine.

Following that, the Chairperson of the committee suggested that standard of Dzongkha could be improved if Government could work in accordance to the recommendations of the committee and if history could be taught in Dzongkha by only Dzongkha teachers. In addition, it was imperative to review as it was perceived that even obtaining high marks in Dzongkha proved futile. Henceforth, it was suggested that it would prove extremely effective if senior Government officers could use Dzongkha for official meetings and circulating internal documents. Beside those, sincere proposals were made if maximum opportunities for Dzongkha usage in work place could be implemented too. Words of thankfulness were extended to the House for accepting the recommendations of the committee.

The eight recommendations of the committee that were endorsed by the House are as follows:

1. The Ministry of Education needs to revisit the Teacher Deployment Policy vis-à-vis teacher-student ratio of 1:32 in order to improve the quality of education, especially Dzongkha language.
2. There is need to revisit the Class Teacher System which allows general and contract teachers to teach Dzongkha in classes PP

to III. The Committee strongly feels that Dzongkha teachers should teach Dzongkha in all classes.

3. Teaching of Bhutanese History in Dzongkha should be revived with textbooks written after profound research.
4. The Bhutan Council for School Examinations and Assessment (BCSEA) and also the Royal University of Bhutan (RUB) should study the inclusion of Dzongkha in calculating the overall pass percentage of class XII Examinations.
5. All Ministries and agencies must comply with the notifications and resolutions of the National Assembly of Bhutan with regard to using Dzongkha in official correspondences. DDC should be assigned to monitor the implementation of these notifications and resolutions.
6. Dzongkha should be the main mode of communication in all official meetings, seminars, workshops, meet-the-press and any official forum. If required, the services of interpreters should be provided for foreign participants.
7. The Royal Government should formulate comprehensive language policy vis-à-vis Dzongkha Language.
8. Given the complexity of language, which is one important aspect of culture, further studies by the Social and Cultural Committee is recommended.

In that context, the House reached the consensus that as per the report submitted by the committee, Government, private entities, media, film association, MoE, Dzongkha Development Commission and the community as a whole should take the responsibility and work collectively to enhance Dzongkha competency. For about

62 years (from 1953 till date) the National Assembly has passed many resolutions pertaining to improve the quality of Dzongkha. In accordance to the Royal Decree granted by His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo on 10th Day of the 9th Month of the Water Female Rooster Year and the provisions of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan, the House directed the Ministries and Institutions to respect the Royal Decree. The House consequently adopted the recommendations of the committee and concluded the deliberation. (*25th Day of the 9th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 05th November, 2015*).

5. Question Hour: Group A- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Information and Communication

The speaker informed that for the day's Question Hour, there were only three questions and each Member would be given three minutes to ask the question, and seven minutes to answer the question. The Speaker commenced the session with informing the Members that the supplementary questions would be allotted as per the time limit, and the question hour session must conclude within one and half hour as per the Rules of Procedure.

1. The Member from Panbang Constituency questioned the Information and Communication Minister on the issues of safety and dangers of the new helicopter procured by the Government- since it was one engine helicopter. Secondly, he mentioned that he was skeptical about the sustainability of service charges, and asked whether the Government was going to fund the helicopter service? Thirdly, he further raised his concerns and questioned on the equitable and fair service to the people.
2. The Member from Boomdeling-Jamkhar Constituency questioned the Information and Communication Minister on the

traffic congestion caused by increase in the number of vehicles due to rapid urban development. He further questioned the Minister on the strategies and methods to improve the traffic congestions.

3. The Member from Sergithang- Tsiring Toed Constituency questioned the Information and Communication Minister on the aids and support provided to the media houses in the country to sustain since they play a very important role in the society.

On that given day, the Leader of Opposition asked a supplementary question to the Information and Communication Minister on how the Common people could avail the service of the helicopter, since it was not free of cost. He also questioned on the procedure of the helicopter services in the country. The Member from Lamgong Wangchag Constituency asked the Minister for Information and Communication to provide clarification on the procedure of the helicopter service. The Member from Drujaygang Tseza Constituency questioned the Minister for Information and Communication on the plan to build helipads in different locations of the country. The Member from Nubi Tangsibji Constituency also questioned the Minister for Information and Communication on the plans and programmes to ease the traffic congestions in other Dzongkhags- as the traffic congestion was a major problem in every Dzongkhag and not just in Thimphu. ***(24th day of the 9th month the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 5th November 2015).***

Note: the deliberation and answers on the above questions can be referred in the verbatim of the Questions Hour which has been printed separately.

6. Resolution on withdrawal of United Nations Convention on Rights of Persons with Disabilities

On 25th Day of the 9th Month of Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to November 6, 2015, Member in-charge of the Convention, Foreign Minister in his motion for withdrawal of United Nations Convention on Rights of Persons with Disabilities submitted that owing to its importance, the convention was already signed in 2011 after which it has been submitted to the Parliament for ratification. However, it could not be done since the adoption of the Convention will require a huge amount of budget. Moreover, Foreign Ministry deems it necessary to conduct stake holders meetings and public consultations to review the convention because of which there is a need for more time for such activities. Hence, all the Members unanimously adopted to ratify the convention in the 7th Session by show of hands.

7. Question Hour: Group B- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Education

The Speaker informed that for the day's question hour, there were three questions of which two questions did not make on time as per the Rule of Procedure and were rejected. The speaker also informed that there was only one question for the day's question hour.

1. The Member from Khengkhar-Weringla Constituency questioned the Minister for Education on the policy of equal and fair allocation of Central Schools among the Dzongkhags. He also mentioned that since they already have the system to allocate budget among the schools, the establishment of Central Schools has worsened the situation of the schools in the country. He further questioned about the sustainability of the Central Schools and on the policy to improve the situation of the schools in the country.

On that day, the Member from Drukjeygang-Tseza Constituency asked a supplementary question to the Minister for Education on the possibility to up-grade Tshangkha Lower Secondary School to a Middle Secondary School.

The Member from Panbang Constituency questioned the Minister for Education on the confirmed number of Central Schools established from the 500 schools targeted in the country. He also mentioned that the Government has established only 24 Central Schools and the students in other schools would feel neglected. He also raised that the drop-out rate of 3000-5000 students annually as per the 2014-2015 annual education report was alarming and questioned the reasons for such alarming drop-out rate. He further mentioned that the unequal distribution of central schools among the Dzongkhags depicts the lack of clear policy and criteria for the selection of central schools.

The Member from Bardo-Trong constituency questioned the registration procedure of the enrollment in the central schools.

The Member from Nibu- Tangsibji constituency questioned the Minister for Education on the fair allocation of central schools-as some Dzongkhags have more central schools than others.

The Member from Lamgong-Wangchang constituency questioned the Minister for Education on the principle and reasons for selecting the central school at Wanakha as it was not discussed with the people in the locality.

The leader of the Opposition questioned the Minister for Education on the benefits of providing free education to all the children of Bhutan as per the provisions of the Constitution. He also asked about the compensation for those parents and children, who could not be part of the central school. He further questioned on the achievement of

the national goal of self-reliance by the central school initiative. (*2nd Day of the 10th month the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 13th November 2015*).

Note: the deliberation and answers on the above questions can be referred in the verbatim of the Questions Hour which has been printed separately.

8. Motion for the amendment of Rules of Procedure of National Assembly

On the 10th of November, 2015, corresponding to the 1st Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year, the Chairperson of the House Committee moved the motion for amendment of Rules of Procedure of the National Assembly. He submitted that the reasons for the amendment were due to the amendment of the National Assembly Act and requirement for inclusion of the responsibilities of the Finance Committee in the Rules of Procedure. He also mentioned that since the Rules of Procedure for the Public Accounts Committee had been drafted separately and approved, it needed to be repealed. Moreover, he submitted that that the motion was moved following resolution number 19.0 of the 5th Session to review unviable provisions of the Rules of Procedure and present it in the 6th Session.

After the House directed that the Rules of Procedure need not have to follow the procedures of first and second readings like the Bills, the House deliberated on 40 sections put forward by the House Committee for the amendment of Rules of Procedure. The House deliberated on each and every section for two days; whereby ten sections were amended; ten new sections were incorporated and 16 sections were retained as per the recommendation of the Committee. The deliberation concluded with the House repealing four sections and endorsing the amended Rules of Procedure 2015 of the National Assembly of Bhutan.

9. Implementation status of resolution of the 5th Session

9.1 Report by the Human Rights Committee

Following the resolution of the 5th Session of the Second Parliament, the Chairperson of the Human Rights Committee submitted its report in two parts. The first category of the report was on the open-air prison at Dawakha and youth rehabilitation center at Tsimasham. The second category of the report was on the investigation of allegations made for corruption and on the review of the detention procedure under custody. The members opined that the alleged and suspects were treated alike the prisoners imprisoned following the verdict of the court. They were kept under police custody, which was not consistent with the Human rights provisions where respecting and valuing human rights is fundamental in democracy. Moreover, members have also opined on the arrest of the alleged, and importance of a separate detention room for women and youths under custody. Some members opined on the improvement of detention room conditions in the custody, provide nutrition foods to the youths in the rehabilitation center and to provide them with security clearance certificate after they have served their prison terms.

The House unanimously agreed as following:

1. To review the custody related acts by the Human Rights Committee and submit it in the 8th Session of the 2nd Parliament, since the alleged and suspects kept under police custody were treated (before the courts verdict) alike the prisoners imprisoned following the court verdict which was not in line with the provisions of the human rights.
2. To review the need for an independent detention space for the commission for the alleged and suspects, provision for separate rooms for women and youths, not to put handcuffs on the alleged and suspects while travelling, to improve the overall condition of detention cell/room in the custody by the government, to

re-announce the alleged not guilty of the crime after it has been announced as alleged in the media by the commission, to provide nutrition foods to the youths in the rehabilitation center and to provide security clearance certificate after the youths have served their imprisonment terms and to submit it in the 8th Session of the 2nd Parliament. (*5th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 16th November, 2015*).

9.2 Report of the Women, Children and Youth Committee

In accordance to the resolution of the Fifth Session, the Chairperson of the Women, Children and Youth Committee submitted a report in two parts. The first part of the report included Adoption of National Youth Action Plan and identifying an Alcohol Policy Implementing Agency, Providing guidance and nursing for Teenage Pregnancy, Developing framework policies in the schools, Developing consistency in the sections of related Acts, Working with the concerned agencies involved in research on persons with disabilities, Instituting programmes for child care and examining the need for teachers in the villages. The Chairperson presented a comprehensive report on the eight areas including persons with disabilities.

In the second part of the report, the Chairperson submitted the report as per the resolution of the Fourth Session which included maternity leave to be increased to six months from three months, the status report of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and National Disability Act, and a detailed report on provisions for food for patients in BHUs grade II. The Chairperson presented five main recommendations of the Committee as follow:

1. Cabinet must adopt National Youth Action Plan and strategic alcohol reduction framework and national policy at the earliest possible to minimize the usage of alcohol in the country.

2. Cabinet should look into the earliest possibility of adopting maternity leave which was reviewed and recommended by the RCSC.
3. To provide rights to the disabled people, Foreign Ministry should carry out thorough consultations with the ministries, agencies, civil society organizations and Women, Children and Youth Committee on the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. To this effect, the committee should report in the Seventh Session of the Parliament.
4. Three sections of the Fourth and the Fifth Session resolutions are under implementation process. Works as per these resolutions should be executed by the concerned ministries and agencies at the earliest possible and submit the report thereof to the committee to be tabled in the Seventh Session.
5. The committee responsible for reviewing and harmonizing laws should submit a status report on the review to harmonize and amend the Marriage Act, Penal Code of Bhutan, sections of the Child Care and Protection Act and then submit the status report to the Committee.

While deliberating on the report, some Members submitted that extending maternity leave up to six months from three months would have no problems for the women in civil services whereas that would create inconveniences for women working in the private sectors. In addition, opinions were also shared regarding the risk for women not getting jobs in the private sectors. It was proposed that the Government should look into the possibilities of considering tax exemption or providing incentives to those women working in the private sectors.

In addition, some Members submitted that problems like diseases and deaths due to alcohol in the society had been a rising concern in the country. Furthermore, it was reported that problems were faced both by the doctors and the underage mothers visiting hospitals for delivery since matter as per the law has to be reported to the Royal Bhutan Police. Therefore, it was proposed that the Government must look into providing guidelines for teenage pregnancy and security measures at the earliest possible.

The House commended the Women, Children, and Youth Committee for presenting a comprehensive report. The House passed a resolution for the Committee to consult with the cabinet in finding the means to resolve the problems in extending maternity leave from three months to six months for the women working in the private agencies. The five recommendations submitted by the Committee were endorsed unanimously by the House and resolved that the Government must acknowledge those five recommendations. The deliberation on the Women, Children, and Youth Committee report concluded with the House issuing directives that the Committee should review the ongoing works on various issues and present the actual implementation status of the recommendations in the Seventh Session. (*5th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 16th November, 2015*).

10. Question Hour: Group C- Question relevant to the Ministry of Labour and Human Resources, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Works and Human Settlement

The Speaker informed that for the day's question hour, there were seven questions of which six questions were for oral reply and one question was for written reply. He also informed that the written reply was tabled before each Member of Parliament. He commenced the session by informing that the supplementary questions and

answers should be in line with the questions being asked before a supplementary question.

1. The Member from Nganglam Constituency questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources on the status of pledges made by the Government to provide 100% employment; and unemployment allowances for those unemployed youths. He also questioned on the status of allowances and support provided by the Government to these youths in three years.
2. The Member from Khengkhar-Weringla Constituency questioned the Minister for Health on the plans to provide fair and equal health services to the people. He further asked the Minister about when the MRI and CT scan facilities would be made available in these two regional hospitals, viz. Gelephu and Mongar for effective diagnosis.
3. The Member from Kabji-Talo Constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement on the damages caused by the highway widening activities on the irrigation channel of the Barp Gewog in Punakha Dzongkhag although the ongoing highway widening works was going to benefit the public. He also mentioned that these irrigation channels are indispensable for the people. He further questioned the Minister about the budgets to renovate the two irrigation channels.
4. The Member from Sergithang-Tsirang Toed constituency questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources on the status of vocational and skills training blueprint 2015-2030 to ease the unemployment problem in the country and to improve the skills of the youths.

5. The Member from Nanong -Shumar constituency questioned the Minister for Health on the reasons for not providing autonomy to Jigme Dorji Wangchuck National Referral Hospital in Human Resources and financial management- though it was made autonomous. She further asked the Minister to provide clarification on the responsibilities and authorities of the newly appointed president of the hospital.
6. The Member from South-Thimphu constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human settlement on the validity of re-awarding the contract work on road construction between Dagana and Lhamoizingkha to Gaseb Construction and its counterpart, as reported in the newspaper, which the Government had cancelled earlier as per the recommendation of the Anti-Corruption Commission. He also asked the Minister whether the Government was going to accept its mistake, if the news was to be true. He further asked the Minister to provide clarification on the extra charges the Government has to bear for re-tendering the same work.

On that day, the Opposition Leader asked a supplementary question to the Minister for Health on the procedure of referring patients to regional referral hospitals. He reported that patients from Bumthang hospital are referred to Mongar regional referral hospital and back to Thimphu referral hospital have led to delay and deterioration in patient's health. So, he questioned the Minister on the alternative arrangement system that will speed up the referral process and also questioned on the plans of making essential equipment available to Mongar Referral Hospital and providing training for staff. The Member from Bartsham Shongphu constituency questioned the Minister for Health on the possibility to prioritize procurement of essential equipment in the hospitals over purchasing of helicopter in future. The Member from Nubi Tangsibji constituency questioned

the Minister for Health on the strategies to retain experienced doctors and nurses in the hospital as the resignation of doctors and nurses annually has become a national concern. (*6th Day of the 10th month the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 17th November 2015*).

Note: the deliberation and answers on the above questions can be referred in the verbatim of the Questions Hour which has been printed separately.

11. Motion on ratification of Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal

The Minister for Information & Communications introduced the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal for its adoption. The agreement was endorsed by the House to be deliberated with a show of hands.

Accordingly, the Minister for Information & Communications presented the objectives and background of the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal. He informed that the agreement was initiated under the framework of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) and was endorsed in 2007 during the 14th SAARC summit. The agreement was resolved to be implemented as soon as possible during the 16th and 17th SAARC summits.

The agreement has been formulated to promote regional cross border road transportation and facilitate communications with other countries and systems pertaining to permits, fare and ferry benefiting the contracting parties. It was submitted that the agreement will also

directly benefit the trade. In addition, the agreement was formulated in the interest of saving time and cost for transportation and was signed by the Transport Ministers of above four countries on 15th June 2015. The House was then requested to ratify the agreement.

To this, some of the Members submitted that the agreement will lead to business opportunities and development in the country and also benefit in enhancing the economy. Further, submissions were made that the agreement will strengthen relations among the countries in the region, help control inflation and deflation and address problems associated with travel along the country's borders. Thus, support was expressed for the agreement.

However, some of the other Members expressed that although they supported the agreement, Bhutan had unequal area, population, roads and number of vehicles as compared to other countries in the region. Therefore, the agreement would not benefit in enhancing Bhutan's economy and create business opportunities.

The agreement would also greatly affect the country's independence, security, peace, culture, environment, tourism policies and many others. It was opined that the agreement would affect the people working in the country's transport sector and further affect the philosophy of Gross National Happiness.

Besides, it was submitted that the agreement would lead to more abduction activities in the country and create more problems associated with employment and import of goods. Submission was made that the agreement should not be ratified immediately but should be reviewed once again by holding consultations with relevant agencies and general public on its pros and cons. To this effect, it was submitted that the ratification of the agreement should be deferred.

Following the deliberation on the agreement, the members expressed their views through a show of hand whether or not to defer the ratification of the agreement. As a result, 14 Members out of a total of 42 Members indicated the agreement to be deferred while majority indicated otherwise.

Subsequently, the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal was ratified with 22 Members out of a total of 39 Members voted 'Yes' while 14 Members voted 'No' and three Members abstained. The detail of the voting result is presented in the **Annexure 4**

Expressing his dissenting opinion on not being able to support the ratification of agreement, the Member from Lamgong Wangchang constituency expressed that the agreement will undermine peace, sovereignty, culture, tourism policy and economy of the country. He also expressed that it will affect the transport service and employment in the country. With this, the deliberation concluded on the agreement. (*6th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to 17th of November 2015*).

12. Motion on Introduction and adoption of the Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015 for deliberation

The Minister for Information & Communications, the Member in Charge of the Bill moved the motion for the introduction and adoption of the Civil Aviation Bill of Bhutan 2015. The Bill was then adopted for deliberation by the House with a show of hands.

Presenting the Bill for the second reading, the Member in Charge of the Bill submitted that the international civil aviation sector has witnessed a lot of changes with the risk of greater safety issues in the

sector. Therefore, it was imperative to upgrade the safety standards in the sector. The existing Civil Aviation Act does not cover the abovementioned concerns and thus Bhutan could be identified as a country with unsafe civil aviation system. It was submitted that Bhutan could also be barred from operating flights in other countries. It was set forth that as per the international standard and in order to fulfill important requirements, many new sections have to be incorporated in the existing Act. In order to strengthen the regulatory functions and systems pertaining to the safety of aircrafts, passengers and cargo, it was submitted that the present Act has to be reviewed. The Bill has been drafted based on the standard documents of International Civil Aviation Authority and the International Civil Aviation Organization. The objectives of amending the Act were submitted as follow:

- A. To revise the Civil Aviation Act of Bhutan 2000 as per the international standards
- B. To streamline the Regulatory functions and safety system
- C. To address the important security and safety concerns in the civil aviation
- D. To reform the sector by provisioning power of the regulatory agency in detail avoiding conflict of interest to the maximum
- E. To better manage the system of aviation

To this, some Members submitted that as per Section 196 of the National Assembly Act 2008, the statement of objects and reasons, memorandum regarding delegated legislation and financial memorandum has to be presented along with the Bill for scrutiny of financial viability. In addition, submission was made that given the importance of the Civil Aviation Bill; sections pertaining to

helicopter services should also be reflected in the Bill. On this submission, the Minister for Foreign Affairs expressed that airplane was a general term covering all airborne vessels and the Act will be an umbrella law to this effect. He added that the sections pertaining to helicopter services could be sufficed if reflected in the rules and regulations. The Bill was referred to the Economic Development & Private Sector committee. The committee was directed to review the Bill by holding consultations with relevant ministries, departments and agencies and submit a report during the 7th Session for the third reading. (*7th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 18th November 2015*).

13. Motion to Review and Amend the Civil & Criminal Procedure Code and the Penal Code of Bhutan

Prior to the deliberation on the above agenda, the Member from Panbang constituency submitted that voting held during the seventh sitting on the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal was not in line with the voting procedures. As per Section 4 of Article 13 of the Constitution, he submitted that endorsement shall be with simple majority of the total number of members of the respective Houses and thus the agreement was deemed not to be endorsed. Accordingly, the House directed that the following seven members representing both the ruling and the opposition parties should form a committee and present a report for re-deliberation on the agenda.

Members of the ruling party

1. Minister for Foreign Affairs Damcho Dorji
2. Minister for Economic Affairs Norbu Wangchuk
3. Minister for Information and Communication Dina Nath Dungyel
4. Chairperson of the House Committee Ritu Raj Chhetri

Members of the opposition party

1. Opposition Leader Dr. Pema Gyamtsho
2. Member from Dramedtse-Ngatshang Constituency Ugyen Wangdi
3. Member from Panbang Constituency Dorji Wangdi

The Chairperson of the Legislative committee moved the motion to review and amend the Civil & Criminal Procedure Code and Penal Code of Bhutan. Moving the motion, it was informed that deliberating on the report of the Human Rights Committee, it was resolved that the Legislative committee will review the sections of the Acts pertaining to detention. Further, in order to ensure uniform judicial proceedings by the judges, the word ‘**maximum**’ in Section 39 of the Penal Code of Bhutan (Amendment) 2011 was removed and amended by the Parliament. This has led to problems in the receipt and payment of compensations in a fair manner by the judiciary. As a result, the Supreme Court has re-considered the use of the word ‘**maximum**’ in verdicts for receipt and payment of compensations. Therefore, the committee has moved the motion to amend these laws. It was submitted that the Human Rights Committee and the Women, Children & Youth Committee in reviewing the Civil & Criminal Procedure Code and Penal Code of Bhutan should work in coordination with each other and ensure that it is in consistency with other laws in the country. In the process, if any important issues were to arise, it must be communicated to the Legislative committee. Expressing their views, some Members opined that the word ‘**maximum**’ in section 39 of chapter 4 of the Penal Code had been repealed thus leading to inconveniences pertaining to issues of payment and receipt of compensation. The Supreme Court has therefore, exercised the word, ‘**maximum**’ in its verdicts to ensure justice in the payment and receipt of compensations. It was also mentioned that exercising the word ‘**maximum**’ has affected the independence of the three branches of the government.

He further mentioned that the right to amend and enact new Acts vest only with the Parliament and submitted that the Judiciary must put up petition to move a motion to amend these Acts in the face of inconveniences during implementation. While some Members opined that since people could not get justice, it was resolved in the earlier session that the word, ‘**maximum**’ should be repealed as it was the Judge’s privilege to determine the degree of payment and receipt of compensation. It was also underlined that the Parliament did not repeal the word, ‘**maximum**’ by mistake.

The above two laws were unanimously supported by the House to be reviewed and amended through a show of hands. While reviewing, it was opined that it was imperative to carry extensive review to provide justice to the people and to fulfill the aspirations of His Majesty besides ensuring consistency of the sections in the Acts. Furthermore, it was opined that it was imperative to conduct comprehensive review on the issues of illegal human trafficking and goods both within and outside the country vis-à-vis Prison Act of Bhutan, Marriage Act of Bhutan, Anti-Corruption Act of Bhutan, Child Care and Protection Act of Bhutan and the Royal Police Act. The House expressed that the important opinions stated by the Members to ensure consistency in the laws of the country has to be considered by the Legislative committee. In addition, it was resolved that the Legislative committee should work in coordination with committee instituted by the Cabinet to review laws and submit a report during the 8th session. (*8th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to 19th of November 2015*).

14. Question Hour: Group D- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Ministry of Finance

The Speaker informed that for the day's question hour, there were eight questions of which seven were for the Minister for Economic Affairs and one was for the Minister for Finance.

1. The Member from Radi-Sagteng constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on the status of Kuri-Gongri and Sunkosh hydro power projects and three joint venture projects viz. Bunakha, Amochhu and Wangchhu.
2. The Member from Gangzur-Menjey constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on the status of the stone quarry at Taksha - which was under lease to private contractors and was to be given to Punatshangchhu project after paying huge amount.
3. The Member from Nubi-Tangsibji constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on the plans to provide adequate supply of gas cylinders to the public since people returning home with empty cylinders have become a normal trend.
4. The Member from Drametse-Ngatshang constituency questioned the Minister for Finance on when the Government was going to move a motion in the Parliament to legalize the exemption of sales tax and duty tax on the books imported in the country- as the move has violated the Constitutional provisions and the Public Accounts Act. Although the tax on books was exempted to celebrate the reading year in the country to pay tribute and partake in the 60th Birth Anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo.

5. The Member from Panbang constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on the status of the Chamkharchhu hydro power project as the Minister has agreed during the 5th session to put Chamkharchhu hydro project as a top priority and mentioned that the Chamkharchhu Hydro project be started right after the commencement of the Kholongchhu hydro project.
6. The Member from Khengkhar-Werringla constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on when the Government was going to electrify the villages viz. Romang village under Khengkhar gewog; Gelgong village and Kadak village under Silambi Gewog and Kuma Dzong village and Pikari village under Gongdu Gewog. He mentioned that most of the other rural villages in the eastern part of the country were electrified in the 10th Five Year Plan.
7. The Member from Nanong-Shumar constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on the updates of proposals received for Foreign Direct Investment since 2014 and the fund received in USD for implementing these proposals. The list of the projects and countries which have put up the proposals were also asked about.
8. The Member from North-Thimphu constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on the plans to improve the country's ranking on the ease of doing business as the actual rank has fallen by a unit to 70 while contesting in the general strategy in the ease of doing business. He also mentioned that the improvement in the rank from 125 to top 70 was attributed to the change in the strategy in the ease of doing business whereby the transportation port was focused to be Phuentsholing and not Kolkata as before reducing the time consumption. (*9th Day of*

the 10th month the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 20th November 2015).

Note: the deliberation and answers on the above questions can be referred in the verbatim of the Questions Hour which has been printed separately.

15. Re-deliberation on the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal

On 19th November 2015, the House resolved that a special committee will be formed and present a report thereof on the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal. Accordingly, on 20th of November 2015, the Minister for Economic Affairs on behalf of the special committee presented two recommendations. The first of the recommendations set forth that the Motor vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger & Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal will be referred back to the Ministry of Information & Communications and will be presented for ratification in the 7th Session. Secondly, it was recommended that hereafter, all Bills, laws, conventions and agreements should be endorsed with the support of simple majority of the House. Both the recommendations were endorsed by the House with a show of hands concluding the deliberation. (*9th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 20th of November 2015*).

16. Royal Kasho for the presentation of the Annual Audit Report to the Joint Sitting of Parliament

The Royal Assent is hereby granted on the submission for the deliberation on the report of the Public Accounts Committee

based on the Annual Audit on the 23rd and 24th of November 2015. Submission made on the deliberation of the DzongkhagThromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and the Yenlag Thormde of Paro Dzongkhag on the 25th and 26th of November 2015 is also hereby granted the Royal Assent.

Granted on the 5th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year.

Druk Gyalpo

As directed by the Speaker, the Secretary General read out the Royal Kasho granted by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to the joint sitting of Parliament. Subsequently, the Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee presented the report.

16.1 Report of the Public Accounts Committee

In accordance to Section 6 of Article 25 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan, the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) has the mandate to present the Annual Audit report for the review by the Parliament. Accordingly, the synthesis of annual audit report 2014, synthesis of review reports of annual audit reports of 2009-2013, status of cases forwarded to Anti-Corruption Commission and other business of PAC were presented as follow:

Chapter 1: Synthesis of Annual Audit Report of 2014

The Annual Audit Report of 2014 was presented including the accomplishments of the Royal Audit Authority, summary of audit findings, certification of annual financial statements, detailed audit findings, audit report on the government payroll & provident fund and review of the 10th Five Year Plan.

The Royal Audit Authority had recovered Nu. 115.628 from the total pending irregularities with 48% of recovery from the Ministries,

27% from Dzongkhags and Gewogs and 24% from autonomous agencies, corporations and financial institutions.

The RAA issued a total of 692 audit reports and it was reported that 12 out of 22 audit reports pertaining to fraud and corruption were forwarded to the Anti-Corruption Commission considering the possible existence of element of fraud and corruption.

The total unresolved irregularity reflected in the report is Nu. 634.313 million with highest irregularities of Nu. 239.491 million from among the budgetary agencies reported under the autonomous agencies. Irregularities under the Ministry of Information & Communications were reported at Nu. 85.668 million and irregularities under the Dzongkhags were reported at Nu. 27.587 million. The highest unresolved irregularities under corporations were reported under the Dungsam Cement Corporation Limited with 77.22% and Nu. 179.726 million followed by Bhutan National Bank with irregularities of Nu. 29.927 million.

The highest amount of irregularities was Nu. 263. 888 million reflected under Violation of Laws and Rules category while the least amount of irregularities of Nu. 98.918 million was reflected under the Fraud, Corruption and Embezzlement. Under the shortfalls, lapses and deficiencies category, the amount reported was Nu. 136.458 million followed by Nu. 135.049 million under mismanagement category.

It was reported that 55.12% of the irregularities of the autonomous agencies, 16.06% in corporations and 11.42% in ministries have been resolved. Autonomous agencies such as the Bhutan Education City and National Land Commission have resolved all or most of the irregularities, thereby representing a higher rate of recovery.

As per the annual audit report 2014, the irregularities resolved as of 30th September 2015 was Nu. 15.049 million in ministries which is 11.42% of the total irregularities amount of Nu. 131.762 million. In the autonomous agencies, Nu. 132.00 million which is 55.12 % of the irregularities amount of Nu. 132.491 million was resolved while Nu. 32.473 million of irregularities was resolved in corporations which amounts to 16.06% of the total irregularities of Nu. 202.24 million

Chapter 2: Synthesis of Review Report of Annual Audit Reports 2009-2013

It was reported that according to review report of annual audit reports 2009-2013, the total unresolved irregularities stood at Nu. 612.369 million out of which Nu. 53.417 million representing 8.02% of the total irregularities were resolved.

The highest amount of irregularities unresolved was reported under ministries stood at Nu.545.053 million followed by Nu. 48.486 million of irregularities under corporations and financial institutions. Amongst the ministries, the highest amount of irregularities unresolved was reported under the Ministry of Foreign Affairs at Nu. 196.23 million followed by Ministry of Information & Communications with unresolved irregularities of Nu. 173.63 million. Furthermore, it was informed that the unresolved irregularities of Nu. 45.576 million under the Penden Cement Authority Limited was the highest amount of irregularities reported amongst the corporations and financial institutions.

Chapter 3: Status of cases forwarded to Anti-Corruption Commission

Out of 51 cases forwarded to ACC, 26 cases (50.98%) have been resolved. Further, unresolved 25 cases have been categorized into cases under investigation, submitted to the Office of Attorney

General (OAG) sub- judice and returned for administrative actions.

Chapter 4: Public Accounts Committee’s business

It was reported that as per Rules of Procedure of the Public Accounts Committee 2015, the committee had conducted hearings of four agencies which included Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Samtse Dzongkhag, Naja Gewog and Penden Cement Authority Limited.

The Public Accounts Committee of Bhutan had the opportunity to participate in the 5th Westminster Workshop of Commonwealth Association of Public Accounts Committees (CAPAC). It was also reported that the Commonwealth Association had made a special mention about the Public Accounts Committee of Bhutan in the meeting and declared it to be the first Associate member of CAPAC. The decision to establish the Asian Regional Association of the Public Accounts Committees (ARAPAC) was taken in Dhaka, Bangladesh at a meeting of Public Accounts Committees of the SAARC region in November 2009. During the Annual General Meeting held in Kathmandu, Nepal from 9-11 September 2015, it discussed about the establishment of a permanent secretariat for the Public Accounts Committees. The member countries deliberated in length and eventually agreed to set up the permanent secretariat in Bhutan for three years. Furthermore, it was informed that the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament of Bhutan has been serving as the Secretary General of the ARAPAC since its inception.

Synopsis of the submissions made by the Members on the four chapters of the Annual Audit Report 2014

Most incidences of misuse of government funds have been found in procurement and construction sectors which indicates that builders, private entities, business people and accounts personnel are colluding to misuse funds. Submission was made that the government needs to issue concrete directives to address this issue. Around 70% to 80%

of the budget were being allocated for construction and procurement purposes and in the face of shortage of skilled human resource in the country, the system to place accountability and responsibility should not be made stringent.

There was no specific mention about who should implement the recommendations of the Royal Audit Authority and when it should be implemented. Therefore, the previous recommendations mandating implementations have not been done so far which was undermining the institution of democracy. It was set forth that the responsible ministry and corporation for implementation has to be specifically reflected in the recommendations of the Royal Audit Authority.

The children of diplomats serving in Bhutanese missions abroad were being provided with USD 75 per child towards education allowances with total amount of Nu. 12.856 million being paid so far. To this, the Minister for Foreign Affairs informed that although education allowances were paid as per rules, the rules which were supposed to be revised after three years were not revised. The allowances were continued to be paid and it was right to express that mistake has been committed. The Minister further informed that the Rules & Regulations of 2003 for Foreign Service entitlement has been revised and the draft is going to be tabled in the cabinet for approval. Thus, it was set forth for the continuation of education allowances as before till the revised Rules & Regulations is approved.

However, some Members submitted that payment of education allowances should be stopped until the Rules & Regulations of 2003 is revised. Continuing to pay the education allowances will contradict the laws and procedures and hereafter the Ministry of Foreign Affairs should avoid from incorporating education allowances in its annual budgets.

Providing write-off by the Parliament for the education allowances paid would enable other ministries and departments misusing government funds to demand so. It was also submitted that getting to serve in Bhutanese diplomatic missions abroad was an exceptional opportunity and thus all capable civil servants beyond Ministry of Foreign Affairs should be considered for the opportunity by the Royal Civil Service Commission.

The payment of education allowances was found to be in contravention of the existing procedures during the 3rd Session of the 2nd Parliament and resolution was accordingly passed. However, no strong actions have been taken as per the resolution of the Parliament because of which the deliberation on the issue was resurfacing. To avoid such incidences, it was submitted that the Parliament needs to deal with stronger resolve.

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs set forth that the unresolved irregularities pertaining to the payment made towards education allowances could be resolved as per the Public Finance Act. It was submitted that there was a trend of instituting a committee as per the Public Finance Act to resolve irregularities and thus the provision could be implemented. Varied opinions were also expressed on the payment of education allowances. Subsequently, the Minister for Finance assured that as per section 178 of the Public Finance Act, irregularities pertaining to payment of education allowances will be resolved within six months and a report thereof will be presented in the next session.

The Members deliberating on the deficiencies and lapses of Dzongkhags in the 10th plan submitted that there was no monitoring and quality of work. Further, the main factor for untimely achievement of planned activities was mainly because of lack of adequate monitoring. Submission was made that quality and timely

achievement of planned activities would be possible if each Gewog was provided with an engineer and an accountant as per the Local Government Act.

Based on the amount of unresolved accounts in ministries, autonomous agencies and Dzongkhags, the House while allocating budget to these organizations should contemplate condensing the budget. Concerns were expressed on payment of advances and excess payment and it was opined that the Public Accounts Committee should assess the matter in coordination with the relevant ministries.

Deliberating on the synthesized annual audit reports of 2009-2013, the Members submitted that the irregularities should be resolved within by the respective ministries and agencies. In case the irregularities were not able to be resolved and needs the intervention of the Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC), it should be forwarded to the ACC. The Royal Audit Authority should endeavor to resolve the unresolved irregularities and if some irregularities are not able to be resolved, procedures to impose penalties through due process of law should be reflected in the report with adequate validations. In addition, it was opined that if irregularities were not able to be resolved under all circumstances, even the cabinet should coordinate to address the problem and present a report in the next session.

Among the agencies, the highest irregularities were reported to be under autonomous bodies. Thus, skepticism was expressed that agencies were seeking autonomy mainly because there was opportunity for the autonomous agencies to misuse funds. In this context, the government should contemplate before granting autonomy to agencies.

Misuse of funds were mostly found in construction and procurement sectors and accordingly supervision accountability should be

ultimately held by the ministers, agencies and Dzongdas. It was submitted that it would be suitable if the government issues special directives to address the issue upon comprehensive examination.

Deliberating on the cases forwarded to the ACC, submissions were made that some of the accused were immediately suspended from the civil service while some were not. Thus, such things had to be dealt uniformly.

Some of the contents of the committee's report were not satisfactory as it was not in line with the responsibilities enshrined in the Rules of Procedure of the committee. It was set forth that such contents should be presented in the next report as per the Rules of Procedure. Citing an example, it was submitted that the present report only stated that hydropower debt has been paid off but there was no detailed mention of how much amount was paid which needs to be presented in the summer session.

Furthermore, deliberating on the report for two days, the members expressed above views, doubts and reminders based mainly on supplementing and enhancing the seven recommendations made by the committee. The committee had subsequently revised the recommendations with small additional changes. The final recommendations were endorsed by the majority of the Members with a show of hands as follow:

1. The Ministry of Finance in future must take necessary measures to avoid the occurrences of lapses pertaining to receipts, payments and financial statements in the Annual Financial Statement.
2. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs together with the Ministry of Finance and the Royal Civil Service Commission should revise

the Foreign Service Rules & Regulations (FSRR). The payment of Children Education Allowance for children in receipt of free education either in Bhutan or abroad should be stopped immediately till the FSRR is revised. The existing irregularities should be resolved as per Section 178 and 179 of the Public Finance Act 2007 within six months.

3. The concerned agencies have to strictly follow the financial rules & regulations and the Royal Audit Authority has to enforce the accountability fixation to the immediate supervisors.
4. The government should strictly monitor the implementation of the planned activities in the Dzongkhags and ensure that such lapses and deficiencies are not repeated.
5. For better use of public resources and assuring accountability to the people, the head of the agency is directly accountable for monitoring and resolving the audit irregularities. Therefore, the head of the concerned agency has to take legal action on the officials if the audit irregularities are not resolved within 12 months from the date of issue audit report and accordingly report the implementation status to RAA latest by 30th September of each financial year for incorporation in the Annual Audit Report. However, the head of the agency has to report the legal action taken on the irregularities from 2009 to 2013 to Royal Audit Authority latest by 30th of March 2016. Accordingly the Royal Audit Authority should report the implementation status in 2015 Annual Audit Report as separate chapter. The Ministry of Finance has to issue a circular to all agencies for implementation of the resolution.
6. The government must look into the work of the officials entrusted with multiple responsibilities and need to reassign

the work in order to avoid undermining of fairness ultimately leading to reduction of corruption practice.

Manipulation and tampering of the document resulting into inadmissible payment in the Royal Monetary Authority is a serious concern under category 1 and such issues require immediate attention of the ACC to investigate.

7. Considering the benefits that it would have for the country and as enshrined in the Asian Regional Association of Public Accounts Committees (ARAPAC) Constitution, the PAC recommends the establishment of ARAPAC's permanent secretariat in Bhutan. Similarly, joining Commonwealth Association of Public Accounts Committees (CAPAC) as an associate member would benefit in the capacity building of PAC Members of the Parliament.

The House endorsed the above seven recommendations and commended the Royal Audit Authority for formulating the synthesized report of the Annual Audit Report 2014 and synthesized review reports of Annual Audit Reports of 2009-2013 including its four chapters. The House commended the Royal Audit Authority and the Public Accounts Committee for the outcome which was mainly possible because it shouldered its responsibility and accountability and coordinated with ministries and agencies. The House also expressed that it was imperative to acknowledge and honour the recommendations endorsed and resolution passed by the House. The deliberation on the Annual Audit Report concluded with the House reminding that outcomes based on the recommendations have to be presented while presenting the next report of the committee. (*14th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to 24th November 2015*).

17. Royal Kasho for the deliberation of Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag in the Joint Sitting of Parliament

The Royal Assent is hereby granted on the submission for the deliberation on the report of the Public Accounts Committee based on the Annual Audit on the 23rd and 24th of November 2015. Submission made on the deliberation of the Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag on the 25th and 26th of November 2015 is also hereby granted the Royal Assent.

Granted on the 5th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year.

Druk Gyalpo

As directed by the Speaker, the Secretary General read out the Royal Kasho granted by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to the Joint Sitting of Parliament. Subsequently, the Minister for Works & Human Settlement moved the motion to endorse the Thromdes.

17.1 Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag

The Minister for Works & Human Settlement submitted that it was imperative to establish one Dzongkhag Thromde and one Yenlag Thromde for each Dzongkhag as per the provisions of the Constitution and the Local Government (Amendment) Act 2014. Accordingly, the ministry has prepared maps based on the report routed through the Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu which has been circulated to the Hon Members. The motion was moved by the Minister to endorse the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag by the House in order to promote balanced regional and economic development.

Deliberating on the motion, the Members of Parliament from Paro Dzongkhag and other Members submitted that the proposal of the Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu on Yenlag Thromde of Paro should be respected. However, other Members submitted that it was important to endorse the Yenlag Thromde based on the area coverage and population of a place. Furthermore, some Members opined that deliberations should be held based on the recommendations tabled in the House.

Before the Yenlag Thromde was endorsed, it was set forth to ascertain whether the total Members as reflected in Section 4 of Article 1 of the Constitution meant the total of 72 Members of Parliament or whether it referred only to the total of 69 Members present at the moment. To this, some Members led by the Chairperson of the National Council submitted that the total number of Members of Parliament has to be considered as 72 Members. Accordingly, the submission was unanimously endorsed by the Members through a show of hands.

Following this, voting on Bjitsiphu as the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag, 28 Members voted 'Yes' and 31 Members voted 'No' while five Members abstained from voting. There were 64 Members present during the voting. Bjitsiphu could not be endorsed as the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag as it did not secure three-fourths of the votes. The details of the voting result is presented in the **Annexure 5**

17.2 Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag

The Minister for Works & Human Settlement informed that as per the resolution of the 5th Session, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag was notified to hold consultations with the general public and submit a proposal on Thromdes. Subsequently, the Ministry through

Pemagatshel Dzongkhag Tshogdu had received the proposals. As per the provisions of the Constitution and the Local Government (Amendment) Act 2014, it is important to establish Dzongkhag Thromde and therefore, the Ministry once again moved the motion to endorse the Dzongkhag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and solicited the support of the Members.

Deliberating on the motion, submission were made that there was no need for further submissions to be made by Members from Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and deliberations should be held based on the recommendations presented. With such submissions, doubts were expressed whether or not the Yenlag Thromde and Dzongkhag Thromde of Pemagatshel would be endorsed. Other Members opined that the voting should be held on the recommendations made by the Dzongkhag Tshogdu through the government and there was no reason to prolong the deliberation. Furthermore, some other Members submitted that in order to endorse the remaining Thromdes, it would be beneficial if a joint committee could be instituted before coming to a final conclusion.

Some of the Members reminded that if a special joint committee was to be instituted to declare Yenlag Thromde and Dzongkhag Thromde for Pemagatshel Dzongkhag, it has to be ensured that the Legislative procedure of 2011 is not contravened until its revision. Following elaborate deliberation, some of the Members led by the Minister for Works & Human Settlement expressed support for the institution of a special joint committee before voting on the motion. They submitted that if decision is taken as per the report of the special joint committee, the Members will have a common consensus while endorsing the Yenlag Thromde and Dzongkhag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag.

Subsequently, the House instituted a 12 Member special joint

committee comprising of five Members from the National Council and seven Members from the National Assembly. It was resolved that the decision will be made based on the report of the committee. Furthermore, the committee was directed to deliberate on Yenlag Thromde and Dzongkhag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag along with the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag which was negated. (*15th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 25th of November 2015*).

17.3 Report by the Joint Committee of Parliament

The Chairperson of the joint committee of Parliament, the Member of National Council from Wangduephodrang Dzongkhag presented the committee's detailed report on the 26th of November 2015. The consensus reached by the committee to endorse Thromdes were:

1. Betekha as the Yenlag Thromde for Paro Dzongkhag
2. Denchi as the Dzongkhag Thromde for Pemagatshel Dzongkhag;
3. Nganglam as the Yenlag Thromde for Pemagatshel Dzongkhag; and
4. Resolve that Paro Dongkhag Thromde issues to be re-tabled by the Government in consultation with the Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu in the next Joint Sitting of the Parliament. Meanwhile Election Commission of Bhutan shall defer the upcoming local government (Thromde) election for Paro Dzongkhag for which Speaker will issue instructions to ECB.

Bonday was earlier proposed as the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag but as per the resolution of the 5th Session, Bonday was merged with the Dzongkhag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag. Similarly, submission was made for Bjitsiphu to be merged with Paro Dzongkhag

Thromde given its close proximity to the Dzongkhag Thromde.

The House resolved that as per the parliamentary procedure, voting will be held on the above recommendations without any deliberation. In accordance to the provisions of the Constitution, it was resolved that the voting on the first three recommendations will be conducted as per Section Four of Article one of the Constitution while voting on recommendation No. 4 will be conducted as per Section 4 of Article 13 of the Constitution. The results of the voting are as follow:

Sl. No.	Thromde	Total number of Members	Yes	Abstain	No
1	Betekha, Yenlag Thromde for Paro	67	66	01	00
2	Denchi, Dzongkhag Thromde for Pemagatshel	67	64	01	02
3	Nanglam, Yenlag Thromde for Pemagatshel	67	67	00	00
4	The Re-deliberation of Paro Dzongkhag Thromde in the next Session	67	54	05	08

The details of the voting result are presented in the **Annexure 6, 7, 8 and 9**

Following the endorsement of the above Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromdes, the floor was asked to express any dissenting opinion. Expressing his views, the Member from Khar-Yurung constituency thanked the Members for endorsing the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag and Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag with the aim to promote balanced regional development. The Member from Lamgong-Wangchang

constituency expressed his gratitude for the support accorded to retable the Paro Dzongkhag Thromde in consultation with the Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu in the summer session.

Some Members expressed doubts that the recommendation No. 4 maybe in contravention of Section 90 of the Election Act and the Local Government Act and thus it was imperative to contemplate the issue properly. Submission was also made that the Legislative Procedure of 2011 needs to be reviewed before the summer session and report of the Joint Sitting of Parliament should be submitted before His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

The Members submitted that as resolved to review the issue of Paro Dzongkhag Thromde, issues pertaining to other Dzongkhag Thromdes should also be reviewed by the Parliament. It was opined that if such review was to be carried out again, it would be of beneficial and was hoped that the Members would support it.

Concerns were expressed that endorsing Dzongkhag Thromdes as per the provisions of the Constitution and the Local government Act and without considering the appropriateness and potential of respective Dzongkhags would lead to problems pertaining to taxation and urban amenities. It was also submitted that minor glitches between maps endorsed by the Parliament and actual implementation on ground should be taken into consideration.

The Member in Charge for Thromde declaration, the Minister for Works & Human Settlement informed that slight changes required on the ground in relation to the maps endorsed by the Parliament were conceivable because of the topography of the place. However, it was clarified that such issues can be addressed at the local level and it was important to be dealt accordingly. She expressed that the motion to endorse the remaining Thromdes were well deliberated

in the joint sitting of Parliament and the special joint committee presenting consensual recommendations. The Minister expressed her thanks for endorsing the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag and the Yenlag Thromde and Dzongkhag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag.

The map for the Paro Dzongkhag Thromde was not prepared as decided by the Ministry of Works & Human Settlement but was formulated as per the proposal of the Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu. The proposal was subsequently deliberated in the Parliament and was endorsed through voting. However, it was expressed that Ministry was not in a position to make any comments on the recommendation to once again review the already endorsed Paro Dzongkhag Thromde. The deliberation on the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag and the Yenlag Thromde and Dzongkhag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag was held extensively with check and balance. Consequently, with the firm objective to establish Thromdes, upon the consensus of the House, a special joint committee was instituted. The committee following comprehensive deliberation presented a report with four recommendations which were endorsed unanimously by the Members during the voting. It was acclaimed that such endorsement was exemplary for the rest of the world.

Although opinions and interpretation of the Members may vary but at the end, it was imperative to fulfill the aspirations of Their Majesties and the people. It was reminded that it was also imperative to maintain such consensus for everything which is in larger interest of the people and the country.

It was directed that the Government should expedite the works for the establishment of Thromdes and be mindful of the command of His Majesty on the rule of law in the country. It was imperative to implement all development activities and fulfill the aspirations of

the people as per the rule of law. Further, it was directed that small problems faced by the people should be addressed without tabling it in the Parliament.

Besides, the Speaker expressed his thanks as the concerns of the Speaker surrounding the deliberations on Thromde were able to be addressed by the Members without having to use his prerogatives. With this, the deliberation on the Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag and the Yenlag Thromde and Dzongkhag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag concluded. (*16th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 26th of November 2015*).

18. Question Hour: Group A- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Home and Culture Affairs, Ministry of Information and Communication, and Ministry of Foreign Affairs

The Speaker informed that for the day's question hour, there were eight questions of which one was for written answer. He also informed that the written answer to the question was tabled before everyone. The Speaker commenced the session by informing that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given if the time permits at the end of the questions listed for the day.

1. The Member from Drukjeygang-Tseza constituency questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the possibilities to bifurcate Karnag Gewog after the completion of ten years requirement enshrined in the Constitution since the Gewog was split by a mountain and people could not attend or participate in any important meetings.
2. The Member from Nubi-Tangsibji constituency questioned the Minister for Information and Communication to provide an oral reply to the petition put up by the Taxi Operators Association to

the ministry as the ministry did not give any reply till date. He also mentioned that there has been an increase in the number of tourists in the country- particularly South Asian Regional tourists.

3. The Member from Panbang constituency questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the possibility to increase the daily allowance for the mask dancers and folk dancers in the Dzongkhags since the Dzongkhags were facing challenges of not getting dancers during the annual tshechu.
4. The Member from Boomdeling-Jamkhar constituency questioned the Minister for Foreign Affairs on the possibilities for local residents to open a Forex account facilities in the local banks. He further questioned the Minister on the status of providing postal ballots during the next election, for those living abroad.
5. The Member from Khar-Yurung constituency questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the status of the Mega Farms in Samrang and Yusipang which were alleged to be pushed by the Government despite vehement opposition from the public. He further questioned the Minister on the strategies to prevent such desecrating causes in a Buddhist country like Bhutan.
6. The Member from Khenkhar-Weringla questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the Local Government Members Entitlement Act of Bhutan 2015, which was enacted in May this year- which should be effective thereof. However, it was told that its rules and regulations are yet to be adopted and their retirement benefits may not be paid when the Local Government Leaders complete their term by the beginning of

2016. In this regard, the Minister was asked to explain on the implementation status of the Local Government Acts, Rules and Regulations, and the retirement benefit entitlements.

7. The Member from Wamrong constituency questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the strategies and laws to avoid desecrating and defiling holy sites like Membartsho, in Bumthang- as the videos about a foreigner swimming in the lake was wide spread on the Facebook and Youtube.

The Member from Dophuchen-Tading constituency asked a supplementary question to the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on the possibility to bifurcate Dophuchen Gewog into two Gewogs, after the completion of ten years requirement in the Constitution since the Gewog size is very large and is densely populated. (*17th Day of the 10th month the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 27th November 2015*).

Note: the deliberation and answers on the above questions can be referred in the verbatim of the Questions Hour which has been printed separately.

19. Implementation status of the Resolution of the 5th Session

19.1 Finance Committee Report

The Finance Committee presented its report on the Government's budget for the Fiscal Year 2015-16 during the fifth Session of the Second Parliament. The committee reported eleven recommendations which were endorsed by the House. The committee was in constant consultation and had conducted four meetings with Ministry of Finance (MoF) and Royal Monetary Authority of Bhutan (RMA) to follow up on the recommendations of the fifth session. Hence, following are the gist of report presented to the House after reviewing the recommendations:

1. Regarding the allocation of the budget resources, it should be strictly in line with resource envelope. The Government allocates the budget for the planned activities during each financial year and the allocation is kept within the available resources.
2. On the annual resource gap which is within the limit of international benchmark for the FY 2014-15, however, the resource gap must be reviewed as it is cumulative in nature that could add to the debt stock, the Ministry of Finance assured that the resource gap for the 11th FYP shall be maintained below 5% and that it shall not add to the debt stock.
3. In order to achieve fiscal policies, it is imperative to maintain non-hydro debt below 35% of GDP. On the Committee's recommendation to set limit in the public debt policy, it was reported that the MoF has already included this provision in the draft Public Debt Policy which is currently submitted to the GNHC.
4. On the Government's initiative to review the formula of budget allocation for balanced development, it was reported that the current resource allocation formula includes poverty index, population, transportation and geography for a balanced development. Meanwhile the GNHC is reviewing the formula for preparation of the 12th FYP.
5. Regarding the Government's initiative to review the policy on how to contain growing deficit where the growth of expenditure is more than growth of revenue, it was submitted that MoF assured that the fiscal deficit shall be maintained at 3 % of GDP on average during the 11th FYP. The deficit is expected to be reduced by the commissions paid by the on-going hydropower projects.

6. On the tourism budget, the Committee felt that the Ministry of Finance should consult with the tourism Council of Bhutan to review the requirement of such huge fund for market promotion (travel fair), website and other advertisement materials. In this context, the MoF reported that they have consulted with the Tourism Council regarding the budget allocation to which the Tourism Council Office had justified that this is just the 50% of total budget requirement of which another 50% is contributed by the travel agents themselves. Moreover, they are using websites of other countries and social Medias for promotional purposes that are cheaper than hoisting the webs by themselves.
7. Regarding the underutilization of the budget which should be avoided through more diligent planning and holding concerned agencies accountable through the APA, it was reported that the MoF had initiated various measures for making agencies to utilize it.
8. On the general reserves where more information should be provided on the activities including the actual budget utilization of the past year, the MoF have stated that this provision was for ad-hoc and disaster related programs that are transferred to the respective agencies contingent to the occurrence of the earmarked activities. The details of activities and agency receiving the amount will be known after transfer is made while the whole details will be known at the end of every financial year. However, the MoF agreed to provide the detail activities on the General Reserves.
9. Regarding the FDI inflow both in the government and private sector over the past year to be included in the budget report, it was presented that MoEA and MoF have agreed to provide the information.

10. On the Government to be more diligent in budget planning and minimizing supplementary appropriations, it was recommended that the supplementary appropriation bill can be submitted in the winter session. It was reported, as per Section 60 of the Public Finance (Amendment) Act 2012, the Minister for Finance has the authority to incorporate external funds without recourse to the Parliament and to report in the Parliament at a later stage as part of the revised budget. The MoF would submit during winter session on case-by-case basis.
11. On the recommendation to provide budget utilization for the hydropower projects in the budget report including revenue projection of the projects, the MoF had agreed that under Chapter 10 of the budget report, a separate section on hydro-power project would include how much fund had been received and utilized in that particular Financial Year. Moreover, nine out of 11 recommendations had been achieved as per the resolution of the House and the remaining two are in the implementation process.

While deliberation on this report, the members submitted that regarding the first recommendation, Finance Committee after extensive analysis should submit a report to the House on allocation of budget in the country. Moreover, the members opined that Members of Macro-economic Framework Coordination Committee (MFCC) and their functioning should also be reported owing to the importance of keeping National Assembly Members well informed on the mentioned issues.

To this, the Finance Committee Chairperson reported that MFCC comprises of Members from Department of Revenue and Customs (DRC), Department of Budget, Department of Energy, Royal Monetary Authority (RMA), National Statistical Bureau (NSB) and

Gross National Happiness Commission (GNHC).

On the second recommendation, the Finance Minister submitted the need to include the actual resource gap in debt stock. However, in the last session some members have opined that the government should include actual resource gap with the debt. Therefore, members have also suggested the House to once again re-visit last session's resolution.

The Committee Chairperson in his clarification for the above statement submitted that while consulting with the Ministry of Finance (MoF), it was highlighted that since actual resource gap is included in planned budget, it is not included in debt stock.

On the fourth recommendation, Members submitted, budget allocation should be based on poverty index, population, transportation and geography. Moreover it was recommended that to bring about balanced development in the 12th Five Year Plan, resource allocation should also be based on the current development status of the area. Also, the Members deemed it necessary to refine the budget allocation for the 12th FYP as the current budget allocation was found to be problematic.

On the sixth recommendation, submissions were made that since dispatching people for ex-country trainings to develop tourism sector is expensive, educating the tourist well during their visits in the country would reduce the expenses. Moreover, using Bhutan Broadcasting Service for Tourism promotions instead of using other country's social media and networks would reduce expenses too.

The Economic Affairs Committee of the National Council would submit a report related to Tourism Sector to the government. Similarly, it would be very helpful if the Economic Development

and Private Sector Committee of National Assembly could review and submit a similar report. It was also opined that the ratification of Motor Vehicle Agreement for the regulation of passenger and cargo vehicle traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal would benefit the development of tourism at large.

On the seventh recommendation, Members said that underutilization of budget was mainly because agencies get inadequate time for preparation of budget as has to be done in two to three weeks. Moreover, because of work site conditions, duration of work and workers, planned activities are left incomplete because of which allocated budgets are not fully utilized. Hence, it was felt necessary to improve the budget release system.

Furthermore, Finance Committee was recommended to review the reasons for under utilization of budget and report to the House. It was also mentioned that Finance Ministry's measures for full utilization of budget should be reported in detail.

For that the Chairperson reported that the measures drafted by Finance Ministry would be improved on measures of continuous budget for annual performance agreement and mid-term budget report.

On the eighth recommendation, Members submitted that despite keeping a huge amount of money for general reserves, its utilization was not known. Thus, detailed information on general reserves should be included in annual budget report hereafter. In that context, the Finance Minister informed general reserves are utilized in ad-hoc and disaster related programme.

With regard to the 10th recommendation, Finance Minister said that the Finance Minister has the authority to incorporate supplementary budget as per the Section 60 of the Public Finance (Amendment) Act

2012. Since, the Act states “**May**” the Supplementary Appropriation Bill can be presented in the winter session. However, as the remainder has to be presented in the summer session, the work would have to be done twice.

In that context, some members said that as the supplementary budget had to be sanctioned by the Parliament as per the Act, it should be presented during the winter session. Furthermore, Members expressed their concerns on the problems in future with regard to including internal budgets in the Supplementary Appropriation Bill whereby, in the past only external funds received were to be included in the Bill.

On the 11th recommendation, the House submitted that since the budget of Hydro-power project is an estimated one, a draft amount should be included in the budget report.

The House directed Finance Committee to consult with relevant agencies and carry out an extensive review on budget allocation and Tourism Policy. Moreover, the importance of allocating budget should be according to development status. It was also recommended that underutilized budget along with the budget and expenses of hydro power projects should be included in the budget report. Further, while reviewing the report for the next session, Finance Committee was reminded to take account of the concerns raised in the House. The deliberation on the report of the Finance Committee concluded with the House thanking the Committee for reviewing and presenting the finance report. **(27th November 2015 corresponding to 17th day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year).**

20. Re-deliberation on Jabmi (Amendment) Bill 2014

On 22nd Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year of the Bhutanese calendar corresponding to December 2, 2015, Member in-charge of the Bill, Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs moved the motion to endorse the amendment clauses on Jabmi (Amendment) Bill submitted by National Council for re-deliberation. During which, he submitted that out of the 34 clauses amended by National Assembly, 18 were endorsed, 16 were further improved and 16 new clauses were proposed for amendment by National Council. The total of 32 clauses was submitted for re-deliberation as per Constitution of Bhutan and it was in turn submitted for endorsement to the House as per the Rules of Procedure.

Of the amendment clauses submitted by National Council, clauses relevant to Jabmi Thuentshog, ex-Drangpon and National Council Member participating as Members of Jabmi Tshogde, Members proposed that the clauses relevant to Jabmi Thuentshog to be kept as amended by National Assembly. During the extensive deliberation, Members expressed their views on allowing ex-Drangpons to practice as Jabmis before courts as per Article 7(10) of the Constitution. After agreeing to keep National Assembly's amendment related to Jabmi Thuentshog unchanged, Members decided to re-deliberate on every clauses in depth.

While deliberation on a total of 32 clauses submitted by National Council on December 2 & 3, 2015, 7 clauses along with 3 sub clauses were endorsed and the disputed clauses were agreed to be deliberated in the Joint Sitting. Hence, on December 4, 2015, the Member in-charge of the Bill, Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs moved the motion to adopt the Bill as per the Rules of Procedure. The Jabmi (Amendment) Bill 2014 was adopted as per the Constitution of Bhutan and Rules of Procedure with 43 Members present and

voting. The detail of the voting result is presented in the **Annexure 10**

21. Motion for withdrawal of the Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan 2015

The Minister for Economic Affairs, the Member in Charge of the Bill informed that the Enterprise Registration Bill 2015 was formulated in line with the policy of developing small enterprises in 2012. He further informed that the Bill was formulated in consultation with relevant departments, agencies and international consultants. Thereupon, the Bill was deliberated in the Cabinet and it was endorsed in the 5th Session by the National Assembly after extensive deliberation on the principles and objectives of the Bill. The Bill was then referred to the National Council.

Further, the Minister in Charge of the Bill stated that he had presented the Bill in the 16th Session of the National Council for its deliberation. Following this, the Minister had expressed hopes that the National Council would deliberate on the Bill and make its recommendations.

However, the National Council had expressed doubts that the Bill has not been comprehensively consulted with the relevant agencies and it lacked consistency in its objectives and provisions of the Bill. Doubts were also expressed on how the Bill could facilitate the one stop service centre and moreover providing services from one place was an administrative function and thus the Bill was not seen to be needed.

Furthermore, many new sections and chapters need to be incorporated in the Bill and the consistency has to be ensured between the English and Dzongkha texts. Therefore, the National Council has recommended for withdrawal of the bill as more time is required to conduct further review on the Bill.

It was informed that the government had aimed to provide legal basis to the business enterprises through the Bill in order to work as per a uniform system and promote business. In this context, the Bill was formulated after holding consultation by the Government and the Ministry with international consultants and relevant agencies and departments in the country. The National Council had however expressed that the Bill be withdrawn considering the above grounds it has mentioned. The Minister submitted that the Bill maybe withdrawn by the House as resolved by the National Council.

To this, the Chairperson of the Economic Development & Private Sector committee submitted that the Bill be withdrawn as the provisions and the objectives of the Bill were not in conformity and consistency between the English and the Dzongkha texts of the Bill had to be smoothened. Subsequently, in the best interest of the House, the House resolved that the Government should review and re-introduce it in the next session.

Accordingly, the Member in Charge of the Bill moved the motion on the 4th of December 2014 to withdraw the Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan 2015 by the National Assembly as recommended by the National Council. Voting on the Bill, 42 Members voted in favour of the Bill to be withdrawn and one Member voted against the Bill to be withdrawn while one Member abstained from voting. It was resolved that the bill will be withdrawn and the Government was asked to re-table the Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan 2015 in the House after appropriate tie. The detail of the voting result is presented in the **Annexure 11**

One of the Members made submission that the government should hold comprehensive consultations with the relevant departments and agencies and reflect the principles of the Bill explicitly in its provisions before the Bill is re-tabled in the House. It was also reminded that the

Government Bills must be examined by the cabinet and moreover the relevant Minister must review the Bill meticulously. With this, the deliberation on the Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan 2015 was concluded. (*23rd Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 3rd of December 2015*).

22. Question Hour: Group B- Questions relevant to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Forestry and Agriculture, and Ministry of Education

The Speaker informed that for the day's question hour, there were five questions. The session commenced by informing that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given towards the end of the question hour session subject to availability of time.

1. The Member from Drujegang-Tseza constituency questioned the Prime Minister on the land replacement which was not provided to people of Gelegchu although the electricity cables were extended through their inherited land. It was submitted that land replacement was not admissible if the land was uncultivable as per the Land Act which was creating big problems for the people. Thus, the Prime Minister was questioned on how the problem could be addressed without having to amend the Land Act.
2. The Member from Nubi-Tangsibji constituency questioned the Minister for Agriculture & Forestry that reportedly the incidence of tiger attacks under Nubi Gewog of Trongsa Dzongkhag was on rise affecting the domestic animals with some even getting killed. He added that compensations were provided to affected people in the past while it was not the case at present. Thus, he questioned on the measures taken by the Ministry of Agriculture & Forestry to mitigate such incidences.

3. The Member from Panbang constituency questioned the Prime Minister that the Royal Government has aimed to achieve self-reliance within 1990 to 2020. However, he expressed that the present government was not resorting to revenue generation activities while spending hundreds of thousands as expenditure. Therefore, concerns were expressed on how self-reliance could be achieved and questioned on the measures and policies which were being formulated to achieve the goal.
4. The Member from Nanong-Shumar constituency questioned the Minister for Education on the plans to provide jobs to graduates from teaching training colleges. She submitted that a total of 526 teacher trainees will be soon graduating from two teacher training colleges and there was a total of 1,446 unemployed teachers in the country.
5. The Member from Chokhor-Tang constituency submitted that one of the main pillars of Gross National Happiness was good governance and the civil servants were indispensable for good governance. He expressed that the civil servants at present were faced with challenges to assume accountability while shouldering their responsibilities. Committees were being formed to reach decisions as civil servants were shielding themselves from the risks of getting involved in corruption. Therefore, timeliness of work was being compromised since all decisions had to be determined by the committees which was also affecting the timely delivery of services to the people. The Member questioned on measures which were being taken by the government to address the issue if what has been heard was true.

It was submitted that the government has instituted committees for public debt policy and development of eastern Bhutan. Further, the

Royal Civil Service Commission has instituted an organizational development committee. Thus, the outcomes of these committees were questioned for the information of the people.

Asking a supplementary question to the Minister for Agriculture & Forestry, the Member from Bardo-Trong constituency submitted that aged tigers were wandering in rural areas. To this effect, measures taken by the government to conserve these tigers were questioned.

In his supplementary question to the Minister for Education, the Member from Dophuchen-Tading constituency mentioned that teacher trainees faced with the problem of unemployment despite completing their training. In order to prevent unemployment problems in future, it was imperative to provide teacher training based on the estimated demand for teachers in the next two to three years. In this regard, plans and policies of the Ministry to provide teacher training based on such estimates were questioned by the Member. (*24th Day of the 10th month the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 4th December 2015*).

Note: the deliberation and answers on the above questions can be referred in the verbatim of the Questions Hour which has been printed separately.

23. Re-deliberation on the United Nations Convention Against Corruption

The Minister for Home & Cultural Affairs informed that the National Council had deliberated on the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) and made a reservation which states “**The Royal Government of Bhutan shall not be bound by paragraph 2 of Article 66 of the United Nations Convention Against Corruption**”. The UNCAC was then transmitted to the National Assembly for re-deliberation as per Article 13.7 of the Constitution. The Chairperson of the Foreign Relations Committee informed that

the committee had held discussion on the reservation made by the National Council with the relevant agencies. Further, it was informed that during the discussions, the committee was conveyed that similar reservations were also made by other countries and the reservation would safeguard the security and sovereignty of the country. The House as submitted by the Foreign Relations Committee endorsed the reservation made by the National Council.

Accordingly, on the 4th of December 2015, the Minister for Home & Cultural Affairs moved the motion to adopt the United Nations Convention Against Corruption with 43 Members voting ‘Yes’ while one Member abstained from voting. There was a total of 44 Members present during the voting. With the adoption, the deliberation concluded on the United Nations Convention Against Corruption. The detail of the voting result is presented in the **Annexure 12. (23rd Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 3rd of December 2015).**

24. Motion on the re-deliberation of the Framework Agreement between the European Investment Bank and the Kingdom of Bhutan 2015

Moving the motion to re-deliberate on the Framework Agreement between the European Investment Bank and the Kingdom of Bhutan, the Minister for Finance submitted that the European Investment Bank was established in 1959. He also informed that the Royal government started diplomatic relations with the bank in the year 1985 and the bank is a multilateral financial institution owned by 28 countries. The bank is not only one of the financial arms of the European Union but also one of the biggest nonprofit financial institutions operating under the policy of development and cooperation.

The European Investment Bank has signed framework agreement

with all South Asian countries except Bhutan and Afghanistan. A total of 90% of the investment projects made by the 28 European states have been implemented within their territory. Projects have also been signed with the European Investment Bank in around 150 countries.

Therefore, the National Assembly ratified the Framework Agreement during the 5th Session and referred it to the National Council. The Framework Agreement was subsequently deliberated by the National Council on the 6th of November 2015 and concluded with 13 objections. Three of the objections pertained to undermining of the country's sovereignty, system of taxation and immigration privileges. The Minister expressed that it was a disappointment that the National Council could not ratify the Framework Agreement on the above grounds.

The Framework Agreement was comprehensively reviewed by the Ministry of Finance and was extensively deliberated by the National Assembly during the 5th Session. The Framework Agreement was then ratified after 35 Members of the total 37 Members present voted in favour. It was submitted that the government and civil servants have never taken any step which would undermine the sovereignty of the country and will continue to avoid doing so.

The National Assembly had ratified a total of 30 international agreements and treaties till 2007 while a total of 26 similar agreements were ratified between 2008 and 2015 by the first and the Second Parliament without any objection. The incidence of objection on an international agreement between the two Houses resulting in re-deliberation had occurred for the first time.

It has been 30 years ever since Bhutan signed agreements with the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank. Bhutan has been

availing limited loans from these two international banks with the obligation of subscription fees. If the loans were to be availed from the European Investment Bank, it would be concessional loans with low interest rate and without requiring to pay subscription fees. It was submitted that this will benefit the country in enhancing its economic self-reliance.

Supported by 28 European states, the Framework Agreement has been signed with the European Investment Bank to create better future avenues and was not aimed to avail loans immediately. It was informed that if loans were to be availed, it would require separate legal agreements for each project and thus reasons were not seen as to why the Parliament should not ratify the Framework Agreement. In addition, Bhutan has always been recognized as a sovereign country by the 28 members of the European Union and the signing of the Framework Agreement has further strengthened the recognition of the sovereign status of the country.

The government respectfully acknowledges the general objections made by the National Council. However, as the country graduates to a Middle Income Country, the signing of framework agreement will greatly benefit the country in availing low interest rate loans in the face of decreasing international grants and aid. It was expressed that the responsibility to uphold the sovereignty of the country was not only the duty of the National Council but also of the National Assembly if there were clauses undermining the country's sovereignty.

It was submitted that the Framework Agreement has no clauses which would undermine the country's sovereignty and therefore it was important to ratify it considering both the present and future benefits for the country.

Deliberating on the Framework Agreement, some of the Members

opined that the agreement would make the national laws and rules null and void. On contrary, most of the Members submitted that the Framework Agreement will not undermine the country's sovereignty and was not in contradiction to the provisions of the Constitution either. Submissions were made that the loans from the European Investment Bank would greatly benefit the country if the international grants and aid declines. Opinions were expressed by some of the Members that there was no debt policy in the country which was required to streamline the system of availing loans from the banks. Therefore, it was set forth that it was imperative to discuss on the debt policy in the summer session and subsequently ratify the Framework Agreement.

In order to ratify the Framework Agreement in the summer session, numerous recommendations were made that the government should re-deliberate on the objections made by the National Council and arrange to provide detailed clarifications. To this, the Minister for Finance informed that benefits of the Framework Agreement were comprehensively presented when it was introduced in the National Council. Furthermore, the Minister informed that the benefits of the Framework Agreement on the country's relation with other countries were also conveyed to the National Council.

Besides, some of the Members set forth that in order to clarify on the objections made by the National Council, a joint committee should be formed to revisit the Framework Agreement. Others opined and recommended the Framework Agreement to be deferred till the summer session. This would provide time to explicitly review each and every clause of the Framework Agreement for ratification in the joint sitting during the summer session. It was opined that before signing an international legal instrument, it was important to review the position of the country and formulate strong system for ratifying international legal instruments in future.

The House extensively deliberated on the European Investment Bank Framework Agreement and reached a common consensus to re-table it in the summer session of Parliament. The House also reached a decision to submit to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo on the matter after majority of the Members agreed with a show of hands. The deliberations concluded after it was resolved that the motion to this effect will be voted on the 7th of December 2015. (*24th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 4th of December 2015*).

On the 7th of December 2015, the Minister for Finance submitted that 150 countries have ratified the Framework Agreement and thus it was also important for Bhutan to ratify the Framework Agreement. The Framework Agreement will be of benefit for the country and when it comes to availing loans, separate agreements have to be signed depending on projects. The Minister further informed that loans will not be availed immediately soon after it is ratified. Therefore, the Minister requested the Members for their careful contemplation and moved the motion for adoption for re-deliberation in summer session. Voting on the motion, out of 37 Members present, 36 Members voted ‘Yes’ while one Member abstained from voting. Securing the simple majority of the House, the Framework Agreement was resolved to be considered as a disputed Bill as per Section 8 of Article 13 of the Constitution and it was also resolved that the Framework Agreement will be deliberated in the summer session subject to the Royal assent. The detail of the voting result is presented in the **Annexure 13**. (*26th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 7th of December 2015*).

25. Motion to re-deliberate on the Companies Bill of Bhutan 2015

The Member in Charge of the Bill, the Minister for Economic Affairs expressed that the Bill was important to promote trade given the development of the country and changing international trade practices. The Bill was important to enhance the country's economy by providing legal basis to companies in the country. Thus, the Bill was extensively deliberated by the National Assembly during the 5th Session of the Second Parliament and was referred to the National Council.

The National Council had held extensive deliberation on the Bill during its 16th Session and referred it back to the National Assembly with 41 amendments for re-deliberation. Accordingly, the Bill was being tabled for the House's approval as per the legislative rules of procedure for re-deliberation.

Deliberating on all the 41 amendments proposed by the National Council, a total of 29 amendments proposed were endorsed while the following 12 amendments were not endorsed.

1. The amendment made by the National Council in the preamble of the Bill was not endorsed by the House as there was no need for detailed mention of the dates for the previous Companies Act. In addition, the words in the preamble should be further organized and re-structured. Thus, consensus was reached that the section should be deliberated in the Joint Sitting of Parliament.
2. The new section included after the Section 51 which was aimed to manage corporate investments in shares and debentures had to be made uniform with the provisions of the Financial Service

Act of 2011. Moreover, the phrase ‘primarily responsible’ in the new section before Section 127 needed to be revised. Thus, the consensus was reached that two sections should be deliberated in the joint sitting of Parliament.

3. After the Section 132, the new section which states that an independent director has to get endorsement of the simple majority of the annual general meeting was found to be unfitting. Further, the amendment of the new section after the Section 161 which provides all companies to maintain corporate social responsibility fund which should be managed by a committee within a company was difficult to be interpreted while implementing. Therefore, consensus was reached that the sections need to be deliberated in the Joint Sitting of Parliament.
4. The new section included after the Section 170 and Section 385 as amended by the National Council, which enables an unsatisfied shareholder to move to the High court against the decision of the regulatory authority, was found in-convenient while implementing. Moreover, the amendment made was not in line with the provisions of the Constitution and thus needed to be deliberated in the Joint Sitting for adoption.
5. Similarly, the new section after the Section 263 which provides that the regulatory authority by adoption of regulation exempt the provisions of Sections 236, 237, 262 and 263 will be unviable while implementing. Besides, there was no need to mention about the members of the board in detail in the Section 383. In this context, these sections were resolved to be deliberated in the Joint Sitting of Parliament for adoption.
6. The new section after the Section 385 which states that the

authority should prepare and submit to the Government and the Parliament an annual report was not found necessary by the National Assembly. Therefore, the section could not be endorsed. Furthermore, the new section before the Section 404 pertaining to financial and human resource power was not endorsed, as financial powers are vested in the Finance Ministry, while Royal Civil Service Commission has the power to oversee human resources. Thus, it was not feasible for the authority to be given separate power. In addition, it will lead to more complications while implementing. Therefore, it was resolved that sections were needed to be deliberated in the Parliament.

7. The National Council's recommendations regarding the powers and functions of the regulatory authority as reflected in the new section before the Section 404 was apposite. However, the subsection B of the Section 404 was in contradiction with the provisions of the Financial Services Act. Hence, it was resolved to be deliberated in the Joint Sitting of Parliament for improvement. The House resolved to endorse 29 recommendations out of a total of 41 recommendations made by the National Council while remaining 12 recommendations were to be deliberated in the Parliament. Consequently, as per the procedure, it was resolved that voting to that effect would be held on the 8th of December 2015. (*26th Day of the 10th Month of Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 7th of December 2015*).

Continuing the deliberation of the 7th of December 2015, the Member in Charge of the Bill, the Minister for Economic Affairs submitted that the National Assembly had deliberated on the Companies Bill 2015 and had referred to the National Council which had been re-transmitted with 41 amendments to the National Assembly. The National Assembly extensively re-deliberated on the Bill with the

amendments proposed on the 7th of December 2015 during which most of the amendments proposed were endorsed. The Minister solicited the support of the House to deliberate on the remaining proposed amendments in the Joint Sitting of Parliament. Subsequently, as per the motion moved for endorsement, all 42 Members present unanimously expressed their support through voting. The detail of the voting result is presented in the **Annexure 14. (27th Day of the 10th Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 8th of December 2015).**

26. Question Hour: Group C- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, and Labour & Human Resources

The Speaker informed that for the day's question hour, there were only three questions for oral reply and some questions were for written answers. The Speaker commenced the session by informing that after every question and answer, opportunity will be provided to ask two supplementary questions.

1. The Member from Boomdeling-Jamkhar constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement on the status of Kholongchu Hydropower project, and when the project would begin its construction. He also mentioned that since the Doksum town is going to be shifted to Khetshang, it would be of immense benefit to the people in the vicinity and for the project.
2. The Member from Khenkhar-Werringla constituency questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources to provide the name list of the top five agencies which have employed majority of the youths; the status of the youths employed till date and the update status of unemployed youths, since the Minister has

informed the House that over 16, 000 youths were employed during the last two years.

3. The Member from Drametse-Ngatshang constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement whether the 19 Dzongkhag Thromdes elections were going to be conducted simultaneously as the Constitution's provision require to institute 20 Dzongkhag Thromdes and 20 Yenleg Thromdes. He further asked the Minister about how much budget has been allocated for the development of the urban areas.

The Member from Panbang constituency asked a supplementary question to the Minister for Works and Human Settlement on the Ministry's plans and policies to utilize the local products/materials in the hydro power projects in future. He mentioned that a huge amount of money was invested in the hydro power projects and about 80 percent of the investments were going back to India. He also mentioned huge outflow of money could be curtailed if products manufactured from local factories and farms were used. The Member from North Thimphu constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement on how the Ministry was discussing with the project to resolve the problem of projects building their own housing colonies leading to poor occupancy in the private buildings.

The Member from Kabji-Talo constituency questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources on the support and aids to the unemployed youths who are interested in the agriculture farming.

The Member from Nyisho-Sepchu constituency questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources on status of establishment of Trade Extension Division. He further asked about the support and aids from the Government for the programme.

The Member from Panbang constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement on the policies and plans for establishment of a healthy and happy urban settlement, since there was no clear urban planning policy to guide.

The Member from Khamdar-Ramjar constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement on the legitimacy of the two storied construction regulations imposed on the construction in the Khetshang Town. He further asked about the plans to resolve the water shortage problem in the new town.

The Member from Khar-Yurung constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement to provide clarification on whether the 19 Dzongkhag Thromdes in the 20 Dzongkhags are going to be instituted at the same time. ***927th day of the 10th month the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 8th December 2015).***

Note: the deliberation and answers on the above questions can be referred in the verbatim of the Questions Hour which has been printed separately.

27. Rectification of Draft Resolution

The resolution was read out successively on three occasions by the Secretary General of the National Assembly of Bhutan on the 18th of November and on the 7th and the 8th of December in the House. However, there were no major rectifications to be made in the general provisions except on the Framework Agreement between Bhutan and European Investment Bank 2014. The resolution submitted by the National Council on the Framework Agreement between Bhutan and European Investment Bank along with the National Council's reservation to re-deliberate with six more additional issues were endorsed upon the approval of the Speaker. The rectified draft resolution was endorsed by the House as the resolution of the Sixth

Session of the Second Parliament. (*27th Day of the 11 Month of the Wood Female Sheep Year corresponding to the 8th December 2015*).

28. Concluding Ceremony

28.1 Motion of Thanks

On behalf of the Ruling Party, the Prime Minister moved the motion of thanks. He expressed that peace and prosperity in the country prevailed because the country is a *Bay Yul* (blessed land) of Ugyen Guru Rinpoche. He submitted that Zhabdrung Ngawang Namgyel established dual system in the country which would be four hundred years old in 2016 and expressed gratitude to the hereditary kings for bringing peace and harmony to the country and people. Moreover, he expressed that opportunities and prayers to pay tribute to Drukgyal Zhipa had been possible due to the opportunity granted to commemorate the 60th Birth Anniversary of the Fourth King, the guardian of the nation and the people.

Submission was made that on November 11, 2015, His Majesty had announced on the expected birth of the heir to the golden throne. He expressed that entire people of the country were immensely happy and joyful upon hearing the news.

He expressed that the Closing Day of the Sixth Session was historic as it was the day where His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo granted kasho to Chhoetse Penlop as the Fifth Druk Gyalpo in 2006. His Majesty had been nine years on the reign and in those nine years, His Majesty had brought enormous socio-economic development for the benefit of the people and the country. Moreover, His Majesty had served selflessly for the welfare of the people and therefore, the world has always truly regarded His Majesty as the “People’s King.” The Prime Minister briefly highlighted upon achievements and noble initiatives of His Majesty in eleven points as follows:

Despite the will of the people, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo initiated the establishment of constitutional democratic monarchy and the Constitution was adopted after one hundred years of monarchy. Words of gratitude were expressed to His Majesty for introducing decentralization policy because of which the Local Government has been instituted.

He also expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for constantly reminding that the democratic system was not for the interest of the individuals participating in politics but for making vibrant nation and for the welfare of the people.

His Majesty had established Judiciary which is immensely vital in the democratic system and constantly granted guidance on nullifying corruption. Moreover, His Majesty had made Constitutional Bodies more effective considering the importance of check and balance system and laid a strong foundation for the media as well. He expressed gratitude to His Majesty for those initiatives taken for the benefits of the people and the country.

He expressed that Bhutan had always been an independent country because His Majesty had always safeguarded our country from both internal and external threats. Furthermore, His Majesty had deployed companies of troops comprising of 3000 soldiers along the southern borders and Three Armed Forces have been continuously safeguarding the sovereignty of the nation.

He informed that His Majesty had sent 40 soldiers from Three Armed Forces to participate in United Nations Peace keeping missions since September 2014 and another 13 soldiers were to be sent in the future as well. The members of the Bhutanese armed forces had been serving at par with international troops creating a sense of pride for the Bhutanese people.

Furthermore, His Majesty had strengthened relations with foreign countries. On February 8, 2007, His Majesty signed the revised Indo-Bhutan Friendship Treaty which had not only further strengthened the bond between the two nations but also strengthened Bhutan as a nation.

It was reported that Bhutan has reached its 11th Five Year Plan today after starting its first five year plan in 1961. The total development budget for the First to Ninth Five Year Plan was Nu.119 Billion while the combined budget for the Tenth and Eleventh Five Year Plans was at Nu. 361 Billion which was three times higher compared to the previous budgets. Therefore, it was informed that opportunities for substantial socio-economic development, poverty eradication and vision for economic self-reliance would be fulfilled too.

It was further stated that total domestic economy of the country which was Nu. 40 Billion and 600 Million in 2006 had been increased to Nu.119 Billion and Nu.500 million at the present. External reserve which was only USD 608 Million in 2006 had increased and reserved to USD 1 Billion and 78 Million today. Hence, it was reported that the economic development had taken place and people were cognizant of how the basic amenities have benefitted them.

He informed that His Majesty had well preserved the national resources and established Natural Resources Development Corporation Limited (NRDCL) and Druk Holding and Investments (DHI) in 2007. Additionally, revenue from hydro power had been increasing annually and His Majesty had established hydro power consultations and manufacturing activities to further strengthen the sector.

It was informed that in nine years reign of His Majesty, seven Dzongs have been restored. Apart from those, Chhukha Dzong had been

newly constructed, Pema Gatshel Dzong was under construction and construction plan of new Sarpang Dzong was finalized. Wangdue Phodrang Dzong which was destroyed by fire was in the process of being rebuilt and consecration of the courtyard of the Dzong would be held during Zhabdrung Kuchoe in 2016 as commanded by His Majesty.

Besides, close to 300 Lhakhangs had been renovated and *Sertogs*, *Zungs* and *Ku Ten Sung Ten* for Lhakhangs had been granted personally by His Majesty. In total, about 1,607 Lhakhangs in the country had been renovated. Ration for monks have been increased and their concerns were addressed as well while Hindu temples had been renovated and constructed greatly benefitting the community.

He expressed that His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo had gifted our pristine environment to the people of Bhutan and also to the world. In nine years of reign, His Majesty had well preserved the environment and also started programme called “BHUTAN FOR LIFE” solely for protecting the pristine environment.

It was reported that the country was affected by cyclone in 2009 and calamities like fire and earthquake had affected places like Wamrong. In addition, Chamkhar town was affected by fire disaster in 2010 and 2011. During the disasters like storms and earthquake in 2011, His Majesty personally visited the affected places, met with the people and granted *kidu* to the victims which amounted to a total of Nu.103 Million. Apart from the *Desuung* programme which had been started to reinforce relieve efforts for future disasters, Bhutan Red Cross Society had also been started under the patronage of Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen Jetsun Pema Wangchuck.

Furthermore, he expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for rendering help and support to other nations during the times of natural calamities.

It was reported that during the time of tsunami in Japan, 2011, Their Majesties had visited the affected places and therefore, the people of Japan were extremely thankful to Their Majesties. Words of gratitude were expressed to His Majesty for providing relief fund to Nepal in April, 2015, when it was hit by an earthquake. His Majesty had also commanded to dispatch a relief team comprising of 78 people for 22 days treating more than 2000 victims.

His Majesty had granted 131,766 acres of land *kidu* to 128, 423 people in 14 Dzongkhags improving their livelihood. Further, about 200 acres of land were granted to 1,405 people residing in Thromdes. Five kinds of resettlement programme in Pema Gatshel, Haa, Samdrup Jongkhar and Lhuentse Dzongkhags were instituted whereby 655 people from 245 households who were living under poverty were benefitted.

Moreover, 8,703 people were granted citizenship. Apart from 806 old aged and disabled people who were still receiving monthly *soerey* from His Majesty, programmes for providing housing provisions were instituted solely for 1,799 needy people who have submitted before His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

It was reported that 2,880 students were identified as *Gyalpoi Tozoe* and 170 students were continuing their education in higher educational institutes. 435 students had already graduated and had the opportunity to serve *Tsa Wa Sum* through the selfless support of His Majesty.

It was informed that Her Majesty had started various programmes in the Gewogs immensely benefiting the people in the rural areas.

Considering the importance of having an effective system in the country, His Majesty had granted audience to 20,822 civil servants

were awarded Civil Service Awards for their service to the nation. The Royal Institute for Governance and Strategic Studies (RIGSS) was started in October, 2013 and it was reported that 228 leaders were provided trainings under ten various programmes and those leaders were efficiently carrying out their duties. Similarly, the Prime Minister submitted that *Desuung* Programme was started since February 2011 and with the 17th batch of *Desuung* programme, 2,015 members have been trained who continues to serve the people on various occasions.

His Majesty had visited 119 schools and started system of awarding certificates to the excelling students in the schools and 7,336 students were awarded the certificates which had further encouraged the students. Likewise, His Majesty had started Scout Programme and His Majesty continues to be the patron for the scouts.

He expressed that His Majesty's achievements and contributions were immeasurable and the Bhutanese people were fully cognizant of such noble initiatives. Therefore, on behalf of the people and the Ruling Party, he expressed immense gratitude to His Majesty. Furthermore, it was the 10th year of His Majesty's reign since the granting of *Kasho* by Fourth Druk Gyalpo on December 9, 2006.

He expressed that the *Kasho* of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo focused on oneness and happiness of the people, independence, stability and harmony in the country. Additionally, it stated that it was important for everyone to uphold the oath of unwavering faithfulness and loyalty with body, mind and speech to maintain peace and justice for generations. Therefore, it was very important for everyone to maintain loyalty and pay solemn oath in fulfilling the vision of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

Motion of thanks by the National Council Member of Chhukha Dzongkhag

National Council Member of Chhukha Dzongkhag moved the motion of thanks. He expressed that His Majesty had constantly reminded the people to be mindful of the responsibility to maintain unity, peace and stability of the country in whatever works they endeavor. He expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for granting noble guidance and constantly reminding on handing over the country to future generation by fulfilling the visions of Gross National Happiness and strengthening the system of democracy.

Furthermore, words of gratitude were expressed to His Majesty for visiting the rural areas and granting land and census kidu to the people regardless of their ethnicity and religion. He also expressed gratitude to His Majesty for granting immediate kidu to the affected people during the times of natural calamities.

His Majesty had commanded that economy of the country should be enhanced in order to strengthen the nation. Therefore, he submitted that the people were fully aware of the need to work with full dedication to this effect. He expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for establishing important institutes and providing effective trainings to fulfill the objectives of Gross National Happiness, economic development and system of democracy. In conclusion, he offered his prayers for good health and long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family.

Motion of thanks by the Member from North Thimphu Constituency

On behalf of the Opposition Party, Member from North Thimphu Constituency moved the motion of thanks. He expressed prayers for the wellbeing of both Her Majesty the Gyaltshen and the future

Prince to be born with auspicious signs of *Tashi Tagye*. Furthermore, it was expressed that enthronement of His Majesty Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck on 14th December, 2006 in Trashis Chhoe Dzong had been one of the historic and extraordinary achievements of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo Jigme Singye Wangchuck.

He expressed that His Majesty had always reminded the nation that *Failure is not an option* in undertaking all endeavors and responsibilities. That people has to be mindful of such noble words and take oath to serve with utmost dedication for the benefit of the people and the country. He expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for granting audience to thousands of civil servants and awarding them with the Civil Service Awards.

It was highlighted that His Majesty had granted Kasho that the rule of law was very essential in the country. Accordingly, he expressed that the Members had always revered the Golden Throne as the personal embodiment of His Majesty and actively participating in the legislative deliberations.

On behalf of the Opposition Party, he also expressed his gratitude to the Dratshangs and Rabdeys, civil servants and the Judiciary, Constitutional Bodies, Leaders of the Local Government and the three Armed Forces for their dedicated service to the nation. In conclusion, he offered his prayers for eternal long lives of the hereditary monarchs of the Wangchuck Dynasty.

28.2 Concluding Speech by the Speaker

On behalf of Parliament, the Speaker welcomed and expressed his deepest gratitude to His Majesty for gracing the Closing Ceremony of the Sixth Session of the Second Parliament of Bhutan. He expressed gratitude to His Majesty for gracing the occasion despite numerous Royal engagements for the benefit of the people and the country.

He further expressed his gratitude to His Majesty for appointing Mr. Karma Tshering, Mr. Tashi Rapten and Ms. Kesang Chuki Dorjee as Eminent Members of the National Council of Bhutan. Furthermore, he congratulated the new Eminent Members and expressed hopes that the Members would serve with full dedication and loyalty.

It was expressed that the expected birth of the royal heir means continued peace and happiness in the country and perpetuity of Wangchuck dynasty. It was informed that the people were blessed with an opportunity to pay tribute to His Majesty the Fourth Druk and besides paying tribute, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo referred to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo as the noble father of the nation. The people of Bhutan have been immensely proud of it and therefore on behalf of the Parliament, he expressed his gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

The Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pema Gatshel and Paro Dzongkhag's Yenlag Thromde had been endorsed. It was directed that the Government should carry out *Thromde* establishment works in accordance to the legal procedure at the earliest possible. It was expressed that the Ministries and Agencies should fully support the recommendations and resolutions passed by the House on various issues.

The Speaker informed that the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) had been adopted to fight corruption by both the Houses and has been submitted for the Royal assent. In addition, Jabmi (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan, Companies Bill of Bhutan, and European Investment Bank Framework Agreement had also been submitted for the royal assent to be deliberated in the summer session. Furthermore, the Speaker announced that the Royal assent has been granted to enforce the Framework Agreement for Energy Cooperation.

The Speaker reminded that it was imperative for the Members of Parliament to create awareness to the general public regarding the resolutions passed by the House, amendment and changes affected in the Acts and new Acts amended in the House during their constituency visits.

In conclusion, he expressed that the Sixth Session of the Second Parliament concluded successfully and further expressed that the Parliament would like to offer prayers for the good health and long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen and the Members of the Royal Family. Similarly, prayers were also offered for the continued wellbeing of all the religious masters led by His Holiness the Je Khenpo and for the peace and prosperity of the country. The detail speech is provided in the **Annexure 16. (28th Day of the 10th Month of Wood female Sheep Year corresponding to the 9th December, 2015).**

Annexure 1: List of Documents distributed to the Members

1. Motor Vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger, Personal and Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal
2. Custom Bill 2015
3. Background and summary on the Customs Bill of Bhutan, 2015
4. Civil Aviation Bill 2015
5. Social and Cultural Committee Report (English and Dzongkha).
6. Human Rights Committee Report
7. Women, Children and Youth Committee Report
8. Finance Committee Report
9. Legislative Committee report on motion to amend CCPC and Penal Code.
10. PAC report
11. Documents related to European Investment Bank (Convention) from National Council
12. Documents related to United Nations Convention Against Corruption from National Council
13. Reasons for withdrawal of Enterprise Registration Bill from National Council
14. Documents on Jabmi Amendment Bill for re-deliberation
15. Documents on Companies Bill for re-deliberation.
16. Documents on Rules of Procedure of National Assembly.
17. Maps for Thromde and Yenlag Thromde for Pema Gatshel and Paro Dzongkhags.

Annexure 2: List of Members Present During the 6th Session of the Second Parliament

1. Hon Speaker Jigme Zangpo, Mongar constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
2. Hon Prime Minister, Tshering Tobgay, Sombaykha constituency, Haa Dzongkhag
3. Hon Minister for Foreign Affairs Lyonpo Damcho Dorji, Goenkhatoe-Laya constituency, Laya Dzongkhag
4. Hon Minister for Works and Human Settlement, Lyonpo Dorji Choden, Thrimshing constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
5. Hon Minister for Education, Lyonpo Mingbo Dukpa, Dewathang-Gomdar constituency, Samdrupjongkhar Dzongkhag
6. Hon Minister for Labour and Human Resources, Lyonpo Ngeema Sangay Tshempo, Lhamoizingkha-Tashiding constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
7. Hon Minister for Health, Lyonpo Tandin Wangchuk, Athang-Thedtsho constituency, Wangdiphodrang Dzongkhag
8. Hon Minister for Communication, Lyonpo Dina Nath Dungyel, Phuentshogpelri-Samtse constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
9. Hon Minister for Finance, Lyonpo Namgay Dorji, Draagteng-Langthil constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
10. Hon Minister for Economic Affairs, Lyonpo Norbu Wangchuk, Kanglung -Udzorong constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
11. Hon Minister for Agriculture and Forest, Lyonpo Yeshey Dorji, Maenbi- Tsaenkhari constituency, Lhuntse Dzongkhag
12. Hon Minister for Home & Cultural Affairs, Lyonpo Dawa Gyaltsen, Bongo-Chapcha constituency, Chukha Dzongkhag
13. Hon Leader of the Opposition Dr. Pema Gyamtsho, Chhoekhor-Tang constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
14. Hon Deputy Speaker Chimmi Dorji, Lingmu-Toedwang Constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag

15. Hon Member Tshewang Jurmi, Chhumig-Ura constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
16. Hon Member Rinzin Dorji, Phuentshogling constituency, Chhukha Dzongkhag
17. Hon Member Karma Dorji, Drukjeygang-Tseza constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
18. Hon Member Pema Drukpa, Khamaed-Lunana constituency, Gasa Dzongkhag
19. Hon Kinley Om, Bji-Kar-Tshog-Uesu constituency, Haa Dzongkhag
20. Hon Member Karma Rangdol, Gangzur-Minje constituency, Lhuentse Dzongkhag
21. Hon Member Ugyen Wangdi, Dramedtse-Ngatshang constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
22. Hon Member Rinzin Jamtsho, Kengkhar-Weringla constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
23. Hon Member Kezang Wangmo, Dokar-Sharpa constituency, Paro Dzongkhag
24. Hon Member Khandu Wangchuk, Lamgong-Wangchang constituency, Paro Dzongkhag
25. Hon Member Zangley Dukpa, Khar-Yurung constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
26. Hon Member Choida Jamtsho, Nganglam constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
27. Hon Member Dechen Zangmo, Nanong- Shumar constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
28. Hon Member Dophu Dukpa, Kabisa–Talog constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag
29. Hon Member Pelzang Wangchuk, Jomotshangkha-Martshala constituency, Samdrupjongkhar Dzongkhag
30. Hon Member Tek Bahadur Subba, Dophuchen-Tading constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
31. Hon Member Ritu Raj Chhetri, Tashichhoeling constituency,

- Samtse Dzongkhag
32. Hon Member Madan Kumar Chhetri, Ugyentse-Yoeseltse constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
 33. Hon Member Rinzin Dorji, Shompangkha constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
 34. Hon Member Gopal Gurung, Gelegphu constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
 35. Hon Member Kinga Tshering, North Thimphu constituency, Thimphu Dzongkhag
 36. Hon Member Yeshey Zimba, South Thimphu constituency, Thimphu Dzongkhag
 37. Hon Member Wangdi Norbu, Bartsham-Shongphu constituency, Trashingang Dzongkhag
 38. Hon Member Jigme Wangchuk, Radhi- Sagteng, Trashigang Dzongkhag
 39. Hon Member Karma Tenzin, Wamrong constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
 40. Hon Member Dupthob, Boomdeling-Jamkhar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
 41. Hon Member Sonam Dondup Dorjee, Khamdang-Ramjar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
 42. Hon Member Nidup Zangpo, Nubi-Tangsibji constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
 43. Hon Member Yogesh Tamang, Kilkhorthang-Mendrelgang constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag
 44. Hon Member Novin Darlami, Sergithang-Tsirang Toed constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag
 45. Hon Member Kuenga, Nyishog- Saephu constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
 46. Hon Member Lekey Dorji, Bardo-Trong constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag
 47. Hon Member Dorji Wangdi, Panbang constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag

Annexure 3: Speech of the Hon Speaker at the Opening Ceremony of the 6th Session of the Second Parliament

1. The Sixth Session of the 2nd Parliament of Bhutan commences on this auspicious day. On behalf of the Members of Parliament and on my own behalf, I would like to welcome His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to the opening ceremony. I would also like to express our gratitude to His Majesty for gracing the occasion.
2. May I also extend my welcome to the representatives of the Central Monastic Body, foreign dignitaries, senior government officials, Members of Parliament and all other people who have come to witness the occasion.
3. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and Her Majesty the Gyaltshen have extensively traveled throughout the country to strengthen the security and wellbeing of our people. Their Majesties did not only meet with individual people but also granted land *kidu*. Therefore, on behalf of the Members of Parliament, I would like to express our deepest gratitude to Their Majesties.
4. Similarly, His Royal Highness Dasho Jigme Dorji Wangchuck has also extensively traveled to the rural areas after assuming the responsibilities of His Majesty's representative to the eastern Dzongkhags. His Royal Highness has addressed the resettlement and other issues of the people through Royal *kidu*. On behalf of the people of Bhutan and particularly on behalf of the people of eastern Bhutan and Members of Parliament, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to His Royal Highness.
5. In this session, the following Bills will be re-deliberated:
 - i. Jabmi (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan

- ii. Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan
- iii. Companies Bill of Bhutan

These Bills were endorsed by the National Assembly in the last session and has been transmitted to the National Council. It is hoped that the National Council will endorse these Bills after extensive deliberations.

- 6. Similarly, the following government Bills will be deliberated for the first and the second readings in this session as per the legislative procedure:
 - i. Customs Bill
 - ii. Civil Aviation Bill

These Bills will be then referred to relevant committees for review.

- 7. A total of 23 petitions were received from 11 Dzongkhags. These petitions were deliberated by the Members during the preliminary meeting considering its importance. It was found out that the issues raised could be directly addressed by the relevant ministries, institutions and other agencies. Accordingly, we have referred the petitions to relevant agencies and it is hoped that these issues would be addressed soon.
- 8. In other business, the Annual Audit Report, pending Audit report, two international conventions, committee reports and few motions will be deliberated. In addition, deliberations will also be held on Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag.
- 9. I would like to inform the gathering that I have recently led three parliamentary delegations abroad. The delegations visited

the Parliament of India and participated in the 4th Conference of World Speakers of Parliament in New York. As per the resolution of the National Assembly of Bhutan, the House joined the Asian Forum of Parliamentarians on Population & Development (AFPPD) during our participation in the 11th general assembly of AFPPD in Bangkok, Thailand.

10. The Prime Minister Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay attended the UN Summit to adopt the post-2015 development agenda and the 70th General Assembly of the United Nations in New York in September 2015. I would like to thank the Prime Minister for the fruitful meetings he had on sustainable development in New York.

The Prime Minister has also toured some of the Dzongkhags to review the outcomes of the development activities as per the 11th plan. This has not only enabled to garner the views and aspirations of the people but has also greatly reinforced the efforts of the local leaders to implement planned activities. For this, I would like to express my thanks to the Prime Minister.

11. Recently, the Chief Minister of the Indian state of West Bengal, Shrimati Mamata Banerjee was in Bhutan on a goodwill visit. During the visit, she not only mentioned that Bhutan was a supportive country to India but also assured development assistance and support for enhancing Indo-Bhutan trade. Such assurances will greatly benefit our country and therefore on behalf of the Parliament of Bhutan, I would like to thank the Chief Minister and the government and people of India.
12. In celebrating the 60th Birth Anniversary of our beloved His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, the government has initiated various programmes upon the command of His Majesty the

Druk Gyalpo. With the generous donations from devotees and the support of the Central Monastic Body, the chairperson of the *Druk Menjong Chothuen Tshogpa*, Lam Tshering Wangdi has coordinated the construction of Buddha *Dordenma*, one of the biggest statues in the world. Similarly, under the coordination of Khenpo Karpo, a giant statue of *Guru Nagsid Zilnon* at Takila in Lhuentse has also been constructed.

Furthermore, numerous stupas in the country were renovated by religious bodies, Gewog and Dzongkhag administrations and through community initiatives. Such deeds will enhance the flourishing of Buddha Dharma and bring peace to the world. The Bhutanese people are fortunate since it will provide a source for worship and devotion. On behalf of the Parliament, I would like to thank the Government, the Central Monastic Body, all other sponsors and coordinators for undertaking such initiatives.

13. Since the enthronement of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo Jigme Singye Wangchuck, His Majesty has offered his selfless dedication to the nation and the people emphasizing on balanced socio-economic development and mental wellbeing. To this effect, the policy of Gross National Happiness was introduced which was found as an incredible and beneficial policy not only for the people of Bhutan but for the outside world as well. The sixth international GNH conference organized by the Center for Bhutan Studies commenced yesterday at Ugyen Pelri Palace in Paro. I believe that this conference is an excellent opportunity to pay tribute to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo.

His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo has always emphasized that Gross National Happiness is more important than Gross Domestic Product. And, it is in this context that the conference

will firstly help better understand and consolidate the philosophy of Gross National Happiness. Secondly, it will provide a way forward for policy formulation. Last but not the least, it will also provide new mechanisms for efficient operation of the policies.

Around 500 Scientists, economists, historians, researchers and philosophers from 48 countries are attending the conference including Bhutanese experts taking the total participants to 1000. It is hoped that such conference will help enhance the policies of GNH not only in Bhutan but across the globe for the welfare of the society.

Seven organizations including JICA and two individuals have provided their constant support for organizing this important conference. Acknowledging their contributions, the Prime Minister of Bhutan Lyonchhen Tshering Tobgay awarded them certificates of appreciation yesterday. On behalf of the Parliament, I would like to congratulate them.

I would also like to express my appreciation to Dasho Karma Ura, President of the Center for Bhutan Studies (CBS), Programme Coordinator and all the staff of CBS for organizing the conference.

14. I would like to offer my prayers and express hope for the success of various programmes initiated by the Royal Government, Central Monastic Body and the people in order to pay tribute to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo on his 60th Birth Anniversary. As we pay our tribute on the 60th Birth Anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, His Holiness the Je Khenpo and Her Majesty the Queen Mother Dorji Wangmo Wangchuck, I would also like to offer my prayers for the long

life of all the people attaining the age of 60.

15. In conclusion, it is hoped that the Sixth Session would be successful with the blessings of Triple Gem, noble guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, collective merit of the Bhutanese people and the support of the Members of Parliament.

THANK YOU!

Annexure 4: Voting results on Motor Vehicles Agreement for the Regulation of Passenger, Personal and Cargo Vehicular Traffic between Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal.

Date: 20/11/15

Time: 2:41:55 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 22 Abstain: 3 No: 14 Total present: 39

Seats: 107

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	No
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	No
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	No
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	No
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	No
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	No
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	No
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	No
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	No
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Abstain
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	No

Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	No
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	No
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Abstain
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	No
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	No
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorje	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Abstain
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 5: Voting results on Bjitsiphu as Paro Yenlag Thromde

Date: 25/11/2015

Time: 11:26:52 AM

Voting: Not passed: Yes: 28 Abstain: 5 No: 31 Total present: 64

Seats: 107

Sonam Kinga	Delegate	No
Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	No
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	No
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Nima	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dunglel	Delegate	No
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (Punakha)	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	No
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	No
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	No
Jigme Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Rinzin	Delegate	Yes
Pema Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	No
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	No
Dhan Bdr Monger	Delegate	Abstain
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	No
Kuenga	Delegate	No
Tashi Dorji	Delegate	No

Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	No
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	No
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	No
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	No
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	No
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	No
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	No
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	No
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	No
Tempa Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Gasa)	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	No
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	No
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	No
Dorji Choden	Delegate	No
Tharchen	Delegate	Abstain
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Abstain
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Phuntsho	Delegate	No
Tshering Dorji (Haa)	Delegate	No
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Pema Dakpa	Delegate	Abstain
Tashi Wangyal	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	No
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	No
Sonam Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kaka Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Nima Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dorji	Delegate	Abstain

Kamal Bdr Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	No
Navin Darlami	Delegate	No

Annexure 6: Voting results on Betaykha as Paro Yenlag Thromde

Date: 26/11/15

Time: 3:07:19 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 66 Abstain: 1 No: 0 Total present: 67

Seats: 107

Sonam Kinga	Delegate	Yes
Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (Punakha)	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Rinzin	Delegate	Yes
Pema Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Dhan Bdr Monger	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes

Tashi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Tempa Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Gasa)	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Abstain
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Tharchen	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Phuntsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Dorji (Haa)	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Pema Dakpa	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangyal	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorje	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes

Kaka Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Nima Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kamal Bdr Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 7: Voting results on Denchi as Pema Gatshel
Dzongkhag Thromde**

Date: 26/11/15

Time: 3:08:54 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 64 Abstain: 1 No: 2 Total present: 67

Seats: 107

Sonam Kinga	Delegate	Yes
Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (Punakha)	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Rinzin	Delegate	Yes
Pema Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Dhan Bdr Monger	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes

Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Tempa Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Gasa)	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Abstain
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Tharchen	Delegate	No
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Phuntsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Dorji (Haa)	Delegate	No
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Pema Dakpa	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangyal	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorje	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes

Sonam Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kaka Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Nima Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kamal Bdr Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 8: Voting results on Nganglam as Pema Gatshel
Yenlag Thromde**

Date: 26/11/15

Time: 3:10:19 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 67 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 67

Seats: 107

Sonam Kinga	Delegate	Yes
Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (Punakha)	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Rinzin	Delegate	Yes
Pema Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Dhan Bdr Monger	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes

Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Tempa Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Gasa)	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Tharchen	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Phuntsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Dorji (Haa)	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Pema Dakpa	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangyal	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorje	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes

Sonam Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kaka Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Nima Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kamal Bdr Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 9: Voting results on Redeliberation of Paro Dzongkhag
Thromde in summer session**

Date: 26/11/15

Time: 3:12:12 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 54 Abstain: 5 No: 8 Total present: 67

Seats: 107

Sonam Kinga	Delegate	Abstain
Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	No
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	No
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (Punakha)	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Rinzin	Delegate	Yes
Pema Tenzin	Delegate	Abstain
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Abstain
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	No
Dhan Bdr Monger	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes

Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	No
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Abstain
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	No
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Abstain
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	No
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Tempa Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Gasa)	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Tharchen	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Phuntsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Dorji (Haa)	Delegate	No
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Pema Dakpa	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangyal	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorje	Delegate	Yes
Tashi Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes

Sonam Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kaka Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Nima Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kamal Bdr Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Sangay Khandu (Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	No
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 10: Voting results of Adoption on Jabmi (Amendment)

Bill of Bhutan 2014

Date: 04/12/2015

Time: 12:22:58 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 43 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 43

Seats: 107

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes

Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 11: Voting results of Adoption on withdrawal of Enterprise Registration Bill of Bhutan 2015.

Date: 04/12/2015

Time: 12:26:38 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 42 Abstain: 1 No: 1 Total present: 44

Seats: 107

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dunglel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Abstain
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes

Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	No
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 12: Voting results on ratification of the United Nations Convention against Corruption.

Date: 04/12/2015

Time: 12:35:20 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 43 Abstain: 1 No: 0 Total present: 44

Seats: 107

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dunglel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Abstain
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Ritu Raj Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes

Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorji (P/ling)	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 13: Voting results on the Framework Agreement between the Kingdom of Bhutan and European Investment Bank governing activities 2014.

Date: 07/12/15

Time: 10:21:25 AM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 36 Abstain: 1 No: 0 Total present: 37

Seats: 107

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Tshering Tobgay	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Dukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes

Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Abstain
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorje	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 14: Voting results on Adoption of the Companies Bill of Bhutan 2015

Date: 08/12/15

Time: 12:16:57 PM

Voting: Passed: Yes: 42 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 42

Seats: 107

Dechen Zangmo	Delegate	Yes
Madan Kumar Chhetri	Delegate	Yes
Zanglay Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Khandu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dina Nath Dungyel	Delegate	Yes
Yeshey Zimba	Delegate	Yes
Wangdi Norbu	Delegate	Yes
Jigme Wangchuk (Radhi)	Delegate	Yes
Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Norbu Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Nyeema Sangay Tshempo	Delegate	Yes
Karma Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
Nidup Zangpo	Delegate	Yes
Dophu Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Pema Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Mengbo Drukpa	Delegate	Yes
Kuenga	Delegate	Yes
Sonam Dondup Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Chimi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Gopal Gurung	Delegate	Yes
Dawa Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
Tek Bdr Subba	Delegate	Yes
Tandin Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Kinga Tshering	Delegate	Yes
Karma Dorji	Delegate	Yes

Pelzang Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
Lekey Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Yogesh Tamang	Delegate	Yes
Kezang Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
Dorji Choden	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
Tshewang Jurmi	Delegate	Yes
Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
Karma Rangdol	Delegate	Yes
Damcho Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Rinzin Dorje	Delegate	Yes
Namgay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
Kinley Om	Delegate	Yes
Navin Darlami	Delegate	Yes

Annexure 15: Report of the Special Parliamentary Joint Committee on Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromde of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag and Yenlag Thromde of Paro Dzongkhag:

Date: 25th & 26th November, 2015

Venue : National Assembly Conference Hall.

Committee Members:

1. H.E. Hon'ble Minister of Foreign Affairs, Lyonpo Damcho Dorji, MP (Goenkhatoe-Laya Dhemkhong) Ruling Party;
2. Hon'ble Tashi Dorji, MP (Wangdue Phodrang Dzongkhag), National Council, Chair of the Committee;
3. Hon'ble Sangay Khandu, MP (Gasa Dzongkhag), National Council, Dy. Chair of the Committee;
4. Hon'ble Dorji Wangdi, MP (Panbang Dhemkhong), National Assembly, Opposition Party;
5. Hon'ble Ritu Raj Chhetri, MP (Tashichoeling Dhemkhong), National Assembly, Ruling Party;
6. Hon'ble Kuenga, MP (Nyisho-Saephu Dhemkhong), National Assembly, Ruling Party;
7. Hon'ble Lekey Dorji, MP (Bardo-Trong Dhemkhong), National Assembly, Ruling Party;
8. Hon'ble Kinga Tshering, MP (North Thimphu Dhemkhong), National Assembly, Opposition Party;
9. Hon'ble Ugyen Wangdi, MP (Dremedtse-Ngatshang Demkhong), National Assembly, Opposition Party;
10. Hon'ble Kaka Tshering, MP (Paro Dzongkhag), National Council;
11. Hon'ble Pema Dakpa, MP (Zhemgang Dzongkhag), National Council; and
12. Hon'ble Jigmi Rinzin, MP (Pemagatshel Dzongkhag), National Council.

As directed by Hon'ble Speaker and resolved by the House on 25th November 2015, the Committee convened a meeting. Hon'ble Members of National Council from Wangdue Phodrang and Gasa were unanimously elected as the Chairperson and Deputy Chair of the Committee respectively as per the ROP of the Joint Committees.

Some key issues came out very clearly from the discussion:

- Need to enhance balanced development within different Gewogs and Chiwogs of the Dzongkhag: Betekha as the Dzongkhag Yenlag Thromde in Paro and Denchi as the Dzongkhag Thromde in Pemagatshel were proposed primarily to provide impetus for development of these two locations in the respective Dzongkhags;
- Nearby townships could be merged with the existing Dzongkhag Thromde and/or Yenlag Thromdes. For instance, Bondey town in Paro Dzongkhag, which was initially proposed as the Dzongkhag Yenlag Thromde by the Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu, was clubbed with the Paro Dzongkhag Thromde by the Parliament in the 5th Session. Similarly, options could be explored to merge Bjitsephu with Paro Dzongkhag Thromde since these two towns are very closely located;
- Need to uphold, to the extent possible, the ideology and principle of decentralization by the Parliament;
- While Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu had resolved Bjitsiphu as the Dzongkhag's Yenlag Thromde, the Government, in the larger interest of the Dzongkhag and the people of Paro Dzongkhag, had instead proposed Betekha to be the Dzongkhag Yenlag Thromde; and
- Constitutional provision to approve more than one Yenlag

Thromde in a Dzongkhag: The Opposition party submits to propose Bjitsiphu along with Betekha as the second Yenlag Thromde for Paro Dzongkhag.

Based on the above issues shared by different members in the meeting, two fundamental principles were accepted as a common ground to pursue discussions relating to the declaration of Pemagatshel Dzongkhag Thromde and Yenlag Thromdes and that of Paro Yenlag Thromde. The two principles are:

- a. Regionally balanced socio-economic development in the Dzongkhag; and
- b. Need to uphold the ideology and principle of decentralization by the Parliament to the extent possible.

Accordingly, the Committee members mutually agreed to submit the following recommendations to the House for kind endorsement:

1. Betekha as Yenlag Thromde for Paro Dzongkhag
2. Denchi as Dzongkhag Thromde for Pemagatshel Dzongkhag;
3. Nganglam as Yenlag Thromde for Pemagatshel Dzongkhag; and
4. Resolve that Paro Dzongkhag Thromde issues to be re-tabled by the Government in consultation with the Paro Dzongkhag Tshogdu in the next Joint Sitting of the Parliament. Meanwhile Election Commission of Bhutan shall defer the upcoming local government election for Paro Dzongkhag as per instruction through the Speaker.

Annexure 16: Speech of the Hon Speaker at the Closing Ceremony of the 6th Session

1. The 6th Session of the Second Parliament of Bhutan concludes today with the grace of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.
2. I would like to extend my warm welcome to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the closing ceremony despite numerous Royal engagements for the country. On behalf of the Parliament of Bhutan and on my own behalf, I would like to express my deepest gratitude for His Majesty's precious presence on this occasion signifying Royal support to Parliament.
3. I would also like to extend my welcome to the Members of the Royal Family, representatives of the Central Monastic Body, senior government officials and the representatives of the international community to the occasion.
4. In accordance to the provisions of the Constitution, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has appointed three new Eminent Members; Hon Karma Tshering, Hon Phuntsho Rapten and Hon Kesang Chuki Dorjee to the National Council on an auspicious day.

On behalf of Parliament and on my own behalf, I would like to welcome the Eminent Members to the closing ceremony of the 6th Session. His Majesty has entrusted constitutional responsibilities to the Eminent Members with lot of confidence and thus it is hoped that three of them will serve the Legislature with utmost dedication.

5. May I take this opportunity to recall the memory of all on the following important event:

We celebrated the 60th Birth Anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo on 11th of November 2015. Firstly, the occasion provided the people with an opportunity to receive audience from His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo. Secondly, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo addressed the nation paying tribute to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, the Dharma King. Furthermore, in the spirit of perpetuity of the Wangchuck dynasty, the royal announcement on the expected birth of the royal heir means continued peace and happiness in the country. I would like to mention that our country will be further strengthened and witness era of unprecedented development for all.

6. Under the dynamic leadership of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, preparations for the celebration of the 60th Birth Anniversary of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo was comprehensively carried out. We would like to express our gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo as the Central Monastic Body, civil servants and all other people were blessed with an opportunity to pay tribute to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo.

Besides paying tribute, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo referred to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo as the noble father of the nation. The people of Bhutan have been immensely proud of it and therefore we would like to express our gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

7. During the 6th session, the Joint Sitting of Parliament declared the Dzongkhag Thromde and a Yenlag Thromde for Pema Gatshel Dzongkhag and a Yenlag Thromde for Paro Dzongkhag. Therefore, as per the provisions of the Constitution and the Local Government Act, all 20 Dzongkhags now have a Dzongkhag Thromde and a Yenlag Thromde each.

The declaration of Thromdes was possible mainly because of the competency demonstrated by the Local Government in preparing the documents and the officials of the Ministry of Works & Human Settlement in formulating the maps. I would like to therefore thank the Members of the Local Government and the officials of the Ministry of Works & Human Settlement.

8. As per the declaration of Parliament, It is now imperative for the government to immediately work towards establishing the Thromdes in accordance to the rule of law. This will greatly help strengthen the local government and enable balanced regional and socio-economic development.
9. The Public Accounts Committee after comprehensively reviewing the Annual Audit Report for the year 2014 presented its recommendations to Parliament. The Parliament had extensive deliberation on the recommendations and passed resolutions for its implementation. In this context, it is imperative for the various government ministries, departments and agencies to accordingly work as per the resolutions.
10. Similarly, the Social & Cultural Committee, Women, Children & Youth Committee, Human Rights Committee and the Finance Committee presented reports on the implementation status of the resolutions of the House. These reports have been deliberated by the House and to this effect it is important for the relevant ministries, departments and agencies to render cooperation.
11. I would like to inform that the UN Convention Against Corruption has been ratified by both the Houses and has been submitted to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for the Royal assent.

The National Assembly extensively re-deliberated on the Jabmi (Amendment) Bill, Companies Bill and the Framework Agreement with the European Investment Bank. However, since consensus could not be reached on some of the sections in these three agenda, submission has been made to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to deliberate in the joint sitting.

12. The SAARC Framework Agreement for Energy Cooperation which was deliberated in the 5th Session has been granted Royal assent by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.
13. One of the main responsibilities of the Members of Parliament is to reach consensus in the House, amend laws and pass new laws. In this regard, it is very significant to inform the people on the decisions of the legislature by Members of Parliament during their constituency visits.
14. I would like to inform that the Members of the National Assembly visited Punatsangchu Hydroelectric Projects I & II on 30th of November 2015. During the visit, we learned from the Managing Director and other officials that both the projects were progressing well despite challenges and risks at the project sites. The Punatsangchu Hydroelectric Project I has been estimated to cost Nu. 93.75 billion and Nu. 58.35 billion has been spent so far. The project is expected to be completed by July 2019. The Punatsangchu Hydroelectric Project II has been estimated to cost Nu.74.29 billion and Nu.31.69 billion has been spent till date. The Punatsangchu Hydroelectric Project II is expected to be completed by September 2018.
15. Similarly, the Members of the National Assembly visited the Wangduephodrang Dzong reconstruction site on 1st of December 2015. As per the project report, His Majesty the

Druk Gyalpo has commanded the Dzong to be built better than before and has granted Nu. 230 million for the reconstruction. The Government of India has allocated Nu. 1000 million and the Bhutan Broadcasting Service has raised Nu. 65.500 million while donations of Nu. 28.328 million was made by the people through the Ministry of Finance for the Dzong reconstruction. In total, an amount of Nu. 1,323.828 million has been materialized. Given these funds, the outcome of the work in general has been great. Moreover, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has commanded that the Kuenrey of the Dzong should be completed before the Zhabdrung Kuchoe in the 3rd Month of Bhutanese calendar next year. The works to this effect has been greatly progressing.

16. In addition, the Rabdey of Wangduephodrang has instituted a procurement committee to procure important materials for the reconstruction works instead of simply relying on the government. The committee has collected a fund of Nu. 59.600 million from voluntary donations made by the devotees and has procured essential items such as statues and other religious items. Such outcome of the reconstruction work has been possible mainly because of generous grants from His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the devotees. The Parliament therefore would like to express our infinite gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, the devotees and the Government of India.
17. The 6th Session concludes successfully mainly with the blessings of Triple Gem, noble guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, collective merit of the Bhutanese people and the support and cooperation rendered by the Members of Parliament. For this, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and Members of Parliament.

18. Lastly, we would like to offer prayers for the eternity of our country's sovereignty and the institution of Wangchuck dynasty. We would also like to offer prayers for the good health and long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, Her Majesty the Gyaltshen and the Members of the Royal Family. Similarly, we would like to offer prayers for the continued wellbeing of all the religious masters led by His Holiness the Je Khenpo.

THANK YOU!

